

## A Critical Review of Educational Resources



ACT is a members' organisation supporting Citizenship teaching in all schools in England and Wales.

A report presented to the Association for Citizenship Teaching by Ted Huddleston, Citizenship Foundation, October 2007



*Citizenship Foundation*

---

Association for Citizenship Teaching  
63 Gee Street  
London EC1V 3RS

---

t: 020 7566 4133  
f: 020 7566 4131  
e: [info@teachingcitizenship.org.uk](mailto:info@teachingcitizenship.org.uk)  
w: [www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk](http://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk)

# Contents page

Introduction .....page 2

What Is Available .....page 4

The Issues .....page 6

Conclusions and Recommendations .....page 28

Appendix 1..... page 32

Appendix 2.....page 36

# 1: INTRODUCTION

## 1.1. The Ajegbo review

In 2006 the Department for Education and Skills set up an independent review of the teaching of ethnic, religious and cultural diversity across the English school curriculum, chaired by Sir Keith Ajegbo.

Published in January 2007, the Ajegbo review<sup>1</sup> reported a general neglect of teaching about issues of identity and diversity in English schools. In particular, it found that, in spite of good practice in 'trailblazing' schools, teaching about issues of identity and diversity in Citizenship is often unsatisfactory in terms of:

- coverage;
- conceptual depth;
- contextualisation in real-life issues;
- links to political understanding and active participation.

The review attributed this largely to lack of teacher confidence and expertise and recommended that teaching and learning in this area of the Citizenship curriculum be given a much higher official profile through the inclusion of a new element in the National Curriculum programmes of study at key stages 3 and 4: 'Identity and Diversity: Living Together in the UK'.<sup>2</sup>

It also recommended that the DfES commission a review of existing educational resources covering issues that explicitly relate to teaching about identity and diversity in the Citizenship curriculum. This present review, undertaken by the Citizenship Foundation on behalf of the Association for Citizenship Teaching, is the result of that commission.

## 1.2 The aim of this review

This review does not set out to list every currently available educational resource that relates or claims to relate to issues of identity and diversity as they appear in the Citizenship curriculum, but rather to appraise critically the general situation with regard to such resources: their aims and objectives; the pedagogical methods they employ; what they cover and do not cover.

The aim is to present a critical overview of what is currently available, with a view to helping practitioners select appropriate resources for use with their students, and, where there are gaps in provision, guiding resource-providers in the commissioning and developing of new kinds of teaching materials.

---

<sup>1</sup>DfES (2007) Diversity and Citizenship: Curriculum Review. London: DfES. Available at: [www.teachernet.gov.uk/publications](http://www.teachernet.gov.uk/publications).

<sup>2</sup> This new element has been duly included in the Citizenship curriculum in the course of the Qualification and Curriculum Authority's review of the key stage 3 and 4 curriculum.

In a departure from normal practice, a number of resources quoted from have deliberately been left un-referenced. As a counter-balance, we intend to supplement this review with a short practitioners guide outlining a number of practical lesson activities drawn from specific referenced sources.

## **1.2 The sample**

The conclusions drawn in this review have been made on the basis of a relatively small sample from the potentially vast range of educational resources that relate to issues of identity and diversity.

In selecting the sample, we focused on resources produced for the secondary-school curriculum within the last ten years: audio-visual and web-based as well as hard copy. In the first instance, this involved resources produced specifically for the Citizenship curriculum, but also a selection from other school subjects – in particular, Religious Education. In addition, we looked at a range of other teaching materials less subject-specific in nature, e.g., from the field of global, development, anti-racist, multicultural and human rights education.

Relevant materials were identified in a variety of ways, including internet searches, recommendations from professional colleagues and surveys of the collections of organisations, such as the TIDE centre in Birmingham and the library of S Martin's College, Lancaster, as well as the Citizenship Foundation's own collection.

The concept of diversity employed was the one used in the Ajegbo report. The focus, therefore, was on ethnic, religious and cultural diversity rather than on other types of diversity, such as those based on gender, sexual orientation or disability.

# WHAT IS AVAILABLE?

## 2.1 Resource providers

There is a vast range of educational resources that can claim to touch on issues of identity and diversity in one way or another. They are available from a wide variety of providers, including: government-funded bodies, publishing companies, NGOs and charitable organisations, teacher consortia and networks, and television and media organisations.

## 2.2 Range of contexts and types of material

Of the resources available, very few focus specifically on identity or diversity issues as such or deal with them in any detail – though there are some exceptions.<sup>3</sup>

Most relevant materials are found scattered among resources covering wider issues, or in general textbooks or programmes designed to cover the whole Citizenship curriculum, or the curricula of other school subjects. They tend to appear in different contexts and under different headings, including:

a) Identity, belonging, community

Information and classroom activities on students' personal and group identity, influences on and the development of identity and the sense of community, multiple identities and national identity – including Britishness.

b) Britain – a multicultural society

Information and classroom activities on ethnic minority groups in the UK – including census data, history of immigration to Britain from early times, contribution of ethnic minority groups to UK society, the culture and history of ethnic minority groups locally and media images of ethnic minorities generally.

c) Immigration, refugees and asylum seekers

Information and classroom activities relating to recent immigration to the UK – including different kinds of immigrants, reasons for migration, official statistics, personal stories of refugees and asylum seekers, popular myths and media images relating to immigrants and asylum seekers and relevant legislation.

d) Racism, prejudice and discrimination

---

<sup>3</sup> E.g., Chalkface Project (nd); Children & Young People's Unit (2003); Frith (2007); Learning and Skills Network (2006); Oldham Education & Culture (nd).

Information and classroom activities on the nature of prejudice and discrimination – including stereotyping, forms and origins of racism, personal experiences of racism, examples of racist and discriminatory behaviour in Britain and relevant legislation.

e) Black and Asian history

Information and classroom activities on the 'hidden' or unexplored history of Black and Asian, and sometimes also of Jewish, people in the Britain.

f) Religious belief and practice

Information and classroom activities on the major religious traditions in the UK, their history, distinctive beliefs and practices, symbols and rituals and social and moral principles – including religious teachings about prejudice and discrimination, and religious prejudice and discrimination.

g) EU and Commonwealth

Information and classroom activities on the history, origins, constitution and function of the EU and Commonwealth - including the debates on EU enlargement and a common European currency.

## 3: THE ISSUES

### 3.1 Personal identity

There is a strong emphasis in a large number of resources on activities in which students are asked to express their own sense of personal identity.

Students are invited to talk to each other about what they think their personal identifying characteristics are. They may be asked to list them, e.g., their gender, age, physical characteristics, or hobbies. Or create their own coat of arms by drawing symbols to represent these personal characteristics. Or be invited to respond to the question 'Who am I?' by completing the sentence 'I am \_\_\_\_\_' in a number of different ways – with follow-up questions, such as 'How do you show who you are?' 'What influences have made you who you are?'

Exercises of this kind can be seen as contributing to the development of self-esteem and a sense of community: a way of making students aware that they are important people worthy of respect and that others are equally important and worthy of respect, too.

#### 3.1.1 Going beyond the personal

Although it has an important part to play in the development of a citizen identity, there is more to citizenship education than creating a positive sense of self and sense of community. Identity is a social as well as a personal phenomenon: commonalities and difference in identity shape as well as are shaped by social situations. It is important, therefore, for students to have the opportunity to explore a range of identity-related issues that arise in *society* at large – in particular, where identity is perceived to be a problem. In some of the resources we have seen, work on identity seems to be concerned solely with students' personal development and fails to engage with to their social understanding.

#### 3.1.2 Developing the concept of identity

Identity is a complex concept for young people to understand. It is to do with how people see and feel about themselves, both as individuals and in comparison with other individuals. It combines self-concept and self-esteem and is as much to do with internal emotional states as external characteristics or behaviour. Understanding this is fundamental to understanding issues of identity in society. Yet, in the resources we have seen, we have not been able to find teaching materials that deliberately set out to develop this concept in students.

In a number of cases, we have seen resources that seem to confuse personal interests with personal identity. In one example, students are shown a picture of the contents of the bedroom of a young person and asked what it shows about that young person's 'identity.' In the picture there is an item with a Star of David - so presumably one of the answers they are meant to give is that

being Jewish is part of the person's identity. The problem with this exercise is that one cannot actually tell anything about the person's identity - how they see or feel about themselves - from a picture of this kind. It is important, if students are to be able to learn how to explore complex issues relating to identity in society, that they first understand what identity is and how it works.

One way to have done this in the context of this exercise would have been to focus student attention on the thoughts and feelings of the person whose bedroom they were looking at – by asking questions such as: Do you think they feel Jewish/ are proud to be Jewish? If not, why not? Is this likely to be a problem for them? Why or why not?

## **3.2 Social identity**

In many resources dealing with identity, work on the different communities or 'groups' with which students identify is a natural progression from exercises on how they see themselves as individuals.

Typically, this is introduced by asking students about influences on their lives or on the lives of young people in general, e.g., the influence of family, friends or religious communities. In a follow-up question students may be asked to prioritise these in terms of how powerful an influence they think each one is.

