



Learning to live together

Design, monitoring and evaluation
of education for life skills, citizenship,
peace and human rights



Index

Published by:
Deutsche Gesellschaft für
Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH
Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5
Postfach 5180
65726 Eschborn
Germany

Dr. Rüdiger Blumör
Sector Project Education and Conflict Transformation
www.gtz.de

Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development
Division 311
www.bmz.bund.de

In collaboration with:
International Bureau of Education (IBE)
United Nations
Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation
CP 199
1211 Geneva 20
Switzerland
www.ibe.unesco.org



Authors:
Margaret Sinclair in collaboration with Lynn Davies,
Anna Obura and Felisa Tibbitts

Design:
Stefan Mümpfer - grafic works -

Photo:
Stephanie Hofschlaeger

Copyright © 2008

Preface	6
Foreword: Purpose of the Guide	8
INTRODUCTION	11
1.1 Are 'learning to live together', 'life skills' and active citizenship widely recognized goals for education?	11
1.2 Who is involved in developing and implementing these programmes?	13
1.3 Is this type of education applicable in emergencies and post-conflict?	14
1.4 Can peace and citizenship education stop war or create good governance?	14
1.5 Need for the Guide	14
1.6 Who is the Guide for?	16
1.7 Structure of the Guide	17
WHAT SHOULD WE BE DOING? IDENTIFYING EDUCATION GOALS AND OBJECTIVES FOR LEARNING TO LIVE TOGETHER (LTLT) AND LIFE SKILLS	18
2.1 Defining goals	19
2.2 Defining education objectives	22
2.3 The 'basic life competencies' dimension	23
2.4 Subject matter/ cross-cutting themes	25
2.4.1 Personal development and healthy relationships	
2.4.2 Conflict resolution, negotiated problem-solving techniques	
2.4.3 Unity in diversity/tolerance/appreciation of diversity, social cohesion	
2.4.4 Human rights and responsibilities	
2.4.5 Democratic principles and participation, rule of law, good governance, civil society	
2.4.6 Natural environment	
2.4.7 Over-arching: citizenship and peace education at local, national and global levels	
2.5 Building basic life competency and thematic objectives into a coherent framework for curriculum design and evaluation	40
3 HOW SHOULD WE BE DOING IT? TEACHING-LEARNING PROCESSES FOR THE LTLT/ LIFE SKILLS DIMENSION OF CURRICULUM	44
3.1 Participatory, experiential, inclusive and active classroom methodologies	46
3.2 Providing an earmarked period on the timetable	48
3.3 Participatory, inclusive and democratic principles in school life and management	51
3.4 Interactive radio instruction	52
3.5 Textbooks and other education materials that model and encourage skills, values, attitudes and behaviours for LTLT/ life skills	53
3.6 Contact between different groups	56
3.7 Matching teaching-learning methods with content and objectives	56



INDEX

4	HOW CAN WE USE OUR OBJECTIVES AND PEDAGOGIC CRITERIA TO EVALUATE CURRICULA AND TEXTBOOKS?	58
4.1	Evaluation goals	59
4.2	Evaluation processes	60
4.3	Criteria and tools	62
5	WHAT ARE THE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN EFFECTIVE NATIONAL (OR NGO) PROGRAMME?	70
5.1	Preparatory steps and consensus building	72
5.2	Strong leadership policy commitment and vision statement	73
5.3	Creation of a core development team, and committed trainers and head-teachers	73
5.4	Establishment of a network of pilot or model schools	74
5.5	Renewal and/or enrichment of curricula and teaching-learning materials, to promote LTLT/ life skills	74
5.6	Capacity building for teachers and teacher educators	75
5.7	Capacity building of regional and local managers and supervisors	76
5.8	Reinforcement through non-formal education and multiple channels of communication	76
5.9	Establishing the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) function	77
5.10	Long term commitment and funding	79
6	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF FIELD PROGRAMMES: WHAT DATA IS TO BE COLLECTED	80
6.1	The relationship of monitoring and evaluation	82
6.2	Participatory processes for organizing monitoring and evaluation activities	82
6.3	Identifying monitoring and evaluation goals, focus and questions	83
6.4	Indicators	86
6.5	Time frame for collecting evaluation data	88
6.6	The problem of attribution	89
7	DATA COLLECTION	90
7.1	Sources	91
7.2	Methods	91
7.3	Special methodological considerations	93
	7.3.1 Validity and reliability of data	
	7.7.2 Adjusting to different settings and cultures of monitoring and evaluation	
	7.7.3 Use of elicitive methods	

8	MONITORING AND EVALUATION AT SCHOOL LEVEL	98
8.1	Goals	98
8.2	M&E processes	99
	8.2.1 Collecting data in schools	
	8.2.2 Assessment processes	
	8.2.3 Measuring Change	
8.3	Criteria and tools	101
8.4	Data analysis	105
9	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF TEACHER TRAINING/ PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT	110
9.1	Goals	110
9.2	M&E processes	111
9.3	Criteria and tools	111
10	DRAWING CONCLUSIONS	116
10.1	Analysis and formatting an evaluation report	117
10.2	Reporting on impact	122
10.3	Using an evaluation report	122
10.4	Organising an exploratory or planning workshop for strengthening monitoring and evaluation of LTLT/life skills	123
ANNEXES		
ANNEX 1	CONCEPTS OF CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION	124
ANNEX 2	EXAMPLE OF A LESSON OBSERVATION SCHEDULE	131
ANNEX 3	MATCHING DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS TO EVALUATION OBJECTIVES	134
ANNEX 4	SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPACT AND OTHER INDICATORS	135
ANNEX 5	SUGGESTIONS FOR WORKSHOPS TO PLAN MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF LTLT/ LIFE SKILLS EDUCATION	140
	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	144
	REFERENCES	145
	ENDNOTES	153



Preface

The guide „Learning to Live Together – Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of Education for Life Skills, Citizenship, Peace und Human Rights“ is the outcome of a collaboration between UNESCO International Bureau of Education (IBE) and Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ). The work programme jointly organised by IBE and GTZ included seminars and planning meetings hosted by these organisations: “Determining Good Practices in Education for Learning to Live Together” (2003), “Evaluating Learning to Live Together Practices” (2004), and “Learning to Live Together: Validating Good Practices” (2007). Several participants in the seminars constituted themselves in a core group acting as intellectual resources and advisors.



Since 2004, GTZ has been implementing the sector project “Education and Conflict Transformation” on behalf of the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development. Among the tasks of the sector project are the development and application of concepts, methods and instruments for conflict transformation and the promotion of democratic conduct and peaceful coexistence in the field of basic education including Learning to Live Together.

In 2005, IBE developed its RELated database and issued a CD-ROM documenting good Learning to Live Together practice internationally. IBE also published a series of works on this theme.

We wish the guide a wide distribution and application in various situations worldwide. Feedback on how to improve the guide is most welcome and can be send to ruediger.blumoer@gtz.de, d.georgescu@unesco.org or ma.sinclair@gmail.com.

Finally, we like to thank all participants of the seminars and meetings whose minds have been plagiarised for this guide, Isabel Byron and Sobhi Tawil who initiated the work at IBE as well as the members of the core group – Lynn Davies, Anna Obura, Margaret Sinclair and Felisa Tibbitts. Without their support the guide would not exist.

Rüdiger Blumör
Sector Project Education
and Conflict Transformation, GTZ

Dakmara Georgescu
IBE

August 2008



FOREWORD: PURPOSE OF THE GUIDE



In this Guide, we focus on strengthening the curriculum dimension known as education for learning to live together (LTLT), which incorporates areas of life skills, citizenship, peace and human rights. We first argue for a holistic view of this dimension and for appropriate teaching-learning processes.

We then offer suggestions for monitoring and evaluation processes to answer one or more of the following questions - depending on circumstances:

For a traditional system:

Does our traditional schooling meet our current goals in the LTLT/life skills dimension?

For a pilot project:

Does our new LTLT/life skills initiative - in our pilot/model schools – achieve its goals?

For a system-wide initiative:

Does our recent system-wide LTLT/life skills initiative achieve its goals?

We also suggest the importance of building monitoring and evaluation of LTLT/life skills into:

- curriculum and textbook development programmes and centres
- teacher training systems
- national (or project) systems for monitoring and evaluation of schooling.

The Guide is hopefully a contribution to curriculum renewal in all societies, since we all face challenges in responding positively to the rapid changes of the twenty-first century. However, the book is designed for use even in difficult conditions - for example, in post-conflict or other situations where resources and well-trained teachers are scarce; and in a variety of cultural settings.

The Guide is addressed primarily to policy-makers and curriculum planners in national education ministries – or NGO programme managers. Educators working in diverse settings may also find it useful, if they are concerned with the contribution that education can make towards peace, active citizenship, respect for human rights, and life skills including HIV/AIDS prevention.