Another common approach is to define the term 'community' and ask students to think about the communities to which they belong, perhaps with the help of a blank spider diagram entitled 'Who am I?' – with prompts like 'football teams', 'religions' and 'ethnic groups'. This might be followed up with an exercise in which students are encouraged to categorise these communities into two groups: those they have chosen for themselves and those chosen for them.

### **3.2.1 Developing the concept of social identity**

Group or community membership might be a basis for, but is not quite the same as social identity. In a number of resources, we have noticed that, although students are often asked about groups or communities of that they are in, they are not asked to reflect upon their feelings towards them, i.e., how strongly they identify, or whether they even identify with them at all. Just because a person is born into or judged by others as belonging to a particular group or community does not mean that he or she identifies with it as such. This is an important aspect of social identity, and understanding it is fundamental to understanding identity issues in society more generally. It is important, therefore, for students to be provided with opportunities to develop this concept and be able to practise applying it in real situations.

### **3.2.2 Understanding identity conflict**

Related to this is the fact that people often experience a sense of conflict between different aspects of their identity. They feel torn between different identities, e.g., between their family and peer persona, home and school, or



religion and work.<sup>4</sup> This is not the same as the conflict that a person may feel between the way they see themselves and the way others see them, though it can arise out of it. It is the conflict between the different ways a person sees and feels about himself or herself.

This kind of identity conflict is a significant dimension of everyday life for many people in the diverse society that currently exists in the UK. It can be associated, for example, with the experience of mixed-race heritage and also of the conflict between the demands of traditional religious cultures and the secular values of the modern, western world.

From what we have seen, there seems to be little resource material that focuses explicitly on this aspect of identity or helps students to grasp its significance, what it means in practice and how it can help them to understand different situations.

Most of the resource material on identity we have seen does not go much beyond asking students about their own personal characteristics and listing the groups and communities to which they belong. One exception is the resource pack produced by a group of West Midlands teachers for TIDE, which uses the experience of Northern Ireland as a case study for a quite detailed student investigation into citizenship and identity issues in England.<sup>5</sup>

### **3.3 Citizenship identity**

Citizenship identity is seeing and feeling oneself to be a citizen with, in a democratic society at least, the same rights and responsibilities as every other citizen. Curiously, we have found very little teaching material which focuses explicitly upon citizenship identity as a concept in its own right. While there is vast body of material on rights and responsibilities of different kinds, there appears to be little material to help students investigate and discuss citizenship as a form of identity, or of how this form of identity begins and what assists or hinders its development.

#### **3.3.1 Developing the concept of citizenship as a form of identity**

Understanding the nature of citizenship as a form of identity is a pre-requisite for understanding a range of identity- and diversity-related issues in society today. Do some people feel like 'second-class' citizens? Do they think they don't actually count as citizens at all? What makes someone feel like this? What happens when someone feels they don't count? What can be done about it? How important is it that all citizens should be able to feel that they are equal citizens? At the moment here would seem to be very little support material to help students discuss questions of this kind.<sup>6</sup>

### **3.4 National identity and Britishness**

---

<sup>4</sup> See 3.8.

<sup>5</sup> TIDE (2001).

<sup>6</sup> An exception is the Unit 'What does it mean to be a citizen?' in Huddleston (2004).

While there appear to be very few resources focusing specifically on issues of national identity as such<sup>7</sup>, work on issues related to national identity features in quite a number of resources dealing with wider Citizenship issues.<sup>8</sup>

In most cases we have seen, however, the emphasis is on Britishness as a type of national identity, rather than on the general concept of national identity itself.<sup>9</sup>

Typically, students are invited to discuss what Britishness 'means' to them or how they 'see' it. Images taken from newspapers, magazines or the internet or lists of relevant words and phrases are used as stimuli for the discussion. As a follow-up task, students may be asked to try to come up with a definition of Britishness on which they can all agree.

#### 3.4.1 Going beyond the personal

In the way they tend to appear in resources, a number of these activities seem hardly to take students beyond the realm of their own subjective experience. It is common to find exercises that invite students to choose images they associate with Britishness, but rare to find ones which encourage them to reflect critically upon the existence of different, conflicting images of Britishness and its implications for national life.

There is range of questions that could be discussed here, but rarely seems to be: Does it matter what image citizens have of their country? Is there something wrong if a person has a bad image of Britishness, or is this OK? Are some images of Britishness better, or some worse than others? Do certain images exclude particular sectors of the population? Should the Government promote a particular image of Britishness? If so, how could it do this?

One resource which does try to help students to respond to some of these questions is the TIDE pack on Derry/ Londonderry.<sup>10</sup> The pack looks in detail at murals found in Northern Ireland and asks, among other things: 'Do these images contribute to or hinder the building of citizenship?' It then goes on to explore similar issues of identity in the context of the students' own communities in England.

#### 3.4.2 Going beyond the ideal Briton

Another way in which Britishness is sometimes explored is through asking students to identify their ideal Briton: as one resource puts it, someone who has 'excelled in our society within their chosen field'. Students nominate individuals they think fit this category, argue for their choice and vote on the class favourite. Or they may be asked to analyse the attributes and characteristics of famous Britons who have won actual national awards, such as the Morgan Stanley Great Britons<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup> Exceptions include Frith (2007)

<sup>8</sup> E.g., Learning & Skills Network (2006); Oldham Education & Culture (nd); TIDE (2002); [www.greatbritons.org/staffroom](http://www.greatbritons.org/staffroom)

<sup>9</sup> E.g., Chalkface Project (nd); Children & Young People's Unit (2003).

<sup>10</sup> TIDE (2001).

<sup>11</sup> [www.greatbritons.org/staffroom](http://www.greatbritons.org/staffroom)

Now while exercises of this kind may encourage students to reflect upon and discuss the kind of qualities of character they admire in other people in general, or in people in Britain in particular, or provide them with a role model in some way, it is difficult to see what contribution it is actually making to students' *understanding* of national identity.

A more effective way of using this kind of stimulus material might be to encourage students to think critically about the whole process of awards based on national identity. Morgan Stanley Great Briton award winners, for example, are expected to hold a British passport and are judged in terms of four 'typically' British characteristics: adaptability, modesty, sense of humour, and strength and determination. This raises a number of questions: To what extent are these distinctively British characteristics? Is it possible to identify a set of distinctively British characteristics? What does it mean when someone says something is 'typically' British? Does promoting a particular set of characteristics as distinctively British help or hinder the development of a better society in Britain? These would seem to be important questions for students to have opportunities to explore if they are to gain a better understanding of the contemporary debate around the concept of Britishness.

#### 3.4.3 Understanding Britishness in relation to other types of national identity

The concept of national identity and the debate that surrounds it is particularly complex in the context of a sovereign state (UK) made up of four separate nations (England, Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland). However, we have found little exploration of this complexity in the resources produced for the Citizenship curriculum in England.<sup>12</sup> Although there is a certain amount of teaching material available that relates to questions of national identity in Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland, this is primarily designed for use within the national education systems in these countries.<sup>13</sup> Moreover, we have found little reference at all to Englishness as a type of national identity in its own right, or of the relationship between Britishness and Englishness or between Britishness and any other form of national identity within or beyond the UK. Understanding these relationships is important for understanding life in the UK today and we feel that students ought to be provided with opportunities to discuss them.

#### 3.4.4 Understanding the political system in the UK

One of the difficulties that seems to arise in helping students to understand wider issues of national identity in the UK is the way in which information about the four separate nations is presented in Citizenship resources.

Information about Wales and Scotland tends to be limited to devolution and the constitution and functions of the Welsh Assembly and Scottish Parliament. The Northern Ireland Assembly is commonly mentioned –

---

<sup>12</sup> Exceptions include Brett (2007) on English-Scottish relations, and Jerome (2002b).

<sup>13</sup> E.g., on Welsh identity for Welsh schools, see. Rawle (2005) and [www.100welshheroes.com](http://www.100welshheroes.com)

though, more often than not, the history of the ‘troubles’ features much more prominently, usually in the context of teaching about discrimination and community conflict. In contrast, little space, if any, is devoted to specifically English institutions, the bulk of information being about the UK Parliament and its functions.

The tendency, therefore, is to deal with these as separate rather than connected subjects, such that it seems to be hard to find Citizenship resources that offer even a simple factual description of the UK as a sovereign state made up of four separate countries, of the history of this arrangement and the social and political issues to which it gives rise – in particular, issues of national identity – let alone classroom activities designed to help students explore this arrangement.

It is also hard to find resources that offer clear definitions of key terms used in the area, not only technical terms like ‘sovereignty’ and ‘state’, but also names like ‘Britain’ (a geographical entity) and ‘UK’ (a political one – properly, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland).

#### 3.4.5 Developing the concept of national identity

Teaching about Britishness before or without exploring the general concept of national identity in its own right would not seem to be the most effective strategy for helping students to understand the debate surrounding it. First, the concept of national identity is logically prior to the concept of Britishness, i.e., Britishness is a type of national identity, rather than vice versa. Second, in the context of the present-day composition of the UK and, in particular, the range of identity-related issues thrown up by the complex relationship between its four constituent nations – not to mention the presence of people with dual citizenship or whose national heritage lies outside the UK – the concept of, and the debate surrounding Britishness are particularly difficult for young people to grasp.

To help students make sense of Britishness and the debate that surrounds it, therefore, it would seem important for them first to have done some work on the idea of national identity as a general concept and to have explored some of the questions to which this concept gives rise: What is national identity? What does it consist of? Where does it come from? Does everyone have one? Can you have more than one? Is there only one particular form of identity for each country or can countries have more than one? Is it better if all the citizens of a country have the same identity, or doesn’t it matter if they don’t?

It would seem important, therefore, for students to be provided with opportunities to think about and discuss the idea of national identity as a concept in its own right before considering questions about Britishness and its relationship to other expressions of national identity. Yet, as far as we can see, there is very little resource material available to support this kind of teaching.

### 3.5 Patriotism

Love of one's country and a willingness to defend, and even to die for it has traditionally been thought of as one of the central civic virtues and is closely related to the concept of national identity. With one or two exceptions<sup>14</sup>, however, we have found very few educational resources that deal with this in any detail. Nor have we found resources looking in any significant detail at how patriotism relates to other kinds of attitude towards nationality, such as nationalism, jingoism or xenophobia.

Understanding what patriotism is and how it relates to these other kinds of attitudes is important for understanding issues of national identity. There would seem to be a need, therefore, for the provision of more educational materials to help students make sense of this aspect of identity and the social and political questions to which it gives rise: What is patriotism? What kinds of things does it involve? Is it a good thing? What is the difference between patriotism and nationalism? Is it reasonable to expect a certain level of patriotism from all the citizens of a country? Why might some people not feel patriotic? Are there particular expressions of patriotism that should be encouraged/ discouraged, e.g., flags, national anthems, buying British?

### **3.6 Local identity**

A person's sense of local identity can be very powerful, sometimes more powerful than their identification with a particular ethnic group, religious community or country. For many older people who have lived and worked in the same place all their lives, the sense of place can be very important. But it can also be very important for young people, too – especially those whose closest identifications are with other young people in the same area, and is probably a factor in the phenomenon of 'gang culture'.

While there is a great deal of support material encouraging young people to become more active participants in their local communities through volunteering or campaigning, little of this deals with issues of local identity in any depth, and material produced for use in local conflict resolution or community cohesion projects is not always appropriate for curriculum work in the classroom.

On the other hand, there are now quite a number of resources designed at the local level for use in local schools on issues of identity and diversity in specific localities.<sup>15</sup> Many of these resources contain valuable information about the background and culture of different communities in the localities with which they deal and are useful for understanding identity issues relating to particular groups within these communities. They tend, however, to deal with the more 'visible' groups which identify themselves with ethnicity or religion within a given area, rather than those which define themselves by sense of place as such. From what we have seen, there seem to be few educational resources that deal in any detail with identities that are defined

---

<sup>14</sup> E.g., Lesson Unit on 'Why should we love our country?' Huddleston (2004) and Case Study 1 'Patriotism, allegiance and identity' in Brett (2002).

<sup>15</sup> E.g., Oldham Education & Culture (nd) on Oldham; Cheshire Education Development Centre (2002) on Cheshire; Ahmend Iqbal Ullah Education Trust (2006) on Manchester; [www.bbc.co.uk/londonlive](http://www.bbc.co.uk/londonlive) on London.

specifically by locality or the ways in which these relate to other forms of identity.

### **3.6 European identity**

Of the different educational resources we have seen that touch on issues relating to Europe, most deal exclusively with the European Union. This applies both to specialist publications and to sections on Europe in general Citizenship textbooks.

In the vast majority of cases we have seen, the materials seem to follow the same general pattern. A high proportion of the content is factual information, higher than for most other elements in the Citizenship curriculum – typically, information about the history and origin of the EU, the number and location of its member states and its chief institutions and their functions.<sup>16</sup>

Discussion questions tend to be few and far between – with the exception of those relating to two major issues: enlargement and a common European currency.

#### **3.6.1 Making Europe accessible**

While it may be true that enlargement and the euro are important and controversial issues, they are also extremely complex ones. There is always a danger, especially with younger students, that the level of information will either go entirely over their heads or end up being so over-simplified as to be virtually useless. We have seen both of these dangers in a number of the resources we have looked at: on the one hand, a mass of detailed information unmediated for student use, on the other simple lists of pros and cons that students are expected to evaluate unaided.

There would seem, therefore, to be a need for more resources on the EU which focus on real-life issues that are accessible to school students - e.g., travel, sport, food, school, work, prejudice - and relate to the lives young people lead throughout Europe. They need to be mediated to students through a process of critical enquiry and questioning rather than hoping that the information will speak for itself: What has the EU ever done for us? What is it for? What should it do that it's not doing now?

#### **3.6.2 Developing the concept of European identity**

UK citizens are automatically EU citizens, subject to EU law as well as to UK law. Understanding this is essential to understanding what it means to be a British citizen today. Yet it is surprising how few resources actually tell students about this directly or deal with issues of identity or diversity within a European rather than a UK context.

Resources that deal with immigration, for example, seem to focus almost entirely on immigration to the UK and hardly ever consider the wider European dimension at all. Exercises on identity and belonging seem rarely

---

<sup>16</sup> E.g., European Parliament UK Office (2006).

to consider the possibility of UK citizens identifying with or belonging to Europe. Perhaps the most telling indicator is the way in which, in many Citizenship textbooks, issues of identity and diversity are covered at the front of the book with teaching about the EU dealt with entirely separately at the very back (alongside teaching about the Commonwealth).

If English school students tend not to define themselves as European or have positive images of Europe, surely the appropriate response is to encourage them to consider why this is the case – not to ignore the issue altogether. There would seem, therefore, to be a need not only for resources to make European issues accessible, but also for them to encourage students to think critically about European identity: What is European identity? Who has one? Who doesn't? Is there only one kind? Where does a sense of European identity come from? Is it important for European citizens to feel European? Or is it OK not to?

### **3.7 Commonwealth and Empire**

Many of the Citizenship textbooks we have seen contain a brief section related to the Commonwealth. Generally speaking, this section follows a similar pattern to materials on the EU. A high proportion of the content is factual information – typically, information about history and origin of the Commonwealth, its members and activities. This same is true of the more specialist and detailed resources on the Commonwealth.<sup>17</sup>

We have found very little discussion material on topical or controversial real-life issues or issues of identity relating to the Commonwealth. In fact, in many Citizenship textbooks, issues of identity and diversity are covered at the front of the book with teaching about the Commonwealth dealt with entirely separately at the very back of the book (alongside teaching about the EU).

Information and issues relating to the British Empire are even harder to come by in Citizenship resources. In fact, in what we have seen, it is rare even for the existence of the Empire to be mentioned. Yet the Empire and later the Commonwealth continues to influence many aspects of life and identity in the UK today, particularly in terms of the movements of people in search of a better life away from and also within Britain. Many school students can explain their presence in Britain from Empire and Commonwealth heritages. The Empire and Commonwealth provided the motivation for the migration of peoples both to and from Britain for a considerable period of time and, in a sense, still do today.

There would seem to be need, therefore, for teaching materials that help students to understand something of the legacy of Empire and

---

<sup>17</sup> E.g., Paren (2003); [www.youngcommonwealth.org](http://www.youngcommonwealth.org)

[http://news.bbc.co.uk/cbbcnews/hi/teachers/citizenship\\_11\\_14/subject\\_areas/commonwealth/default.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/cbbcnews/hi/teachers/citizenship_11_14/subject_areas/commonwealth/default.stm)

Commonwealth in terms of its implications for issues of identity and diversity in the UK today.

### **3.8 The concept of multiple identities**

The concept of multiple identities is central to understanding many of the issues of identity in the UK today. Yet in the educational resources we have seen, rarely is it explored in any detail.

Typically, the concept is defined and examples are given by way of illustration, but little else. There are few, if any, suggestions of practical activities teachers might use to help students explore the significance of multiple identities in real situations or questions for group or class discussion, and the whole concept seems to be generally regarded as unproblematic.

#### **3.8.1 Understanding ambiguity and conflicts of loyalty**

In real life the multiple identities a person has are rarely, if ever, unproblematic. To varying degrees, individuals experience a certain amount of ambiguity in their sense of identity and conflicts of loyalty between the different ways in which they define themselves or between the way in which they define themselves and the way they are defined by others. This differs from person to person. While there are some people who experience no sense of incompatibility between national and other identities, there are a significant number of people who do, e.g., those who, though they have the legal status of British citizens, for different reasons feel unable to identify themselves as British. We have seen few resources to help students explore this aspect of the phenomenon of multiple identities or to understand how it can help them to understand some of the identity-related issues arising in the UK today.

#### **3.8.2 Recognising multiple identities in wider contexts**

The examples chosen to illustrate the concept of multiple identities usually seem to relate to national and ethnic minority group identities, e.g., Black British, Asian British. But the experience of different and conflicting loyalties can occur across a range of different kinds of identity, not least between identities related to family, peer groups, or social class. In fact, in terms of everyday life in the UK, issues arising from a conflict of identities outside the context of national identity are probably more numerous than those arising within. Yet these do not seem to figure prominently in the curriculum materials we have seen.