1

INTRODUCTION

The present Guide focuses on the theme of *'learning to live together'*, which is one of four competencies identified as important by the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century chaired by Jacques Delors.¹ This theme is important to educators because:

- Learning to live appropriately with others is important in our everyday lives – from life in the school, family and community to the special problems of adolescent relationships.
- Learning to live together in the wider society requires awareness of and respect for human rights and the responsibilities of local, national and global citizenship.
- Learning to live together as responsible citizens can help reduce tensions due to ethnic or other divisions and social disparities which contribute to the instability or civil conflict seen in many nations today.

Another term connected to this area is education for *'life skills'*, which the governments of the world committed to at the World Education Forum held in Dakar, in April 2000. Dakar saw a global commitment to Education for All goals, including: *'improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognized and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills'* (emphasis added).² Dakar's 'life skills' include many aspects of learning to live together, from adolescent interpersonal relationships that minimize risks of HIV/AIDS infection to gender equality, tolerance of diversity, and a culture of peace.³

The living together and life skills dimension of curriculum appears in school timetables in different ways. Traditionally subjects like history, geography, literature and religious education touch on civic knowledge and personal ethics, while science or health cover some aspects of life skills. Some countries have added specific 'living together' subjects on the timetable, such as citizenship or civic education, peace education, values education, life skills and social and emotional development, or have given these newer themes a specific focus within 'carrier subjects'.

Many countries, however, have not yet taken a comprehensive look at the full range of themes within the curriculum dimension of 'learning to live together' and 'life skills', needed to meet the commitments of the Dakar Forum. This dimension deals with young people's preparation for the personal, interpersonal, values and active citizenship aspects of their individual and social lives.

Through thinking about how we assess education's impact in this area, we hope to empower curriculum planners to develop or refine their curriculum framework for this personal and societal dimension of education, to design appropriate curriculum elements and education programmes, and to monitor, evaluate and improve achievements in this dimension. ***Monitoring and evaluation have been given insufficient attention, which is the reason for preparing the present Guide.***

In this introduction, we consider some frequently asked questions about this aspect of education:

- Are 'learning to live together', 'life skills', active citizenship, peace and human rights widely recognized goals for education?
- Who is involved in developing and implementing these programmes?
- Is this type of education applicable in emergencies and post-conflict?
- Can peace and citizenship education stop war or create good governance?

1.1 Are 'learning to live together', 'life skills' and active citizenship widely recognized goals for education?

Any nation which has signed up to the United Nations Charter has committed itself to *'save succeeding generations from the scourge of war'*, to *'reaffirm faith in fundamental human rights, in the dignity and worth of the human person, in the equal rights of men and women and of nations large and small,'* and to *'promoting and encouraging respect for human rights and for fundamental freedoms for all without distinction as to race, sex, language, or religion.'*⁴ Clarifying the implications of the Charter, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights states that *'Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality, and for the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship between all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.'*⁵

The almost universally ratified Convention on the Rights of the Child obliges nations to live up to these commitments.

Box 1.1

Education for peace, human rights, citizenship and life skills under the 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child

'1. States Parties agree that the education of the child shall be directed to:

- (a) The development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest level;
- (b) The development of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, and for the principles enshrined in the Charter of the United Nations;
- (c) The development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identify, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own;
- (d) The preparation of the child for responsible life in a free society, in the spirit of understanding, peace, tolerance, equality of sexes and friendship among all peoples, ethnic, national and religious groups and persons of indigenous origin;
- (e) The development of respect for the natural environment.' (Article 29)

At the World Education Forum, the world's education ministers specifically committed themselves to conducting education programmes 'in ways that promote mutual understanding, peace and tolerance, and that help to prevent violence and conflict,' ie. 'learning to live together'.

Box 1.2

Government commitments in the Dakar Framework

'Schools should be respected and protected as sanctuaries and zones of peace. Education programmes should be designed to promote the full development of the human personality and strengthen respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms as proclaimed in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Article 26). Such programmes should promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, and all ethnic and religious groups; and they should be sensitive to cultural and linguistic identities, and respectful of diversity and reinforce a culture of peace. Education should promote not only skills such as the prevention and peaceful resolution of conflict, but also social and ethical values.

Curricula based on life skills approaches should include all aspects of HIV/AIDS care and prevention... Teachers must be adequately trained, both in-service and pre-service, in providing HIV/AIDS education.' (World Education Forum, 2000: 19-20)

As noted above, education ministers at the World Education Forum explicitly committed themselves to supporting education in 'life skills', including learning to live together in ways that help prevent the spread of HIV/AIDS, one of the biggest threats to children's right to life and well-being in parts of Africa and increasingly threatening in other regions. Life skills education to

prevent HIV/AIDS, or to reduce substance abuse, aims at respectful interpersonal relationships that permit negotiation of safer lifestyles despite peer or partner pressure towards risky behaviour, – ie. ‘learning to live together’ in mutual respect. According to a recent UNICEF consultation on Life Skills Based Education, such education is designed to help young people avoid risks and take advantage of positive opportunities for participating in their society.⁶

Governments have also committed themselves to human rights education, declaring the years 1995-2004 as a United Nations Decade of Human Rights Education and following this with a World Programme for Human Rights Education.⁷ The concept of human rights education advocated under the World Programme is broad and covers most of the themes discussed in this book (see chapter 2).

In summary, education for citizenship, peace and respect for human rights as well as life skills are clearly spelled out as priority goals for the education sector – in human rights treaties as well as the Dakar Framework and the World Programme for Human Rights Education. This is the dimension, – ***about how I, the student, am leading and will lead my life as a person in relationship with others and with the wider society***, that we are concerned with in this book.

In the Guide, we frequently refer to ‘learning to live together/ life skills’, or to ‘education for citizenship, life skills, peace and human rights’, – using these terms as ‘umbrella’ titles for the personal life-preparation concerns of the Delors Commission and the Dakar Forum. By using these various titles, we hope readers will see the connection with their own education programmes and concerns.

1.2 Who is involved in developing, implementing and monitoring this dimension of education?

Any educational institution such as a school, education or community centre can develop a learning to live together, life skills, active citizenship, peace education or human rights education programme, with a locally suitable title. However, in this book we look at three levels of development work, and hope to offer useful suggestions for government staff working at these levels:

- National level: ministry of education, curriculum unit, national centre for teacher training...
- Intermediate level: university education faculties, teacher training institutions, provincial/district education offices...
- Local level: the classroom, school/other educational centre, and surrounding community.

Likewise, we hope that the Guide will be useful to other agencies supporting education programmes, including staff of UN agencies, NGOs, donors and others.

In particular, we hope to help programme managers to assess the need to strengthen this dimension of education, to build in monitoring and evaluation from the start of an initiative and to monitor and evaluate progress when specific measures have already been taken.

1.3 Is this type of education applicable in emergencies and post-conflict?

After conflict, there can be a window of opportunity to promote more peaceful ways of living, while the horrors of war are fresh in people's minds and when previous patterns of life have been disrupted. Experience shows that in post-conflict situations, people can be very much interested in education for peace and citizenship. Likewise, young people are interested in learning how to cope with heightened risk factors in their lives such as youth violence, or peer pressures for unwanted or unprotected sex, arising in a disrupted and rapidly changing society.

1.4 Can peace and citizenship education stop war or create good governance?

The UNESCO constitution states that *'Since wars begin in the minds of men, it is in the minds of men that the defences of peace must be constructed.'* The gendered (but accurate?) nature of this statement has long been commented on, but the meaning is clear: that peace is not just the absence of war but a positive process that begins in thought processes. This does not mean that even the best post-conflict education for peace, human rights and citizenship can stop a recurrence of civil conflict. However, it does suggest that one component of the post-conflict peacebuilding process should be a strengthening of the 'learning to live together' dimension of curriculum, as the contribution of education to a multi-faceted and multi-sectoral peacebuilding process. Schools have sometimes contributed to conflict, so it is important to make sure they are on the side of peace and human rights. Likewise, schools alone cannot bring about good governance but they can **contribute** to multi-faceted efforts towards this goal.

1.5 Need for the Guide

The reason for producing this Guide is that there are a number of particular problems associated with the development, monitoring and evaluation of learning to live together (LTLT) and life skills programmes, which need to be recognised.

Firstly, such programmes may have lower status than other curriculum areas, and are less easily assessed through conventional means such as examination results or access to jobs, careers or higher education. Hence there is sometimes less urgency in developing efficient and rigorous monitoring tools.

Secondly, evaluating LTLT/life skills programmes requires a broad range of indicators, instruments and tools which may not always be familiar to planners or practitioners. This Guide tries to give examples of the tools available so that planners can make suitable choices according to the programme in their country or context. We do not say that these programmes have unique methods of evaluation, but that suitable choices need to be made and some innovative methods tried.

Thirdly, LTLT programmes and the areas that might come under this umbrella can be controversial and sensitive. While 'learning to live together' sounds uncontroversial and even cosy, when this is operationalised as dealing with ethnic or religious tensions, extremism or social injustice, they may be seen as threatening. Notions of teaching human rights or democracy can be seen as too

politicised or too likely to cause students to question authority. Monitoring tools which, for example, ask students their perceptions of other ethnic groups or their knowledge of rights might in themselves be seen as causing dissent. Life skills also can be sensitive, when they touch on sexual health. The view of this Guide is that LTLT and life skills programmes should not shy away from controversial issues, but it recognizes that these need to be handled sensitively at all levels – in planning, in teaching/learning and in evaluation.

Fourthly, this area can have a wealth of interpretations, and some activities done under its name can actually be counterproductive. The history of ‘multicultural education’ shows for example that some poorly designed approaches that stress tolerance of ‘Others’ actually cement stereotypes and are likely to cause less rather than more social cohesion. Clear indicators are needed of the links between curriculum content, teaching approaches and eventual student orientations.

Fifthly, LTLT/life skills education cannot be just a curriculum programme, but one where learning occurs also in extra-curricular activities, and more importantly, across all areas of school life. There can be a disjuncture in some schools between messages in curriculum programmes and those received from the organisation or culture of the school, for example learning about non-violence in lessons but then experiencing corporal punishment, or learning about democracy but then not being permitted to participate in any major school decisions. Teacher trainees may be told to engage in experiential methods but in their own training may experience only rote learning. Evaluation therefore has to review the context of learning.

Finally, the ‘learning’ in ‘learning to live together’ may come from a variety of sources, not just the school. The learning also has very long-term goals, of a peaceful and non-violent society. Perhaps more than any other curriculum area, it can be difficult to attribute the learning (or lack of it) to an actual programme, as the outside factors will condition young people’s behaviour greatly. A peace education programme in a country torn by violence where children see and experience violence in their everyday lives will have a different impact than in a context where there is relative stability and where ‘conflict resolution’ relates to interpersonal relationships rather than to civil war. There can be a tendency therefore not to attempt any outcome assessment, particularly in contexts of instability where data gets lost and personnel change. This is the more true where budgets have not incorporated funding for monitoring and evaluation.

While there are a number of different tools for monitoring and evaluation produced by different agencies, there has not been until now a document which provides relatively simple guidance on monitoring and evaluation across the whole area of LTLT and life skills. This Guide tries to fill this gap. It is the view of the Guide that evaluation is crucial in this area, to avoid money being spent on ineffective programmes, to improve existing programmes and to identify where particular programmes may be counterproductive or at odds with other parts of the learner’s experience. While the problems outlined above are real, they are not insuperable, and this Guide tries to address them in realistic ways.

1.6 Who is the Guide for?

This Guide is designed to be useful when a government decides to assess and strengthen the contribution that schooling can make to young people's personal capacity to cope with the tasks of living together with the other people in their immediate environment (including prevention of risky health behaviours and avoiding violence) and of being constructive citizens respectful of others and supportive of human rights and good governance.

As mentioned in the Foreword, we offer suggestions for programme managers trying to answer one or more of the following questions - depending on circumstances:

For a traditional system:

Does our traditional schooling meet our current goals in the LTLT/life skills dimension?

For a pilot project:

Does our new LTLT/life skills initiative - in our pilot/model schools - achieve its goals?

For a system-wide initiative:

Does our recent system-wide LTLT/life skills initiative achieve its goals?

The Guide is designed primarily for education planners and curriculum specialists (including teacher training curriculum):

- Within the curriculum and textbooks unit of an education ministry or programme, the Guide may provide support for the sub-units or focal points responsible for the learning to live together and life skills dimension of education and its monitoring and evaluation.
- Within the monitoring and evaluation unit - or EMIS (education management information system) - of a Ministry of Education, as well as examination boards, the Guide may support the focal points responsible for assessing the learning to live together and life skills dimension of education.
- As regards planning and finance departments, a core principle of the Guide is that ***monitoring and evaluation must be understood, built in, and budgetted for right from the beginning of an initiative*** to provide or upgrade education, not just an activity that happens afterwards or when a donor asks for it.

In case special sub-units or focal points for LTLT/ life skills do not exist, the Guide provides hints as to why they are needed and what they might do.

As said, the primary audience for this book is education planners and managers who are looking at overall programmes and projects in LTLT/ life skills. We make the distinction between a broad evaluation carried out to assess outcomes or impact and the continuous monitoring which occurs to check what is happening. Such monitoring may be carried out by teachers or school principals, and hence we have included examples of such monitoring, on which the broader or final evaluation depends. If teachers find this Guide helpful, that would be good, but its intention cannot be to address all the different ways in which a teacher can assess student learning - which would be the subject of a different tool.

The Guide assumes that readers have a basic knowledge of evaluation principles and procedures. Therefore, this book does not contain detailed instructions for implementing data collection tasks. Rather, the Guide is intended to promote an appreciation of the value of monitoring and evaluation for enhancing LTLT and life skills programming, and of design issues in relation to organizing monitoring and evaluation – with awareness of the special issues inherent in carrying out monitoring and evaluation in post-conflict or fragile environments.

Some parts of the discussion can apply to various educational institutions, such as schools, teacher training colleges, youth centres or adult education centres, though the main focus is on schools. For convenience, however, we shall refer to ‘schools’ rather than ‘educational institutions’.¹⁰

1.7 Structure of the Guide

- Chapter 2 of the Guide provides with an analysis of the goals, objectives and content of learning to live together and life skills, covering basic competencies as well as their application to different subject areas.
- Chapter 3 looks at the teaching-learning challenges, for these person-centred, values-based and behaviour-focused goals.
- Chapter 4 explores curriculum evaluation, and develops a conceptual framework for the LTLT/ life skills dimension of education that is referred to throughout the Guide (Box 4.5).
- Chapter 5 examines the institutional aspects of programme design, monitoring and evaluation.
- Chapters 6 and 7 deal with technical aspects of monitoring and evaluation.
- Chapters 8 and 9 suggest some approaches to evaluation of LTLT/ life skills education in schools and teacher training institutions respectively.
- Chapter 10 explores the analysis and use of evaluation data.

Annex 1

looks in more detail at the burgeoning literature on ‘citizenship education’, which is broader than traditional ‘civic education’ and essentially is a guide to ‘learning to live together’ in society.

Annex 2

gives an example of a classroom observation format for this area.

Annex 3

shows how data collection instruments can be matched to evaluation objectives.

Annex 4

offers suggestions for impact and other indicators.

Annex 5

offers outlines for a planning workshop to utilize the monitoring and evaluation approaches suggested in the Guide.



2

WHAT SHOULD WE BE DOING? IDENTIFYING EDUCATION GOALS AND OBJECTIVES FOR LEARNING TO LIVE TOGETHER (LTLT) AND LIFE SKILLS

In Chapter 2,

we seek to identify the goals, education objectives and content of education programmes that relate to the learning to live together/life skills dimension of curriculum.

2.1 Defining goals

Most countries have national education policies or goals that include aspects of learning to live together (LTLT) and life skills. The wording and content of these titles and goals vary according to the traditions and current concerns of the particular country. This Guide uses the generic term LTLT, or LTLT/ life skills, when referring overall to this area.

In general, goals and programme titles used when a country wants to strengthen LTLT reflect recent history – specific political and historical moments. In the Guide we try to show the overlap between these goals and to advocate their broadening into a shared foundational set of LTLT/ life skills outcomes for schooling. Some examples from recent history are:

- In societies that are at peace, there may be a concern to promote constructive *citizenship* on the part of young people.
- In post-conflict situations or where there are serious divisions within a national population, there may be a stress on *peace and social cohesion*.
- In countries where a previous government had committed human rights abuses, and neglected the welfare of the population, there may be a stress on *human rights*.
- In countries where the previous government had repressed political opposition, there may be an emphasis on *democratic citizenship and the development of civil society*.
- In countries where the rule of law is weak and corruption is commonplace, there may be projects supporting *good governance*.
- Finally, in most societies there is concern about the interpersonal pressures on adolescents and youth, and this may lead to goals of *'life skills', especially for reducing risky behaviours* that may lead to HIV/AIDS infection, drug abuse, gang and other violence and in some situations, joining militias or extremist groups.