#### **3.8.3 Taking account of multiple and dual citizenships**

The concept of multiple identities is closely connected to that of multiple citizenships, but the concept of multiple citizenships is rarely mentioned and even more rarely explored in the Citizenship resources we reviewed. We have already noted the apparent lack of good teaching material on European citizenship and the relationship between European and UK citizenships. Similarly, we have found very little reference to dual citizenship: what it is, to whom it applies and how it relates to multiple identities or citizenship values like patriotism.



### 3.8.4 Taking account of mixed-race heritage

Mixed-race heritage and its impact on identity seem also to be rarely covered or even mentioned in Citizenship resource material.<sup>18</sup> Yet it is said to be becoming an increasingly significant dimension of contemporary social life in the UK.

The tendency in many of the resources we have seen is to portray membership of ethnic, religious or racial groupings as mutually exclusive. Not only does this fail to address the experience of the many students who find themselves torn between different forms of group identity, but it also denies students in general the opportunity to understand the contemporary issues to which mixed-race heritage gives rise.

## 3.9 The concept of diversity

While there appear to be few Citizenship resources focusing specifically on the idea of diversity or diversity-related issues in the UK<sup>19</sup>, many Citizenship textbooks contain a separate section on diversity and wider issues touching on aspects of diversity are dealt with in a range of cross-curricular educational resources. The idea of diversity also features prominently in many Religious Education resources.

A typical classroom activity found in a number of these resources is where students are asked to identify things they have in common with each other and things that make them different. Suggestions might include football teams they support, place of birth, gender and so on. It is then pointed out that that society at large is just like their class: a group with commonalities and differences. On one level, the activity can be seen as a way of helping students to understand the concept of diversity. At another, it can be seen as a way of developing students' self-esteem and their tolerance and respect for others.

### 3.9.1 Understanding that diversity is not always without problems.

A number of the resources we have seen begin and end their examination of diversity with this kind of activity. Diversity is not without its problems, however. It is important for students to have opportunities to explore some of the real problems associated with diversity and increasing diversity in society, as well learning to value the differences they see in people around them. Yet there is quite a number of Citizenship resources where diversity is portrayed as essentially unproblematic – either by ignoring the problems or deliberately downplaying them. One resource, for example, says: 'There is some amount of tension between the needs and desires of groups but usually this is managed by goodwill and patience.'

The same tendency can sometimes be found in the way some of the poetry of Benjamin Zephaniah is used - in particular, poems like 'The British' and 'The

---

<sup>18</sup> One exception is the activity based on the poem, 'Grandpapa' in Clough & Holden (2002).

<sup>19</sup> Exceptions include Learning & Skills Network (2006); Oldham Education & Culture (nd); Radcliffe (2002).

London Breed'. These poems present a simple, harmonious, ideal of community cohesion and integration in Britain (assuming they are not read entirely ironically). 'The British', for example, depicts the successive immigration of different groups into Britain as: 'We just keep melting into one ...' Rather than inviting students to question this unproblematic picture of immigration, a number of resources use the poem simply to confirm it. Students are asked, for example: 'What do you think the messages of the poem are?' The answer is given in the poem: 'Give justice and equality to all'. The danger of only dealing with diversity in this simplistic way is that it denies students the opportunity to understand the injustices and the inequalities that do exist and the factors that lie behind them. It is important, for students to have the opportunity to examine the downside as well as the value of diversity.

### 3.9.2 Exploring less visible forms of diversity

In discussing issues of diversity, most of the resources we have seen concentrate almost entirely on diversity of race or ethnicity, or conspicuous religious practice. The terms 'diverse' and 'multicultural' are often equated in the text. So the emphasis is on the immediately visible rather than less visible forms of diversity. There are many types of social diversity in the UK today – not only racial, ethnic and religious, but also generational, class-based, urban-rural and others. Different types of diversity overlap in complex patterns. Students need the opportunity to explore a range of types of diversity in order to be able to understand how they co-exist in particular situations. There would seem, therefore, for there to be a need for resources to reflect more realistically the range of diversities that are actually found in society.

### 3.9.3 Exploring regional variations in diversity issues

Patterns of diversity are not uniform throughout Britain and diversity issues vary considerably from place to place. Yet this fact often goes unrecognised in Citizenship resources dealing with diversity. While there are resources that explore issues in particular localities<sup>20</sup> and others that refer to events in particular parts of the country, e.g., Bradford riots, there are few that direct students to the different patterns that occur geographically as a way of better understanding the different social forces at work.<sup>21</sup>

### 3.9.4 Exploring the diversity that exists within as well as between groups

We have also noticed a tendency in some resources to treat different social groups as monolithic entities in which all members of the group behave in the same way and share the same sense of identity. It appears to be particularly marked in respect of religious diversity in resources produced for the Religious Education curriculum, where all people belonging to a particular religious group are credited with the same beliefs, moral outlook and attitudes towards religious practice.

---

<sup>20</sup> See footnote 15.

<sup>21</sup> One exception is Byrom (2000), a History textbook, which makes the point that 'the situation in Birmingham is not the same as Bradford, Brixton or Bristol'.

In a lesson on Islam in the UK, for example, one RE resource suggests involving students in a hypothetical situation in which they have to imagine that they are to write a policy on the wearing of veils by bank personnel. To help them with this task they are given a series of statements from different Muslims. The activity is framed as though the veil were the norm among Muslim women, rather than in the context of the wide variety of clothing Muslim women have worn both in the past and today.

In this context, the materials on Muslim perspectives and citizenship produced through teacher collaboration in Birmingham<sup>22</sup> are somewhat unusual in describing in some detail the variety between Muslims in the UK and some of the tensions that exist between different Muslim groups. Yet even this publication goes on to describe a particular free-range chicken farm as being run on 'Islamic principles' as though Muslims throughout the world keep chickens under identical conditions or have the same outlook on poultry as the farm owners in the book

It is important, therefore, that students have access to resources about diversity that not only reflect the variety of opinion and behaviour within different groups, but in their choice of activities give students the opportunity to explore this in some real situations.

### 3.9.5 Breaking the link between diversity and immigration

In many Citizenship resources we have seen, the idea of diversity is identified closely with immigration, e.g., 'diversity has come about as a result of immigration over thousands of years'. In a number of places, ethnic minorities are identified with immigrants. It can sometimes give the erroneous impression that immigration is the main or only source of social diversity in the UK. This does not help students' understanding either of diversity or immigration. The link may be a common one in the popular imagination of people in this country at this moment, but it would seem preferable for resources to encourage students to question rather than confirm it.

## 3.10 Immigration and asylum

Immigration and asylum are covered in a wide range of resource materials, from standard Citizenship textbooks to specialist publications.<sup>23</sup>

A number of features recur frequently: including: the history of immigration to the UK; definitions and distinctions between types of immigration; reasons why people migrate – push and pull factors; personal stories of refugees and asylum seekers; the benefits of immigration to society in the UK.

### 3.10.1 Distinguishing between different immigrant histories

Almost all the general Citizenship textbooks we have seen include a brief narrative history of foreign immigration to the UK - from the Romans or Celts,

---

<sup>22</sup> TIDE (2003).

<sup>23</sup> E.g., Refugee Council (1998 & 2002); Rutter (2004); Save the Children (1999 & 2004).

or earlier, up to the present day. It is also a common feature in the more specialist Citizenship materials in this area.

The message behind this seems to be that Britain is ‘a nation of immigrants’, i.e., that everyone living in this country owes his or her existence here in one way or another to immigration – not just those who have come to Britain in the last fifty years or so. The moral seems to be that that, since we all ‘immigrants’, directly or indirectly, we should be more tolerant and understanding of people who are settling in this country today or who settled here a mere generation or two ago.

Now, while it is true that foreign immigration has always taken place in Britain and that students need to know about and understand this, the way this information tends to be presented is often problematic.

First, in almost all the historical accounts we have seen, examples of immigration are all presented as of essentially the same type and scale. They are also presented as essentially problem-free, at least up the arrival of the Windrush. Not only is this un-historical, but by presenting such a unified and unproblematic picture of immigration in the past students are also denied the historical tools to make sense of current immigration patterns. Immigration has not always been on the same type or scale and has not always given rise to the same social consequences. Understanding this is important in helping students to understand what is happening today.

Second, the idea that we all have an immigrant history, while true in one sense, is fundamentally unhelpful in another. It fails to recognize an essential difference in the way people perceive themselves in reality, i.e., the difference between those who see themselves as in some way indigenous to this country, those who see themselves as immigrants in one way or another and those who see themselves as some kind of mixture of the two. While many people in this country have a conscious personal or family history of immigration and identify themselves with this, many do not. Nor is there or ever will be any means by which a significant proportion of the population could trace when or how their distant ancestors came to Britain, or where these ancestors came from. It would seem to be important that students have the opportunity to explore these differences in identity and what they mean for different people if they are properly to understand issues of identity and diversity today. The idea that we are all immigrants seems to us to be simplistic and discourages rather than encourages student discussion of many of these important issues.