These italicized titles can each serve as an umbrella goal which will include many of the other goals as basic elements. Some titles have a narrower focus than others, - systematic evaluation will help discover whether all students are getting an education that helps achieve all the goals just noted. If we move beyond the question of title, there are more or less agreed educational goals that should appear in a national curriculum policy statement (reflected in the human rights instruments and Dakar Framework cited earlier):

Goals at personal level

- To promote young people's ability to form healthy and peaceful relationships with peers, family and community members, including avoiding risky sexual behaviours, resisting peer pressure for substance abuse, prevention of bullying and harassment, and learning how to resolve conflicts through negotiation
- To promote respect for others, tolerance, positive attitudes to diversity in society, gender sensitivity, mutual trust and understanding
- Through progress towards these intrapersonal and interpersonal goals to lay the foundation for mutual respect, justice, social inclusion and good governance in the wider society. Goals relating to the wider society

Goals relating to the wider society

- To promote equity and social justice at local, national and international levels
- To raise awareness of and commitment to human rights and responsibilities, especially the needs and rights of women, children and vulnerable groups
- To promote citizens' awareness of and participation in democratic processes and civil society, respect for the rule of law and good governance practices
- To promote cooperation in caring for the natural environment
- To promote peacebuilding and reconciliation in divided and post-conflict societies
- In summary, to promote good citizenship and peacebuilding at local, national and global levels.

Anna Obura (2007) explored the overlap between these goals, grouping them according to the emphasis on being a person helping to making the country peaceful ('peace education'), being a person helping the country function effectively ('citizenship education'), and being a person in relationship with those around one ('life skills'). The overlap in content, especially as these themes are taught at primary school and junior secondary level, is evident in Box 2.1. For example, avoiding prejudice and discriminatory behaviour comes in every category.

Box 2.1:**Overview of 'Learning to live together' clusters, programmatic areas and goals¹¹**

CLUSTER TYP	PROGRAMMATIC AREAS	GOALS
A Education for peace	1. Peace building education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • anti-violence • education for inter-group/international understanding • tolerance • reconciliation • management of truth and justice commissions • disarmament, rehabilitation
	2. Education for conflict management and transformation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • conflict prevention skills • conflict resolution skills • containing and de-escalating conflict, mediation
	3. Education for social cohesion; and development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • education for mutual understanding • education for inclusive national identity, respecting difference, welcoming diversity, pluralism multiculturalism • learning to focus on national development rather than conflict

Box 2.1:

Overview of 'Learning to live together' clusters, programmatic areas and goals¹

CLUSTER TYP	PROGRAMMATIC AREAS	GOALS
B Citizenship education	1. Citizenship education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • reduction of antisocial behaviour • civic participation • social responsibility; compassion and humanitarian acts • global and local citizenship • cooperation (in religious, ethnic, regional, gender terms)
	2. Education for democracy and social justice	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • education for equity • good governance – transparency and accountability • inclusion v. marginalisation/exclusion • regular monitoring of social indicators by social group • democratic processes and political systems • authority and power
	3. Human rights education & education for sustainable development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • knowing and respecting human, child and gender rights • identifying abuse, acting to eliminate it • international humanitarian law (Geneva Conventions) • learning to care for and respect others • health promoting behaviour • planetary and community stewardship
	4. Moral/values education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promoting peace, respect, love, tolerance, happiness, responsibility, cooperation, humility, simplicity, freedom, unity • promoting ethical values • national consciousness, internationalism • environmental awareness
C Lifeskills education	1. Life skills education & the promotion of individual well-being	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • self-awareness and self-esteem, self-control • education for personal development and empowerment • personal skills for the workplace • reduction of risky and unsociable behaviour (at individual level)
	2. Life skills education & interpersonal skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • social skills or competencies for harmonious and meaningful coexistence with others; people skills; effective communication; negotiating skills • emotional learning/emotional intelligence • empathy; avoiding prejudice
	3. Health related life skills (including HIV/AIDS prevention education)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • anti-bullying, anti-harassment • respect for the health of others • conducting non-abusive relationships • reduction of health-endangering behaviour

When defining or re-defining goals and objectives – or naming the programme, it is good practice to consult widely with national stakeholders from the fields of education, employment and civil society, including parents, women's and youth groups. Ideally the process of building consensus over learning goals can be a tool for strengthening social cohesion and (where appropriate) national unity. Similarly broad consultation is important for evaluators seeking to clarify the goals and objectives of an education programme in respect of LTLT/life skills.

2.2 Defining education objectives

The goals in the national education policy need to be translated into specific educational objectives and content, or desired outcomes, which will guide the development of the school programme as well as its evaluation. One approach here is to work with educators to identify the learning outcomes – knowledge, skills, attitudes and values – that will help students to live in relationship with other people and function effectively in the society. The term ‘competencies’ has come into use in recent years, for this complex of knowledge, skills, attitudes and values.¹²

Box 2.2 OECD’s key competencies

The ‘key competencies’ identified as crucial for education in the twenty-first century by the OECD comprise:

- Using tools interactively (literacy, numeracy, technology etc)
- Interacting in heterogenous groups (interpersonal)
- Acting autonomously (intra-personal, decision-making).¹³

Several countries have recently undertaken an analysis of desired learning outcomes with technical support from UNICEF, with a focus on ‘life skills’. These outcomes are grouped into themes or strands, which can be built into the curriculum throughout the years of schooling.¹⁴ They can also contribute to the conceptual framework for evaluating existing curricula and school programmes.

There are many ways of classifying the skills, values and content areas that should form part of a child’s preparation for learning to live together and to face the risks that confront young people and take advantage of the life opportunities that are open to them. For simplicity of presentation, we shall group the education objectives along two dimensions, and then look at their inter-relationship:

- (a) ***Basic life competencies, including ‘social and emotional learning’.***
- (b) ***The fields in which we exercise our basic life competencies, for example democratic citizenship or healthy adolescent relationships – which can be ‘subjects’ and/or cross-cutting themes.***

2.3 The 'basic life competencies' dimension

When we look at the personal competencies needed for citizenship, conflict resolution, dealing with peer pressure and so on, we find that learning to interact in heterogenous groups and learning to act autonomously are needed, as well as certain cognitive skills. Educators in the Collaborative for Academic, Social and Emotional Learning (CASEL) among others have worked to systematize these learning goals, and use a 'social and emotional competencies' categorization based on five personal competency areas:

- Self awareness
- Self- management
- Relationship management.
- Social awareness
- Responsible decision-taking.¹⁵

Box 2.3

Social and emotional learning standards, State of Illinois, USA:¹⁶

1. Develop self awareness and self-management skills to achieve school and life success
2. Use social-awareness and interpersonal skills to establish and maintain positive relationships
3. Demonstrate decision-making skills and responsible behaviours in personal, school and community contexts

In the present Guide, the basic competencies relating to learning to live together have been categorized as interpersonal, intrapersonal and cognitive, similar to the OECD categories, and as used in skills-based health education, peace education etc.¹⁷ These distinctions are useful for purposes of exposition, even though each element requires the presence of the others. For example:

- Politely 'assertive' communication (interpersonal) draws upon emotional awareness (inter- and intra-personal) and may require management of one's anger or fear (intrapersonal), and cognitive skills to develop a negotiating position.
- 'Critical thinking' (cognitive) about governance overlaps with empathy for other citizens (interpersonal), especially those in difficulties. It requires students to search for different possibilities, and may require 'critical disrespect'¹⁸ – for example, where an inherited culture now serves to undermine human rights.

Box 2.4.**Typical categorisation of 'basic competency' objectives for programmes such as citizenship education, peace education, human rights education, life skills education—including HIV/AIDS prevention****Interpersonal objectives**

- › To understand self and others: accepting similarities and differences, awareness that personal identity is multifaceted (or 'hybrid')
- › To strengthen empathy
- › To lessen bias and prejudice, and promote inclusion not exclusion, fairness/justice/non-discrimination
- › To strengthen respect for others and for their needs (basics for survival and security, 'belonging'/love, esteem of self and others, sense of meaning in life)
- › To strengthen interpersonal communication skills, especially empathic two-way communication
- › To promote cooperation and teamwork (including in heterogenous groups)
- › To develop assertive communication/refusal skills
- › To develop skills for negotiation/mediation/conflict resolution
- › To develop advocacy skills

Intrapersonal objectives

- › To enhance awareness of one's own emotions
- › To strengthen emotional self-management eg of anger, grief, stress
- › To increase personal confidence and self-esteem/self-respect

Cognitive objectives

- › To analyse and solve problems (problems involving people)
- › To strengthen skills for decision-making (decisions involving own life, and other people)
- › To develop 'critical thinking' skills (especially in the societal and civic context).

Cross-cutting

- › Personal and interpersonal 'pro-social' values and attitudes (love, compassion, honesty, sharing, fairness, inclusion, etc)

Developing complex social-emotional-cognitive competencies is much more difficult than teaching factual knowledge. Social and emotional learning has to build on and sometimes reorient the prior experience and life competencies of students, so that they not only learn to cooperate with others and resolve conflicts peacefully but want to do so (pro-social attitudes and values). Developing these competencies requires active learning approaches, - for example brainstorming, special 'games', role plays or skits, - followed by open discussion in which students can explore and develop their own personal perspectives and values (see chapter 3). The competencies need to be explicitly developed as such and applied to the various subject matter themes relevant to LTLT and life skills.

Box 2.5

The importance of values

Communication, problem-solving and negotiation skills can be used for good or bad purposes – e.g. organizing humanitarian relief, crime, violence or war. This Guide is concerned with ‘pro-social’ skills – skills built in relation to caring for and respecting other human beings, and minimizing or preventing the use of violence. In some countries, there has been a concern that schooling has become too immersed in facts and cognitive skills and has lost sight of values; hence courses such as values clarification or ‘living values’ have been introduced. Education in personal and inter-personal values may be introduced as a separate feature, or taken as a cross-cutting element.¹⁹

If we now look at the monitoring and evaluation of the strengthening of these competencies as in Box 2.4, we can see the range of methods which might be appropriate.

- Cognitive objectives relating to knowledge may be measured through a written tool, whereas for problem-solving or negotiation skills in the LTLT/ life skills area the best illustration would be how people respond in a real situation, -which would require observation, students’ own narratives or self-reports, – or other evidence on attitudes and behaviour.
- ‘Empathy’ could be assessed through interview, through the observation of a peer mediation session, or through a carefully constructed questionnaire item. The choice would depend in part on whether a broad survey was wanted or a deeper and possibly more valid exploration which tried to establish why a student did or did not feel empathy for another, and what effect a programme had had on that feeling.

A key point to make here is that monitoring and evaluation is never perfect, and the aim should be to be ‘good enough’ – to get some flavour of what has occurred in and out of a programme and to ensure that some attempt has been made to operationalise and agree on what is meant by terms such as ‘empathy’ or ‘autonomy’.

2.4 Subject matter/ cross-cutting themes

Educators who have reflected on LTLT/life skills for the twenty-first century tend to agree on some core themes or strands which need to be included, although the titles used vary according to local circumstances, as noted above. The topics can be grouped in many different ways, for example human rights can be taught as part of education for democracy and vice versa. In the list presented in Box 2.6, the terms citizenship education, peace education and life skills education are omitted, since they are often used as ‘umbrella’ titles, to cover most of the themes mentioned. Please note that the groupings used in the box are arbitrary and can be adapted according to national or local priorities.

Box 2.6.**Thematic objectives in learning to live together and life skills**

Strengthening understanding of, skills for, and commitment to (attitudes and valuing):

- Personal development, healthy relationships (including refusal skills for unsafe sex and substance abuse, anti-bullying), safety
- Conflict resolution, cooperative problem-solving
- Unity in diversity (tolerance/appreciation of diversity/preventing inter-group hostilities)
- Human needs, rights and responsibilities –especially the rights of children, women and marginalized groups; humanitarian law
- Civic roles: participation, democratic processes, rule of law, civil society, good governance, peacebuilding
- Care of the natural environment
- Overarching (spatial): local, national and global dimensions of citizenship and peacebuilding

We now look at these themes in more detail in terms of their specific objectives and the indicators which could be used for monitoring and evaluation.

2.4.1 Personal development and healthy relationships

Personal development. Objectives relating to personal development, especially social and emotional development, largely coincide with the basic life competencies in section 2.3. Basic life competencies, if learned explicitly in relation to personal behaviour, are at the conscious disposal of the students for application to wider concerns such as civic duties.

- For young children, LTLT and life skills education focuses strongly on basic competencies, such as affirmation of other children, respect, sharing, communication, cooperation, not being violent, reconciliation after quarrels.
- For older students, these themes remain important, and they can be constantly reinforced through the areas of application mentioned below, such as dealing with peer pressure relating to sexual behaviour, drug abuse etc, as well as responsible participation in community and society.
- Competencies should be developed and continually renewed for preventing and responding to bullying, which is a problem in many schools.²⁰
- These activities may be presented in the context of education in personal values such as love, compassion, cooperation etc. which will serve as the foundation for later study of human rights and the rights of the child.

Box 2.7 illustrates a possible evaluation question, based on the type of questions used international and national citizenship education surveys, as do several other Boxes in this chapter.²¹

Box 2.7

Evaluating skills, attitudes and behaviour: example

If someone is being bullied, what do you do?

- ? Walk away
- ? Join in the bullying
- ? Be a bystander and watch
- ? Intervene, with the help of others if needed
- ? Report to a teacher or other adult

Healthy relationships. Education for HIV/AIDS prevention is often a key objective, because of the magnitude of the crisis in many countries, and requires a skills-based approach using negotiation and refusal skills.²² Education for avoidance of health risks associated with substance abuse is likewise a priority in many societies.

- *Skills for health*, jointly published in 2003 by WHO, UNICEF, UNESCO, UNFPA and the World Bank, links basic competencies (for interpersonal communication, empathy building, negotiation and refusal, cooperation, advocacy, decision-making, critical thinking and managing stress) to avoiding risky health behaviours and violence.
- The HIV/AIDS education materials developed by UNESCO and WHO (1994) emphasise assertiveness and refusal skills, applied to negotiation between young people when one asks another for unwanted or unprotected sex.
- An evaluation study of HIV/AIDS education found that repeated practice in negotiation statements and responses (practising what exactly to say) is essential, to enable the young person to master and use the negotiation techniques in real life (Kirby et al., 2006).

The competency objectives used in 'Skills for Health' can guide curriculum design or programme evaluation (see examples in Box 2.8).²³

Box 2.8

Selected objectives from the inter-agency guide, 'Skills for Health' (WHO, 2003: 10-11), showing basic competencies applied to health themes

Sexual and reproductive health

Students can observe and practise ways to:

- (communication skills): 'effectively express a desire not to have sex; influence others to abstain from sex or practise safe sex using condoms if they cannot be influence to abstain'
- (negotiation/refusal skills): 'refuse sexual intercourse or negotiate the use of condoms'
- (advocacy skills): 'present arguments for access to sexual and reproductive health services and counselling for young people'

>>

Box 2.8

Selected objectives from the inter-agency guide, 'Skills for Health' (WHO, 2003: 10-11), showing basic competencies applied to health themes

Alcohol, tobacco and other drugs

- (inter-personal skills): 'support persons who are trying to stop using tobacco and other drugs'
- (decision-making skills): 'weigh the consequences against common reasons young people give for using alcohol or tobacco'.

For evaluation purposes, the phrase 'Students can observe and practise ways to..' may be replaced by 'Can students...? The responses can be categorised, giving indicators such as 'Percentage of students who can...'

Safety and violence prevention. Safety concerns are diverse, e.g.:

- Are students careful around potential weapons (e.g. guns, knives) that can harm others as well as the students themselves?
- Are students aware of hazards from landmines and unexploded ordnance and safety measures (involves listening to and communicating life-saving information)
- Are children aware of environmental hazards? (eg communication about unprotected wells)
- Are children appropriately prepared to protect themselves from physical, verbal and sexual abuse?

Violence prevention programmes have come to prominence in the USA with recent school shootings, but school and youth violence is a problem in many countries. Gangs and militia groups make life difficult in many settings. And the new generation needs to turn against gender-based violence in the home, which fills life with fear for many millions of women and their children.

This range of concerns means equally varied ways of tackling the issue as well as different ways of evaluating teaching and learning. Safety concerns and programmes around landmines or environmental hazards can be evaluated through a knowledge- and skills-based assessment; while the violence prevention objectives are much longer term, and require attitudinal evaluation as well as monitoring of violent incidents in a school.

Box 2.9

Planning violence prevention interventions: setting goals, objectives and targets²⁴

Outcome objectives (targets)

- By (date) the number of incidents involving acts of physical violence among persons at school will be reduced by at least ___%.
- By (date), students' ability to describe the major principles and methods of non-violent conflict resolution will have improved by ___% over baseline.
- By (date), the amount of school absenteeism due to fear of going to and from schools will be reduced by ___ %.
- By (date), school policies and procedures will be established to ensure non-violent forms of discipline.

Box 2.9

Planning violence prevention interventions: setting goals, objectives and targets

Process objectives (targets)

- By (date), a Violence Prevention Task Force, including members of the School Health Committee, students, parents and community resource persons, will have been established.
- By (date), all school staff will receive three hours of training on the principles and methods of education for peace.
- By (date), a violence prevention curriculum will be provided to all students in (specify grade levels)...

Note: the evaluator can use the middle part of such targets as indicators eg 'the number of incidents involving acts of physical violence among persons at school'.

Leach and Mitchell's book *Combating Gender Violence In and Around Schools* (2006) gives examples of a number of programmes or strategies designed to combat gender-based violence and challenge the aggressive masculinities involved. It illustrates the complexity of evaluating attitude change in this sensitive area (Box 2.10).