### 3.10.2 Understanding that the consequences of immigration can be mixed

Another very common feature in resources in this area is a discussion of the benefits that immigrants bring to life in the UK. However, it is rarely a discussion as such. More often than not, students are simply given a list of the advantages (often the same kind of list as students are given when they are being told about the benefits of living in a diverse or multicultural society). They may be invited to write down some of their favourite things – such as music, fast foods, films or TV programmes – and asked to identify the ones that are British (the assumption that many will have come from other

countries), or to work out which of the words we currently use have non-British origins.

While it may be important to emphasise the positive effects of immigration, one gets the impression that some resources are going to such lengths to justify immigration that the suggestions they make might just have the opposite effect. One book, for example, asks students rhetorically: 'What can we be thankful for?' Then it lists a number of things that immigrants have either brought with them to the UK or invented before they came, including the mini, potatoes, pyjamas and rabbits.

The problem is that not only are the benefits of immigration presented uncritically, but that potential difficulties are often also played down or ignored. The danger in presenting the benefits of immigration in this uncritical and one-sided way is that it denies students the opportunity to understand some of the real issues that arise in relation to immigration today.

Quite a number of resources include exercises on the way immigrants and asylum seekers are reported in the media.<sup>24</sup> While the role of the media is important and deserves to be understood, it is only part of the story and it would be helpful if there were more resources that helped to paint a more realistic and balanced picture of what is happening in the UK today.

### 3.10.2 Developing knowledge as well as empathy

Another common approach to immigration and asylum is through empathy. Through real-life case studies, students are encouraged to empathise with the feelings of young people who are immigrants or the children of immigrants or asylum seekers. Case studies can help young people to understand different motivations for migration and the difficulties experienced by migrants. They can also help them to learn about and explore issues relating to legislation and legal procedures.

However, while there is plenty of good case study material focusing on the experience of immigrants or asylum seekers to the UK prior to arrival, there is much less that actually focuses on the formal procedures and processes involved<sup>25</sup> - or the questions of justice and fairness that can arise in relation to them.

### 3.10.3 Empathising with the host community as well as the immigrant

Most of the empathy-based work we have seen focuses on the immigrant community rather than the host community. This seems to be a significant imbalance in resources using this approach. It seems important, therefore, for students to have access to a more balanced treatment of the issues if they are properly to understand these sorts of issues.

## 3.11 Religious identity and diversity

---

<sup>24</sup> e.g., Save the Children (2004).

<sup>25</sup> An exception is Rutter (2004).

Religious issues seem rarely to be covered in resources designed for the Citizenship curriculum. However, there is a substantial body of teaching material on identity and diversity to be found in resources designed for Religious Education.

### 3.11.1 Understanding that the contribution of religion can be mixed

In most RE resources we have seen, questions of identity are covered in the context of teaching about the function of religious symbols or rituals in religious traditions, including rites of passage. Students are shown how symbols and rituals can help members of religious communities develop a positive sense of personal identity and a sense of belonging and community with fellow believers, e.g., through congregational prayer. A typical student task here is: 'Select any aspect of worship and celebration in Christianity. Explain how it helps people express and affirm their identity as Christians.'

In almost all cases, however, the emphasis is on the positive contribution of religion. It is difficult to find RE materials that, for example, explore situations in which religion has been perceived as a negative force in a person's life, or where it has led to a conflict of loyalties with other sources of identity. It is equally difficult to find resources that deal with conflict occasioned by differences between religious identities or by differences between religious and non-religious identities – or how society might deal with these.

In RE resources where issues such as the debate over faith schools are mentioned, it seems almost always to be in the form of a simple add-on question at the end of a topic. We have rarely found issues like this being dealt with in any detail in RE materials.

### 3.11.2 Learning about religion in society not just religious teachings about society

A dominant theme in many RE resources is the value of learning from the different religions. A question in one textbook reads: 'How does your school encourage a sense of community? ... Could it learn from Islam?' A task in another: 'Examine some religious teachings about respect and human dignity to discern whether religions have good advice for us on this topic.'

While it is important to know about and understand the teachings of different religions on social issues, it is also important to have some understanding of the *actual* behaviour of religious groups in society – where they deviate from as well as follow official teaching. Yet there seems to be very little material available in RE resources to help students develop this kind of understanding. There is a tendency in many resources to dismiss inter-religious conflict, for example, as 'the actions of extremists.' Similarly, where less socially acceptable practices are mentioned, they are often described in the safe context of another country. In a section on Hinduism, for example, one resource says that 'in rural areas, prejudice on caste still exists' – presumably not referring to rural England. In the RE resources we have seen, there is a great deal of information about what religions teach about prejudice and about prejudice about religion, but very little on prejudice generated within religion.

### 3.11.3 Considering a range of 'citizens of faith'

In a similar vein, a common approach in Religious Education materials designed to link with the Citizenship curriculum is to examine the lives of 'citizens of faith', i.e., famous individuals whose religious faith has led them to distinctive forms of social or political action - e.g., Martin Luther King, Mahatma Gandhi, Desmond Tutu.<sup>26</sup>

Work based on this kind of figure helps students to see the social ideals and teachings of religion in practice and might, in some cases, inspire young people to action themselves. However, it is also important for students to learn that one cannot 'read off' a person's social or political beliefs from their religious affiliation or background, and that believers of the same religious persuasion sometimes hold diametrically opposing social and political views. Historically, the role of religious leaders and institutions in social and political life has been a mixed one. The relation between religion and politics does not seem to be one that is well covered in educational resources at the moment.

### 3.11.4 Understanding religion from the standpoint of society

A great deal of teaching material about religion in society seems to ask students to consider issues from the standpoint of the religious group rather than from that of society as a whole. So, for example, students might be asked: 'Imagine you are a community worker in a multi-faith community. Write a leaflet for employers on the leisure and worship requirements of different religions ... to help people of all religions to follow their religion.' Or they might be asked to consider the problems in society for people whose religion involves periodic fasting.

What the resources are much less likely to do is ask how a society can reconcile the demands of a particular religious group with those of other groups in society, religious and non-religious, i.e., in the light of the common good. We have found very little material, if any, which helps students to consider religious issues within this wider context

## 3.12 Prejudice and discrimination

There is a vast body of resources dealing explicitly with issues of prejudice and discrimination that stretches back over many years.<sup>27</sup> Many of these resources repeat themselves, however, with the same kinds of information and activities recurring across a range of resource types. Commonly occurring features are: definitions of key concepts, e.g., prejudice, discrimination, stereotyping and racism; types of prejudice; explanations of

---

<sup>26</sup> E.g., Pestrige (2002).

<sup>27</sup> E.g., Dadzie (2000 & 2003); Donnellan (2003); Runnymede Trust (2003); [www.britkid.org](http://www.britkid.org)  
[http://re-xs.ucsm.ac.uk/ethics/race\\_and\\_prejudice/index.html](http://re-xs.ucsm.ac.uk/ethics/race_and_prejudice/index.html)  
<http://www.srtrc.org>

prejudice; exercises designed to help students understand these concepts; information on census data relating to ethnic minority groups; details about current legislation.

### 3.12.1 Developing knowledge and understanding as well as changing attitudes

A dominant theme in much of this material is the importance of challenging different forms of prejudice or racism. Less commonly is it directed explicitly at helping students to understand prejudice and discrimination as *social phenomena* in their own right or as a means to a better understanding of issues of identity and diversity in the world around them. Although there is no necessary conflict between these two aims and, in fact, the latter can sometimes lead to the former, when the imperative for attitude change becomes too prominent there is a danger of students feeling they are being manipulated rather than encouraged to think.

### 3.12.2 Avoiding the reinforcement of stereotypes

We have seen a number of examples in Citizenship resources where instead of challenging stereotypes, the way the materials are presented would seem to have the effect of reinforcing them. One GCSE revision guide on the topic of prejudice and discrimination, for example, describes how Christians and Muslims have (in other parts of the world) been responsible for as well the recipients of prejudice and discrimination, while depicting Jews as only ever the victims. A History book says: “Bengalis are certain to be good citizens”. A Citizenship textbook says in the context of the benefits of living in a diverse society (a statistic that appears in more than one such book): ‘Two-thirds of small shops supplying sweets, tobacco and newspapers are owned by Asians. They stay open late and on Sundays and provide great service to the local community ... Over a quarter of London Underground’s staff belong to ethnic minorities’.

### 3.12.3 Not playing up to fears

There is a kind of exercise used in a number of Citizenship-related resources where students are asked to estimate the percentage population of different ethnic groups in the UK. When they have made their estimates, students are given the actual census data and asked if anything surprises them about these figures. Implicit in this exercise is the assumption that students will have over-estimated the percentage population of certain ethnic minority groups. One problem with this is that it penalises the students with the right answer – which is not likely to promote a positive attitude towards learning. Perhaps more insidiously, however, the exercise seems to work on the principle that when students discover the actual population of certain minority groups is less than they imagined it to be, then their (prejudiced) fears will be allayed. This is not only a form of manipulation but it also gives the impression that certain groups in society may be tolerated only if they exist in small numbers.