Box 2.10

Examples of programmes to combat gender violence, and their evaluation (from Leach and Mitchell, 2006)

- A documentary video called **Unwanted Images: Gender-based violence in the new South Africa** used pupil drawings which depicted school-based sexual violence, including homophobic violence. The aim was to generate discussion among those students providing the graphic and disturbing artwork as well as the wider audience seeing the video. The impact was assessed through response of audiences and the demand for its showing in a wide range of international arenas.
- Other projects aimed to raise HIV/AIDS awareness with young men, including gender roles and sexual violence, sometimes using peer educators. Boys were encouraged to talk about violence they had seen, experienced or inflicted. The programmes were evaluated through regular feedback sessions where boys told stories of significant change, such as using condoms, but also through interviews with their partners who told of, for example, being able to refuse sex without being afraid of abuse.
- A project with adolescents in South Asia used films about masculinities. Before the screenings, the facilitators raised questions and generated discussion, and afterwards used a series of impact-assessment discussions to see whether the messages of the films had been retained and internalized and whether they had changed viewers' attitudes. After one film, for example, most boys in the workshop felt they needed to reexamine their opinions about women. The point was made however that evaluation was done immediately post-screening, but should preferably be done some weeks later, to assess longer-term changes in attitudes and processes of reflection – both pre-requisites for behaviour change.
- Follow up and evaluation are needed to align programmes to education objectives: in one rural secondary school in South Africa a group of boys produced a documentary ostensibly to counteract rape. But the video appeared to glorify rape, and it positioned sexuality as either abstinence or rape and nothing else. 'So without follow-up, video intervention could do more harm than good'. Using this concept as part of future discussion, however, in order to interrogate dominant forms of masculinity meant that the video 'could become its own tool of advocacy'.

We now look separately, in section 2.4.2 below, at one of the violence reduction areas -education in non-violent approaches to the prevention of conflict through negotiated solutions to problems.

2.4.2 Conflict resolution, negotiated problem-solving techniques

An increasing number of education programmes teach specific skills for conflict prevention and resolution. For example, there can be systematic study of conflict resolution modalities, including six-step or similar approaches to problem-solving and finding win-win solutions. Conflict resolution education is gaining increased curriculum space in developed countries at this time as well as in some post-conflict societies, partly in response to school violence.²⁵ Conflict resolution education begins with problems in daily life and personal relationships, and feeds into more 'macro' concerns as the child gets older, including issues of peace, reconciliation and social cohesion.

Responding to the large numbers of civil conflicts in the 1990s, both UNHCR and UNICEF developed a competencies-based approach to education for conflict prevention for use with conflict-affected populations.²⁶ The UNHCR 'Peace Education Programme' for primary and junior secondary students and adults was adopted as a generic resource by the Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies including UNESCO and UNICEF. The set of competencies in Box 2.11, was developed initially for refugee or internally displaced as well as other conflict-affected populations. In reconstruction situations, the programme links with human rights and citizenship elements to support the process of peacebuilding.

Box 2.11

Curriculum framework for the INEE Peace Education/Conflict Prevention Programme

(repeated with different activities and applications for each year of schooling from grade 1 to 8, and used with youth and/or adults for community education)

- Understanding similarities and differences (for older children, exclusion and inclusion)
- Active listening
- Better communication (two-way)
- Handling emotions
- Understanding that perceptions vary and avoiding bias
- Understanding others' situation and feelings (empathy practice)
- Cooperation
- Appropriate assertiveness
- Problem analysis and problem solving
- Negotiation
- Mediation
- Conflict resolution (with conflict transformation and reconciliation)
- Human rights
- What have you learned about peace?

Health educators regard violence prevention and conflict resolution as key life skills (Box 2.12). Learning these skills at personal level may help build understanding of how problems can be solved through compromise at community and national level.

Box 2.12

Selected objectives from the inter-agency guide, 'Skills for Health' (2003), - showing basic competencies applied to theme of violence prevention or peace education

Students can observe and practise ways to:

(communication skills): 'state their position clearly and calmly without blaming; listen to each others' point of view'; communicate positive messages; use 'I' statements (so as) not to accuse others'

(managing stress): 'identify and implement peaceful ways of resolving conflict; resist pressure from peers and adults to engage in violent behaviour'

(decision-making and critical thinking skills for violence prevention): 'identify and avoid situations of conflict; evaluate both violent and non-violent solutions that appear to be successful as depicted in the media; analyse their own stereotypes, beliefs and attributions that support violence'.

(negotiation skills): 'intervene and discourage others from conflict before it escalates'.

For evaluation purposes, the phrase 'Students can observe and practise ways to..' may be replaced by 'Can students...?' The responses can be categorised, giving indicators such as 'Percentage of students who can...'

For examples of evaluation as applied to peace education programmes for schools (including conflict resolution, appreciation of diversity etc), see later chapters of the present Guide, and other guidelines and examples such as Fountain (2002), Ashton (2000, 2007a,b), Obura (2002), Salomon and Nevo (2002).

2.4.3 Unity in diversity/tolerance/appreciation of diversity/social cohesion

Acceptance of others is critical in countries with serious social divisions, for example ethnic divisions that correlate with social and economic differences.

Box 2.13

Dangers of a narrow concept of identity

It is dangerous to think of ourselves as having just one or two fixed identities such as ethnicity or gender, and then treat people of another identity group as an 'out-group' and not deserving of respect. For example, during periods of political or economic crisis, religious or ethnic groups that had lived peacefully together, suddenly follow ambitious and prejudiced leaders into thinking that their own 'in-group' is all that matters, and that the lives and property of 'out-group' members can be destroyed at will (Tawil and Harley, 2004). This may be a reaction to a period of stability when another group had assumed its own right to superior wealth and privileges.

It also happens that male leaders, police and judiciary often regard violence against women and children in the home or elsewhere as acceptable, seeing them as a low status 'outgroup' (UNICEF, 2000; UNIFEM, 2003).

The educational approach is to give students the conscious experience that we all have overlapping multiple personal identities, sharing some characteristics with people from different social groups. For example, a particular human being can simultaneously have the identities of being:

- Female
- Kenyan
- of Somali ethnicity
- Muslim
- teacher
- parent
- (adult) child caring for elderly parent
- spouse
- dress-maker
- musician
- internet surfer, etc.

Since human beings have multifaceted identity, we need to be careful about simple commands to be tolerant of others who are 'different', as this can ignore their complexity and their similarities to 'us'.²⁷ As an education goal, 'appreciation of diversity' is more positive than tolerance.

Learning about 'unity in diversity' also involves seeing things from different perspectives and recognizing that apparently hostile groups have different 'narratives' which seem correct from their respective points of view.²⁸ This may be done through analysis of stories, role plays and real life situations, leading to reflection that these different narratives exist in one's daily life, and within each well-defined group in society.

Adolescents cannot suddenly create social cohesion, even if they come to understand the narrative of other groups in their society. However, they can be introduced to and practise perspective-taking – narrating and empathizing with different and sometimes conflicting viewpoints - and asked to brainstorm ways in which they can help bring this approach into their social life and eventually into national thinking and values.

Box 2.14

Teaching and assessing awareness of multiple identity: some suggestions

Tell me six things (or as many things as you can) about yourself that are part of your identity.

Which of the following are part of your sense of identity?

- A. Gender (boy or girl)
- B. Region, clan or tribe
- C. Getting wet when there is heavy rain
- D. Liking sport, music or dance
- E. Religion
- F. Feeling thirsty on a hot day
- G. Supporting a football team like Man United or Real Madrid

What parts of your identity do you share with:

(For boys) A boy in China (or other far country)?

(For girls) A girl in China (or other far country)?

(List some of the things about you and the other child that are alike.)

2.4.4 Human rights and responsibilities

The human rights framework established in international law provides us with principles and standards that should be learned about and applied in daily life as well as by governments. 'Education for human rights' is based on widely shared values - such as respect for all human beings - acknowledged by the international community and applied to civil, political, social, economic and cultural aspects of social organisation.²⁹

The Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights defines human rights education as "training, dissemination and information efforts aimed at the building of a universal culture of human rights through the imparting of knowledge and skills and the moulding of attitudes directed to:

- (a) the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms
- (b) the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity
- (c) the promoting of understanding, tolerance, gender equality and friendship among all nations, indigenous peoples and racial, national, ethnic, religious and linguistic groups
- (d) the enabling of all persons to participate effectively in a free society. (UNHCHR, 1997).

It is helpful to realize that no country has achieved a perfect human rights record. The human rights discourse is a way of setting out ideals and then working step-by-step towards a better future for all and for conditions where no-one is discriminated against.

Part of this process involves public awareness of the nature of human rights and the obligations of governments to promote and protect them. A human rights culture in school involves not only learning about these principles but becoming aware that one's personal behavior should also reflect respect for human rights. This depends upon respectful behaviour between individuals. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights obliges us to respect everyone's rights, and states that *'Everyone has duties to the community' and 'should act towards one another in the spirit of brotherhood.'*

Respect for others in the context of LTLT programming involves actively learning about vulnerable groups within the society, gaining respect for them, and helping involve them in the process of education including human rights education. They include groups that have been historically discriminated against (e.g. girls, ethnic groups) and marginalized groups such as out-of-school children, families affected by AIDS, persons with disability, exploited children, children recruited by military forces, etc.

More formally, human rights treaties oblige participating governments to show responsibility to everyone within their territories, meeting those human rights standards that are obligatory in all circumstances (such as non-discrimination and prevention of torture) as well as making efforts to achieve human rights standards that are progressive (such as extending access to schooling and higher education). Human rights education requires thoughtful analysis of the degree to which human rights are being respected in the child's environment and ways in which action can be taken to help address any gaps that are identified.

Human rights education for schools has to be adapted to the age of the students and to national and local education policies. Box 2.15 shows goals and concepts for younger children as identified by Flowers (1998).

Box 2.15**Typical goals of human rights education at primary school³⁰**

	Goals	Key concepts
Age 3-7	Respect for self Respect for parents and teachers Respect for others	Self Community Responsibility
Age 8-11	Social responsibility Citizenship Distinguishing wants from needs	Individual rights Group rights Freedom Equality Justice Rule of law Government Security Democracy.

Human rights education makes reference to key international human rights standards, such as the 1948 *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* and the 1989 *Convention on the Right of the Child*.

Box 2.16**'Rights Respecting Schools'**

UNICEF's Rights Respecting Schools (RRR) is a promising initiative which has developed from work in Nova Scotia and in the UK, premised on using the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) as a basis for all school life and ethos. In a Rights Respecting School (RRS) all children, teachers, ancillary staff and parents learn about the Convention and what this means for relationships and for learning. Key to this is obviously the twinning and reciprocity of rights and responsibilities: that if I have the right to something, I have the responsibility to accord you that right, and you have the same right and the same responsibility towards me. If I have the right to education, then you have the responsibility to help ensure I get this right, or at least not hinder it. So, in behavioural terms, if I have the right to education and learning, you should not hinder this right by behaving badly and preventing me from listening – and vice versa.

One aspect is the distinguishing of personal identity and action. Singular, ascribed identities can be replaced by hybrid, fluid and conditional ones (the importance of which was mentioned above). In Rights Respecting Schools, each day is a fresh day, in that behaviour is dealt with as it relates to rights, on that day, ideally without reference to previous infringements, avoiding stereotyping a child –'you always...', you never...'. Children are not given permanent behavioural identities – difficult of course, with persistent 'offenders', but at least the teachers try. Instead behaviours are examined in terms of how they affect others on that day – preventing them from learning, infringing their rights to play, infringing their right to protection from harm. The use of the Convention permeates not just behaviour policy but also curriculum, in terms of thinking about the rights of the child when, for example, examining global issues such as water, health, HIV/AIDS, or child labour.

Box 2.16

'Rights Respecting Schools'

Evaluation is internal and external. Schools apply for awards at two levels, and are assessed by UNICEF officers or partners who talk to children, teachers, parents and governors, observe lessons if invited and generally soak up the atmosphere. The visitors start by asking everyone to 'show me how you are a RRR', but this is matched against benchmarks for teachers/ adults/ community and for pupils. The benchmarks fall into four areas:

- knowledge and understanding of the CRC and its relevance to school ethos and curriculum
- teaching and learning styles and methods commensurate with knowledge and understanding of children's rights
- pupils actively participating in decision-making throughout the school
- committed leadership building a rights-based school ethos through strategic direction and appropriate professional development.

Significantly, the final benchmark, under the fourth category, is that '**pupils are empowered to work for change in the full awareness of how the CRC is a major instrument for improvements in children's lives worldwide**' – that is, indication of an active global citizenship role as well as that within the school.³¹

It is also important to raise awareness of International Humanitarian Law (IHL) and the *Geneva Conventions*. IHL comprises rights and responsibilities that are specific to the context of armed conflict, including treatment of civilians, wounded combatants and prisoners of war. Many countries are involved in war, - if only through providing peacekeeping troops. The International Committee of the Red Cross and Red Crescent (ICRC) has developed pedagogically excellent study modules for secondary students and youth called *Exploring humanitarian law*, which are being piloted in many countries. In countries which have recently experienced armed conflict, it might be useful to introduce elements of this programme in upper primary as well as secondary classes, given that many primary school students may be adolescents – due to interruptions in their education. *Exploring humanitarian law* introduces rights and responsibilities specific to the context of armed conflict, with goals such as the welfare of non-combatants.³²

2.4.5 Democratic principles and participation, rule of law, good governance, civil society

Democratic principles and participation. Students learn group participation through active learning methods in class: good teachers call on them without discrimination to contribute to class discussion or special activities such as role plays and debates. Students can learn specifics of democratic participation in decision-making through suitable structured activities such as:

- electing representatives for and serving on class and school councils
- participating or being represented in governing bodies
- being members of behaviour or discipline panels
- giving feedback on teaching-learning activities
- service learning and advocacy.

Increasingly students are taking part in decisions on teaching and learning itself, and are learning skills of giving constructive feedback to teachers on their teaching, preparation, interactions with different types of students etc.³³ Lessons and whole school activities focused on solving contemporary problems can lead to human rights advocacy and active citizenship, for example through helping vulnerable families and children, advocating for girls' education or safer sexual practices, etc.

Box 2.17**Elections and democracy**

Democratic elections for government can be introduced as part of the introduction to the constitution and functioning of the state. Examples from other countries may be useful also, –given the globalization of news, as well as possible weaknesses or changes in democratic processes in the country concerned.

It is very important (especially in post-conflict and fragile countries) to link the idea of voting in elections with the rule of law, the rights of minorities and the concept of non-discrimination. Elected representatives and government officials are not 'above the law'. Respect for the dignity and human rights of all human beings sets the framework within which rule by elected officials and representatives is situated. This aspect of the constitution needs emphasis especially where democratic processes are relatively new. Majority rule is constrained by the rights of all.

If one goal is the promotion of democracy, then a monitoring and evaluation exercise might be developed around questions such as:

- (Concepts) Do students learn that democratic principles are intended to protect the rights of each and every person?
- (Concepts) Do students learn that the majority must act within laws and norms protecting minorities, both for ethical reasons and to build a prosperous and stable society?
- (Analysis) Can students analyse the democratic processes officially endorsed by their country, together with specific examples from other countries, chosen to show a range of approaches (types of representation, use of referenda, unitary and federal structures, etc)?.
- (Analysis) Can students explain when democratic processes are or are not appropriate ?– for example, if the school is burning down, this is not the time to call a consultative meeting to decide the response.
- (Analysis/advocacy) Can students make a case for greater democracy in the school?
- (Experiential practice) Are democratic principles are being illustrated in the school, through consultative procedures and mechanisms used in classrooms and school councils etc.? How do students act within the 'democracy' of the school?

Box 2.18**Examples of questions on democratic citizenship for written tests and questionnaires****Factual and conceptual knowledge**

Are the following statements true or false?

- (a) The age at which you can vote in government elections is X
- (b) The voting system in our country is XYZ
- (c) The president has the power to do XYZ
- (d) The local and national elections must be held after (not more than) X years.

Box 2.18**Examples of questions on democratic citizenship for written tests and questionnaires**

Which of the following are essential characteristics of free and fair elections?

- (a) Secret ballot
- (b) All candidates can state their views freely
- (c) Good food is provided by candidates at election meetings
- (d) Bright flags and decorations are displayed at election meetings
- (e) Voters are frightened of electing someone not from the government party (or someone locally powerful)

Which of the following are characteristics of democratic government? XYZ (local examples of right and wrong answers)

Attitudes, beliefs and behaviour

How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements? (tick column for agree/disagree or strongly disagree/disagree/neither agree or disagree/agree/strongly agree)

A good adult citizen is someone who:

- (a) Votes in elections
- (b) Obeys the law
- (c) Never studies the news (broadcasts or newspapers) or discusses political issues
- (d) Plays football or other team games
- (e) Pollutes the environment
- (f) Joins a political party
- (g) Helps people who are in difficulties

When I am old enough, I will:

- (a) Vote in national elections
- (b) Vote in local elections
- (c) Join a political party
- (d) Do voluntary work to help others
- (e) Collect money to help others

Participation

In the last year, have you taken part in any of the following organized activities (i) in school, or (ii) out of school?

- (a) Clubs or groups (such as...)
- (b) Activities (helping with community work, helping other students, working on a school magazine...)
- (c) Voting in a school, class or club election
- (d) Helping organize these activities

A useful guide to school evaluation of education for democratic citizenship was developed by Birzea et al. (2005) for the Council of Europe (see chapter 8 below, Box 8.3).³⁴

Rule of law applies to the behaviour of government institutions and to numerous transactions in society, -even using the road according to the local rules, and with due care and attention. Sometimes law courts and policing are ineffective and traditional laws can be applied more quickly and effectively (acceptable if human rights, including the rights of women, are observed).