If, on the other hand, students were to use this kind of exercise to research prevailing attitudes and understandings in their local community, then the learning outcome could be entirely different.



## 3.12 Using history

Knowing something about the historical background of an issue can help students to understand it. In the Citizenship resources we have seen, however, we have found very little use made of historical enquiry as a teaching and learning method as such.

### 3.12.1 Using history legitimately and accurately

This is not to say, however, that we have not found the past being used at all in connection to issues of identity and diversity. On the contrary, it is used in quite a range of resources - but it does not seem to be applied equally to all topics. The past is most often referred to in topics such as immigration, the right to vote, Northern Ireland and the formation of the EU. One area for which there seems to many resources is the field of Black and Asian history – intended for the Citizenship as well as the History curriculum.<sup>28</sup>

The worry in some of these cases is that history is not being used as a form of enquiry in its own right, but as history with a ‘message’. By ‘history with a message’ we mean selecting and interpreting facts about the past to promote or reinforce a particular social, moral or political message in the present, i.e., with the purpose of telling students what they should or should not believe or how they should or should not behave in today’s society. This is an inappropriate use of history. One cannot read into or deduce values from historical events. Trying to do so can only have the effect of foreclosing genuine historical investigation and debate, and leads to the distortion of history.

A number of resources we have seen have come dangerously close to manipulating history in this way. The emphasis on history in teaching about immigration, for example, appears to be designed as much to promote certain kinds of attitudes in students towards immigration as to encourage them to investigate the history of immigration for themselves or to use historical enquiry to understand some of the issues that arise in connection with immigration today.

A number of other resources we have seen come close to distorting history, either by the omission of significant facts or the general impression given. For example, in a resource on racial tensions in a northern textile town a series of population figures is given tracing the rise in population in the town since the industrial revolution – in the context of workers from abroad arriving to do new jobs. What it omits to say is that the key factor in the expansion of population in the town over that period was internal migration from the countryside and poorer parts of this country – not migration from abroad.

---

<sup>28</sup> E.g., [www.channel4.com/history/microsites/B/blackhistorymap/](http://www.channel4.com/history/microsites/B/blackhistorymap/)  
[www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/pathways/blackhistory/](http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/pathways/blackhistory/)  
[www.100greatblackbritons.com/home.html](http://www.100greatblackbritons.com/home.html)  
[www.blackhistory4schools.com](http://www.blackhistory4schools.com)

In another example, a resource on religious diversity says: 'Britain today is a nation of many faiths and beliefs ... A century ago the picture was very different. Christianity was the faith of the overwhelming majority of British people ...what has happened to change the face of faith and belief?' The impression given is one of religious unity in Britain until the onset of immigration after World War II. In reality however, Britain was as divided religiously in the nineteenth century, if not more so, than it is today. It is just that the divisions took place *within* Christianity.

The worry in such cases is that historical accuracy is taking second place to the historical 'message'. Indeed, we have found several examples where the history is just plain wrong, e.g., saying that Scandinavian immigration preceded Roman, giving historically incorrect derivations of place names or claiming that Muslim scholars in Baghdad, Spain and Cairo 'fuelled the Industrial Revolution.'

The same concern might be expressed about certain ways of using 'hidden' history. The idea of 'hidden' history is to help students trace the existence in Britain and the influence on British life of minority groups whose stories do not feature in conventional history. There is now a considerable collection of resources devoted to or featuring aspects of Black and Asian, and, sometimes, Jewish history.<sup>29</sup>

While it is true that conventional history has often omitted these stories and it is important they should be investigated like any other, we have a slight concern about the role of some of this kind of material in resources designed for use in the Citizenship curriculum. In particular, whether in the pursuit of promoting certain attitudes, either about or within these groups, the facts are being distorted. In some cases there is a feeling that the significance given to certain historical figures on account of belonging to a particular minority group is greater than history actually demands, or assumes that the social significance of a particular minority group today is the same as it was in the past.

An example of a resource which does appear to approach the history of this area in a legitimate way is one dealing with the story of Afro-Caribbean communities in Britain since 1948. The resource tells the same story from three different perspectives: (1) Windrush, prejudice, racism, anti-racism, Race Relations Acts, 1980 riots, continuing discrimination, Scarman, Stephen Lawrence, Macpherson; (2) culture, music, art, fashion; (3) jobs, unemployment figures, etc. One of the student exercises is to look at each of these historical developments and to try to categorise them as either 'Hopeful' or 'Disturbing' as a stimulus to discussion.<sup>30</sup>

There are many issues of identity and diversity that students can usefully investigate historically, e.g., Why are some areas white and others multicultural? Why do particular races and cultures often live together in particular areas? Why have we all ended up in this school? In Citizenship-related resources, however – as opposed to those produced specifically to support the History curriculum, the use of historical enquiry as a teaching and

---

<sup>29</sup> See footnote 28.

<sup>30</sup> Byrom (2000).

learning method tends to be fairly limited. It seems to be much more common in Citizenship resources for students to be told about what happened in the past and what this ‘means’ than to be encouraged to investigate it for themselves.

### 3.12.2 Developing an understanding of the use and abuse of history.

This raises the general question of whether the historical dimension of citizenship issues is better dealt with by History or by Citizenship teachers. However, there is one aspect of history that seems to fall or ought to fall squarely in the Citizenship curriculum. This is the way in which arguments from history are used in public debate and in determining public policy on matters relating to identity and diversity, e.g., in relation to the question of public apologies for slavery. Students need to be able to understand that there are legitimate and illegitimate uses of history, to distinguish between and recognize them when they see them in action in the public sphere. From what we have seen, there are few, if any, Citizenship resources that deal with this.

## 3.12 Identity and diversity within the classroom

One final issue to consider in relation to the ways in which teaching materials deal with issues of identity and diversity, though no less important, is the ‘voice’ with which the materials speak and the assumption this makes about the students at which they are aimed.

While some resources are apparently aimed at students in ethnically diverse, urban communities, others are clearly targeted at students in predominantly white areas.<sup>31</sup> This raises the question as to whether more resources are needed that are equally suitable in all schools, or more targeting of resources to specific types of school intake is required.

### 3.12.1 Avoiding ‘us’ and ‘them’

There is another issue that arises in this context, however. It is still possible to detect even in some very recent educational resources a tendency to polarised thinking about identity and diversity in relation to the students to which they are addressed - in particular, in which the students in the class are identified with the white, indigenous, and host majority as ‘us’ and the non-white, immigrant, minority as ‘them’. One resource, for example, says: ‘These faiths that we have investigated can no longer be called foreign in Britain. Those who practise them are our neighbours, classmates, friends and relatives.’ The resource is clearly speaking to students who are *not* members of any of the faiths in question. Another asks: “Do you view today’s immigrants and asylum seekers differently when you see them as the latest chapter in a long history of immigration to the UK. Write one paragraph, giving your reasons.”

---

<sup>31</sup> E.g. [www.britkid.org](http://www.britkid.org)

On the other hand, there are resources which appear to exclude the white, indigenous majority. For example, the resource which asks: 'When and why did your family move to Britain?'

It is important that we have Citizenship resources that speak to all students in a class equally, regardless of their background.

### 3.12.3 Not assuming the worst of students

Another potential weakness in some of the Citizenship resources we have seen is ones which assume the worst about the students for whom they are intended. For example, ones which assume students are racist, prejudiced, intolerant, hold certain kinds of stereotype or believe certain kinds of myths. An example is the kind of exercise on stereotyping in which students are asked to make judgements about people's occupations and nationality on the basis of photographs. In one such exercise students are told: 'Your choices were based on stereotypes'.

This is not a very good basis for learning. It is much better to be able to give students credit for what they know or can do than condemn them for what they do not know or cannot do. It is also likely to lead to students feeling they are being patronised or manipulated, and that they are being led to give a 'correct' answer rather than encouraged to think for themselves.

## 4: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1.1 There is currently available a vast range of educational resource material that touches, at least tangentially, on issues of identity and diversity in this country. Resources are available from a wide variety of providers, including government-funded bodies, publishing companies, NGOs and charitable organisations, teacher consortia and networks, and television and media organisations. They come in a variety of formats: audio-visual and web-based as well as traditional printed resources and textbooks.

4.1.2 Certain areas in the field are especially well represented as far as the quantity of available resources is concerned - in particular, resources dealing with:

- minority ethnic groups in the UK and their contribution to life in UK society;
- immigration to the UK and the way it is portrayed in the media;
- different forms of prejudice and discrimination, including racism, and how they can be challenged;
- religious traditions found in the UK and their different beliefs and practices;
- Black and Asian history.

4.1.3 On closer analysis, however, we have found that a great deal of this material tends to:

- be repetitive and contains many of the same kind of exercises and types of information;
- be relatively brief, undemanding for students and lacking intellectual challenge;
- emphasise issues of diversity over issues of identity;
- present issues of identity and diversity in abstract and simplistic ways and not reflect the complex and often ambiguous ways in which they are experienced in real-life situations.

We recommend, therefore, that in the development of any future resources, greater attention should be paid to the need to build in more intellectually challenging learning activities and to ground these in real issues and events taking place in the UK today.

4.1.4 While there seem to be plenty of materials directed at personal and attitude development - e.g., building self-esteem and respect for others, or challenging prejudice and racist beliefs, there is generally less of an emphasis on the development of social and political understanding of identity- or diversity-related issues or of the skills of critical enquiry. We think it is important that this imbalance should be addressed in any future resource development.

4.1.5 The concept of identity appears rarely to be explored in any depth. We think that there is a need for more and better materials dealing with the nature of and the relation between different forms of identity in society, including:

- local identities;
- citizenship identity
- national identities;
- religious identity
- multiple identities;
- multiple and dual citizenships;
- mixed-race heritage.

4.1.6 'Britishness' seems to fare particularly badly in many of the resources we have seen. Learning activities are often poorly thought out and undemanding. We recommend that before embarking on this issue, resources should help students to build up a sound understanding of the general concept of national identity first. We also recommend that discussions of Britishness be set within a wider exploration of the range of national identities in the UK today, rather than presented as a stand-alone activity.

4.1.7 Very few resources at all seem to deal with patriotism or patriotic behaviour. We think there is a need, therefore, for more materials which explore the value of love for country and the issues to which this gives rise. Hitherto, this subject has been almost absent from the curriculum, perhaps reflecting reticence in the prevailing educational culture about encouraging certain forms of patriotism. This gap in provision tends to leave possession of national symbols largely in the hands of the few and reinforce only the negative aspects of a value which in many other countries is regarded as a positive civic virtue.

4.1.8 The concept of diversity employed is frequently quite narrow, such that:

- diversity is often too closely identified with immigration;
- there is a lack of attention to the less visible forms of diversity in society, such as economic difference;
- little attention is paid to the relation between different kinds of diversity or of diversity within as well as between groups, particularly faith and ethnic minority groups.

We would like to see more educational resources reflecting the complexities of diversity in the UK today.

4.1.9 Materials dealing with immigration appear sometimes to be lacking in balance - for example:

- emphasising the benefits of, but rarely dealing with or addressing problems associated with immigration;
- encouraging students to empathise with the experience of the immigrant community, but rarely with the host community.

We recommend a more balanced approach to immigration issues in future resources.

4.1.10 While the institutions and functions of the Europe Union are fairly well covered, there appears to be little material dealing with European identity or the sense of European citizenship. This seems to us to be an area in urgent need of exploration.

4.1.11 The effect of the British Empire and the Commonwealth on present-day issues of identity and diversity is hardly ever raised in Citizenship resources. We recommend that this omission be addressed in future materials development.

4.1.12 As regards religion, there seems to be a general lack of materials which:

- explore the social and political dimensions of religious institutions and practices;
- consider religious beliefs and practices from the standpoint of society as a whole ;
- look at the relation between religion and other forms of diversity;
- reflect the ambiguities in and conflicts between religious forms of identity that occur in real-life situations.

4.1.13 As regards history, it would appear that:

- little use is currently being made of historical enquiry as a teaching and learning method;
- where it features in Citizenship resources, the past seems often to be used to illustrate a particular point about the present, rather than to help students to understand it – with the attendant danger of the ‘message’ becoming more important than the facts and the distortion of history;
- there is very little, if any, material exploring the use and abuse of different types of history in public debate and policy – a small, but perhaps significant gap in current resource provision, particularly for older students.

We think there are many potential opportunities for the application of historical enquiry to identity and diversity issues in cross-curricular work that currently go unexploited, and that there is an argument for including an element of reflection on the ‘uses of history in public life’ in future curriculum development.

4.1.14 Finally, there are aspects of certain kinds of learning activities that give particular cause for concern - for example, ones which:

- have the effect of reinforcing rather than undermining social stereotypes;
- reinforce polarised thinking – dividing society into ‘us’ and ‘them’, thereby excluding or marginalising certain groups of students from the learning process;
- appear to assume the worst of students – for example, that they hold certain racist views when this may not be the case.

We recommend, therefore, that greater attention should be paid in the future to the 'voice' that is used to address students in teaching materials and to consider the value of producing materials with a greater measure of inclusivity, i.e., that speak equally to all students in a class regardless of background.



# APPENDIX 1

## PUBLICATIONS, VIDEOS, DVDs & CD-ROMs CONSULTED

Ahmend Iqbal Ullah Education Trust (2006) Exploring Our Roots. Ahmend Iqbal Ullah Education Trust.

Amnesty International (2002) Learning about human rights through citizenship. Amnesty International.

Blaylock, L (2007) Learning about the veil and learning from the veil in RE. RE Today. Summer, Vol 24, No 3.

Brett (2002) GCSE Citizenship Studies. Folens.

Brett, P. (2007) 'The Lion and the Unicorn: 330 years of co-existence' Teaching Citizenship, Issue 17.

Britton, F. (2000). Active Citizenship: A teaching toolkit. Hodder & Stoughton.

Byrom, J. et al. (2000) Modern Minds: The twentieth century world. Longman.

Campbell, J & Patrick, S. (2003) Citizenship Studies for AQA: Teacher's Resource File. Heinemann.

Chalkface Project (nd) Challenging Stereotypes: What is British?

Cheshire Development Education Centre (2002) Cheshire Voices: Stories from people living in Cheshire with roots in other parts of the world.

Children & Young People's Unit (2003) Colour Blind: What it means to be British in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. CYPUP.

Cities in Schools (Tower Hamlets) Headstart Programme (1995) Challenging Racism, Valuing Difference: The Facilitators' Guide. London: The Tower Hamlets Learning Design Centre.

Citizenship Foundation & Me Too (2002) Education for Citizenship, Diversity and Race Equality: A Practical Guide. London: Citizenship Foundation.

Clough, N. & Holden, C. (2002) Education for Citizenship: Ideas into Action. RoutledgeFalmer.

Collins, A. & Sweeney, M. (2002). Letts Citizenship: GCSE Short Course Resource Pack. Letts Educational.

Combes, A. (2004) Meeting SEN in the Curriculum: Citizenship. London: David Fulton.

Culshaw, C. et al. (2002) Citizenship Today. HarperCollins.

- Culshaw, C. et al. (2003) *Citizenship in Focus: Teacher's Resources*. Collins.
- Dadzie, S. (2000) *Toolkit for Tackling Racism in School*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham.
- Dadzie, S. (2003) *Trial & Error: Learning about racism through citizenship education*. Front Line Training and Consultancy Ltd
- DIECEC (Developing Intercultural Education through Co-operation between European Cities) (1998) *Regarding Religion: Partnerships in Education for Citizenship and Shared Values*. Bradford: Bradford Education.
- Craigen, G. & White, J. (2002) *Believing and Living: A text for the WJEC GCSE Short Course*.
- Donnellan, C. (2003) *Issues: The Racism Debate*. Cambridge: Independence.
- Edwards, S. (2003) *Citizenship in Action*. Heinemann.
- European Parliament UK Office (2006) *The European Parliament: What's that? European Parliament*.
- Fageant, J. & Mercier, S.C. (1997) *Skills in Religious Studies*. Heinemann.
- Fiehn, T. et al. (2003) *this is ...citizenship studies*. John Murray.
- Firth, I. (2007) *Issues: Citizenship and National Identity*. Cambridge: Independence.
- Fisher, P. et al. (2002) *Thinking Through History*. Chris Kington Publishing.
- Fleming, M. & Worden, D. (2004) *Thinking about God and Morality*. Heinemann.
- Folens (2006) *21<sup>st</sup> Century Citizenship and PSHE*. Folens.
- Foster, J. (2000) *Your Life: The complete course for PSHE and Citizenship*. Collins.
- Gannon, M. (2002) *Changing Perspectives: Cultural Values, Diversity and Equality in Ireland and the Wider World – A Resource for Civic, Social and Political Education*.
- Gateshill, G. & Thompson, J. (2001) *Visiting Places of Worship*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Huddleston, T. & Rowe, D. (2001) *Good Thinking: Education for Citizenship and Moral Responsibility*. Evans Bros.
- Huddleston, T. (2004) *Citizens & Society: Political Literacy Resource Pack*. Citizenship Foundation/ Hodder & Stoughton.
- Jenkins, J. (2002) *Contemporary Moral Issues*. Oxford: Heinemann.
- Jerome, L. (2002a) *Citizenship for You*. Cheltenham: Nelson Thornes/ Institute for Citizenship.

- Jerome, L. (2002b) *Activate*. Cheltenham: Nelson Thornes.
- Keene, M. (2001) *New Steps in Religious Education*. Stanley Thornes.
- Learning & Skills Network (2006) *We all came here from somewhere: Diversity, identities and citizenship*. LSN.
- O'Hara, E. & Gallagher, S. (2004) *Local and Global Citizenship: For CCEA GCSE Learning for Life and Work*. Hodder & Stoughton.
- Lovelace & White (1996) *Beliefs, Values and Traditions*. Heinemann.
- Lynch, S. (1996) *Faith in the Community*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Oldham Education & Culture (nd.) *A Teaching Pack for Citizenship: Culture and Diversity – An Oldham Focus*. Oldham: Oldham Education & Culture.
- Paren, L. et al. (2003) *The Commonwealth: A Family of Nations*. London: Commonwealth Secretariat.
- Pestridge, J. (2002) *Citizens of Faith*. RE Today.
- Radcliffe, ?. (2002) *Get into Citizenship: Britain – a diverse society?* Pfp.
- Rawle, M. (2005) *Active Citizenship: A resource pack to support the community aspect of the PSE framework*. UWIC Press.
- Refugee Council (1998) *Refugees – A resource book for 5 to 11 year olds*. Refugee Council.
- Refugee Council (2002) *Credit to the nation*. Refugee Council.
- Richardson, K. (2003) *Success for Schools: GCSE Short Course – Citizenship*. Letts Educational.
- Runnymede Trust (2003) *Complementing Teachers: A Practical Guide to Promoting Race Equality in Schools*. Granada Learning/ Runnymede Trust: London.
- Rutter, J. (2004) *Refugees: We left because we had to*. London: Refugee Council.
- Save the Children (1999) *A Fight to Belong*. London: Save the Children.
- Save the Children (2002) *Young citizens*. London: Save the Children.
- Save the Children (2004) *I am Here. Teaching about refugees, identity, inclusion and the media*. Save the Children.
- Smart, D. (2000) *Citizenship in History: A guide for teachers*. Cheltenham: Stanley Thornes.
- Taylor, I. (2002) *Directions*. Nelson Thornes.

Thorpe, T. (2001) Understanding Citizenship. Citizenship Foundation/ Hodder & Stoughton.

TIDE (2001) Building new citizenship – learning from change in Derry/ Londonderry. Birmingham: Development Education Centre.

TIDE (2002a) Whose Citizenship? Report from West Midlands Commission on Global Citizenship. Birmingham: Development Education Centre.

TIDE (2002b) Whose citizenship? ... a teacher's toolkit. Birmingham: Development Education Centre.

TIDE (2003) Citizenship and Muslim Perspectives – teachers sharing ideas. London: Islamic Relief/ TIDE.

Tudor, R. (2002) Practical Resources for Teaching Citizenship in Secondary Classrooms. London: David Fulton.

Watton, V. (2005) Religion and Life. London: Hodder Murray.

Williams, B. (1997) One World, Many Issues. Stanley Thornes.

Wilson, J. (2005) Basic Skills for Life: Citizenship – Rights and Responsibilities. Shrewsbury: Axis Education.

Wright, C. (2002) Religions in the World. OUP.

Youth Action (nd) Mutual Respect DVD. Blackburn: Youth Action Publications.

## APPENDIX 2

### WEBSITES CONSULTED

Lessons on the Commonwealth

[http://news.bbc.co.uk/cbbcnews/hi/teachers/citizenship\\_11\\_14/subject\\_areas/commonwealth/default.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/cbbcnews/hi/teachers/citizenship_11_14/subject_areas/commonwealth/default.stm)

BBC's Windrush series and archive

[www.bbc.co.uk/education/archive/histfile/mystery.htm](http://www.bbc.co.uk/education/archive/histfile/mystery.htm)

GCSE RE revision material on prejudice and discrimination

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/schools/gcsebitesize/re/prejudice/index.shtm>

Lesson plans on diverse society and ethnic diversity, including Britishness and the Bradford race riots [www.bbc.co.uk/schools/teachers/ks3citizenship.shtml](http://www.bbc.co.uk/schools/teachers/ks3citizenship.shtml)

Basic facts about ten London communities (click on icon for United Colours of London) [www.bbc.co.uk/londonlive](http://www.bbc.co.uk/londonlive)

Video Nation video archive – includes clips of individuals talking about all aspects of identity [www.bbc.co.uk/videonation/category/identity/](http://www.bbc.co.uk/videonation/category/identity/)

Black history for schools [www.blackhistory4schools.com](http://www.blackhistory4schools.com)

Cultural diversity of British food and its relation to identity, stereotypes and racism [www.bl.uk/learning/](http://www.bl.uk/learning/)

Activities on refugees, asylum-seeking and immigration

[www.blss.portsmouth.sch.uk/asylum/rasgame/index.shtml](http://www.blss.portsmouth.sch.uk/asylum/rasgame/index.shtml)

Children's site exploring racism and cultural diversity [www.britkid.org](http://www.britkid.org)

Includes a comprehensive section on symbols in Northern Ireland

<http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/images/symbols/index.html>

Challenging stereotypes: What is British? / Becoming responsible citizens – challenging racism [www.chalkface.com](http://www.chalkface.com)

Web resources recording and celebrating the contributions of immigrant cultures to contemporary Britain [www.channel4.com/culture/microsites/O/origination/](http://www.channel4.com/culture/microsites/O/origination/)

Gateway to websites about Black and Asian history across Great Britain and Ireland – search by location, period of history and subject

[www.channel4.com/history/microsites/B/blackhistorymap/](http://www.channel4.com/history/microsites/B/blackhistorymap/)

An NQT teacher's scheme of work on diversity and difference

[www.citized.info/pdf/other/NQT\\_article\\_LN.pdf](http://www.citized.info/pdf/other/NQT_article_LN.pdf)

Geography unit on citizenship and the European Union [www.citizenship.org.uk](http://www.citizenship.org.uk)

Ethnic stereotypes [www.cre.gov.uk/pdfs/stereotype.pdf](http://www.cre.gov.uk/pdfs/stereotype.pdf)

Facing History and Ourselves – educational material on the history of racism, prejudice and anti-Semitism from an American perspective [www.facinghistory.org](http://www.facinghistory.org)

Flags of the world [www.flags.net/](http://www.flags.net/)

Lessons on Britishness from Morgan Stanley [www.greatbritons.org/staffroom](http://www.greatbritons.org/staffroom)

Immigration statistics to and from the UK [www.homeoffice.gov.uk](http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk)

A portrait of England - commissioned by [Culture Online](http://Culture Online) [www.icons.org.uk](http://www.icons.org.uk)

Statistics on ethnic minorities, including education results, economic, housing and black deaths in custody [www.irr.org.uk/publication/index.html](http://www.irr.org.uk/publication/index.html)

Authentic materials about Islam for children available from the Islamic Foundation in Leicestershire [www.islamic-foundation.com](http://www.islamic-foundation.com)

Links on race equality and cultural diversity in education [www.insted.co.uk](http://www.insted.co.uk)

Multicultural toys, books and educational resources [www.kidslikeme.co.uk](http://www.kidslikeme.co.uk)

Archive on migration, with many personal stories [www.movinghere.org.uk](http://www.movinghere.org.uk)

21 images of British 'icons' [www.mirrorprintstore.co.uk/pics\\_1494/British-Icons.html](http://www.mirrorprintstore.co.uk/pics_1494/British-Icons.html)

Materials on the history of Islamic civilisations, especially science and technology [www.muslimheritage.com](http://www.muslimheritage.com)

Muslim youth on-line forum [www.muslimyouth.net/forum/index.php](http://www.muslimyouth.net/forum/index.php)

Virtual books and journeys about Black and Asian presence in Britain, 1500 -1850 [www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/pathways/blackhistory/](http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/pathways/blackhistory/)

Includes RE units on tolerance and respect [www.natre.org.uk](http://www.natre.org.uk)

Local statistics, including country of birth  
[www.neighbourhood.statistics.gov.uk/dissemination/LeadHome.do;jsessionid=ac1f930dce6021770d7880145369160e2f2e5cce027.e38OaNuRbNuSbi0QahaTb3aNaNr0n6jAmIjGr5XDqQLvpAe?bhcp=1](http://www.neighbourhood.statistics.gov.uk/dissemination/LeadHome.do;jsessionid=ac1f930dce6021770d7880145369160e2f2e5cce027.e38OaNuRbNuSbi0QahaTb3aNaNr0n6jAmIjGr5XDqQLvpAe?bhcp=1)

Lesson plans on diversity and global citizenship.  
[www.oxfam.org.uk/coolplanet/teachers/globciti/lesson13.htm](http://www.oxfam.org.uk/coolplanet/teachers/globciti/lesson13.htm)

Exploring Christianity through buildings and worship [www.request.org.uk](http://www.request.org.uk)

Religious Education teaching material on race and prejudice  
[http://re-xs.ucsm.ac.uk/ethics/race\\_and\\_prejudice/index.html](http://re-xs.ucsm.ac.uk/ethics/race_and_prejudice/index.html)

Sikhism for English school students [www.sikhkids.com](http://www.sikhkids.com)

Show Racism the Red Card campaign [www.srtrc.org](http://www.srtrc.org)

Classroom activities from a US perspective [www.tolerance.org/index.jsp](http://www.tolerance.org/index.jsp)

The Commonwealth for young people [www.youngcommonwealth.org](http://www.youngcommonwealth.org)

History of the black community in Britain over 1000 years  
[www.100greatblackbritons.com/home.html](http://www.100greatblackbritons.com/home.html)

Welsh icons [www.100welshheroes.com](http://www.100welshheroes.com)