Elements of legal education can be included as part of LTLT. For example, older students can learn the skills of working out when and how the best action is taken with regard to the law, and the procedures to follow when a change of law is to be advocated (for example again with regard to women's rights). Bribery and corruption are indicators of weakness in the rule of law, especially where they deprive the poor of access to needed services. Analysis of the effects of corruption would form part of the LTLT programme at secondary level, while maintaining some idealism that there can be change in such a culture.

The concept of *good governance* can be incorporated in citizenship education programmes. Besides the conduct of regular, well organised, free and fair elections, good governance includes principles such as participation, fairness, decency, accountability, transparency and efficiency, in arenas such as civil society, political society, national and local government, bureaucracy, economic society, and the judiciary/rule of law (ODI, 2007). These topics (including awareness of their opposites such as corruption or vote rigging) are important for older students, as part of democratic and voter education. Evaluation of such aspects might include attitude questionnaires to students about whether they intend to vote, whether voting makes any difference and whether and how they might encourage others to take part in the governance process at local levels;

Box 2.19

'Backwards mapping'

Some evaluations use 'backwards mapping' to see whether people who are active in local or national governance have been exposed to specific citizenship or civic education programmes at school. These can be useful in persuading decision-makers of the importance of certain types of school activity. It has been found for example that people who are involved in volunteer work are more likely to have been engaged in service learning or in participatory activities in governance at school.³⁵

Civil society refers to community-based organizations, NGOs and other groups that work to meet the needs of their members or of the society as a whole. Some LTLT programmes will be concerned to introduce students to this aspect of the world around them and to learn how they can contribute. Students can participate in school committees and clubs (if their other commitments permit), and in groups outside the school.³⁶ There is a growing emphasis on 'service learning' or 'community service' which aims to build habits of service and of feeling a responsibility to one's community, as well as enhancing decision-making skills. Often, the evaluations of such programmes find that other benefits ensue such as self-confidence, time management, empathy etc.³⁷ Conversely, community groups and NGOs can be asked to introduce themselves during school lessons or otherwise, and can encourage older students to participate.³⁸

Box 2.20

Civil society participation: example of questions for student interviews or written surveys

(Knowledge) What are some examples of non-governmental organisations?

(Attitudes) How much do you agree or disagree with the following statements?

- (a) Doing organised voluntary work may help me get a good job
- (b) My friends think that voluntary work is only for old people
- (c) My friends enjoy attending school clubs

2.4.6 Natural environment

Many of the issues arising under conflict resolution, human rights and responsibilities, citizenship etc will relate to the environment, as communities struggle to get the water, foods, fuel, transport and other necessities of their lives, as well as access to adequate education and health services. Nevertheless, it is important to specifically highlight the environment as a challenge to the young people and their descendants. 'Sustainable development' means that the welfare of the next generation should not be sacrificed to meet the needs of the current population: national policies and individual behaviour should support both. A simple example is tree planting that includes fast growing trees for fuelwood and fruit-bearing trees that will benefit the next generation. The UN Decade for Education for Sustainable Development (2005-2014) is based on these principles, and clearly relates to 'learning to live together':

'Education for Sustainable Development is fundamentally about values, with respect at the centre: respect for others, including those of present and future generations, for difference and diversity, for the environment, for the resources of the planet we inhabit. Education enables us to understand ourselves and others and out links with the wider natural and social environment, and this understanding serves as a durable basis for building respect. Along with a sense of justice, responsibility, exploration and dialogue, Education for Sustainable Development aims to move us towards adopting behaviours and practices which enable all to live a full life without being deprived of basics.'

2.4.7 Over-arching: citizenship and peace education at local, national and global levels

The twenty-first century sees a nascent ethic where the human rights of all are of concern to all, and where personal, citizenship, governmental and corporate responsibilities are seen as local, national and global. School should open students' minds to this local/global aspect of the modern world, – the wider picture can hopefully put local problems into perspective.

Local citizenship and peacebuilding can be strengthened through community service and other local activities (designed to encourage friendly relations and cooperation between different social groups, eg through football matches and cultural activities which cross ethnic or other divisions). Interesting connections can be made here. For example in one of UNICEF's programmes in Kenya, girls' football is supported in order for the girls to learn leadership and advocacy skills, for example in the campaign against AIDS.

National citizenship and strengthening social cohesion form the context for much of the subject matter discussed above, which together constitutes active citizenship.

In affluent countries (and schools for the affluent and middle income citizens in developing countries), there is widespread awareness of the ***international*** dimension through media and culture. The role of the school in these countries includes tailoring this international awareness towards action students can take (eg as consumers, and through fundraising and political avenues) to help poor and crisis-affected people in other countries.⁴⁰

Another international concern, of general applicability, is to strengthen friendly attitudes to countries within the same region, through some interesting stories that can help build respect and friendship within the region and/or activities related to regional programmes (eg activities sponsored by the European Union, African Union, South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation). In countries where many people are very poor and have only limited access to international media, the international dimension can be approached, for example, through highlighting nationals who have won international recognition (eg as performing artists or sports champions) and through national contributions to peacekeeping forces elsewhere. There can be an introduction to regional or sub-regional cooperative activities, to help build understanding that people in neighbouring countries have similar basic needs and that cooperation can help build a better standard of life in the region.

Box 2.21 Twinning

International twinning programmes between schools can enable connections between North and South as well as within regions. The concern in terms of impact is whether such programmes make a serious contribution to the wider contexts of school and community (or remain at the level of those individuals who are enabled to travel between the schools). Much depends on the objectives of the exchange.

The UNESCO Associated Schools Network encourages such twinning across the 7,500 schools of the network in 175 countries, and aims that such exchanges foster the UNESCO ideals of peace, democracy, rights and sustainable development. The Global Review of 2003 found such twinning was seen as enjoyable and as raising intercultural awareness, but acknowledged that more research is needed to judge the longer term and wider impact on peace and democracy goals.

2.5 Building the basic competency and thematic objectives into a coherent framework for curriculum design and evaluation

In the past, the LTLT/life skills dimension of education has rarely been seen as an integrated whole. Little bits of civic education appear during history and geography lessons, or in social studies, and *ad hoc* advice about interpersonal relationships and associated health behaviours is given during science lessons or science-based approaches to health education. Assessment of learning is equally scattered. Values may be left to the individual teacher to convey by tone of voice rather than students explicitly reviewing the choices that face them and the values that can help them in life.

What is needed therefore is a systematic planning and evaluation framework covering the education objectives for this dimension of curriculum. The planning framework should be structured to cover each year (or two to three years span) of primary and secondary schooling, ensuring progressive development of skills, knowledge and concepts, attitudes and values (as illustrated in Box 2.22).

The curriculum framework needs to take account of the developmental stage of the students:

- Younger students need concrete examples and experiences
- Adolescent students face additional social and emotional challenges as their bodies mature
- Older students can handle abstract concepts more easily, relating to government, human rights standards, etc
- At all levels, the sustainable internalization of concepts, values, attitudes and behaviour patterns needs continuing reinforcement of earlier learning.

Evaluators for LTLT and life skills education can likewise use this type of holistic and pedagogically sequenced curriculum framework in order to structure their analysis of student learning.

Box 2.22

Proposed learning outcomes for different age groups, as identified in a workshop of national educators

Age-wise learning outcomes recently identified as life skills priorities by educators in an 'emerging markets' country were developed separately for grades 1-3, 4-6, 7-9, 10-12. They cover a wide range of the LTLT /life skills objectives. Examples:

Grades 4-6

Identity: express their views and feelings; build esteem for self and others; appreciate national achievements*

Personal and social relationships: be aware of relationships, especially family; establish friendships; recognise social pressure from peers and others; be able to negotiate solutions to problems; respect rules and regulations; treat others properly despite diversity (gender, colour, race, culture, religions..)

Health: understand the emotional and physical changes they are undergoing; understand and control their feelings; manage risks ...

Environment: have a heightened sense of responsibility toward the environment...

Economy and technology: job opportunities; concern for people in poverty, their needs and rights and how to help them.....

Grades 10-12

Identity: embrace national and religious identity; discuss national issues; evaluate and benefit from other cultures; appreciate diversity*

Personal and social relationships: participate including voluntary service; resolve differences positively; develop confidence in new and changing relationships

Health: exercise (including good sportsmanship and fair play); safeguard emotional health; develop healthy life styles for self and community (recognising risks)....

Environment: identify own and others' roles in solving environmental problems...

Economy and technology: build personal and interpersonal skills for work ...

The outcomes were cross-tabulated with suggested learning outcomes for knowledge, for skills and for attitudes and values.⁴² Such outcomes could serve as a framework for curriculum development, to guide the writing or revision of textbooks, for a 'baseline study' of competencies and for evaluation of initiatives for curriculum renewal.

*Note. Regarding 'identity': educators will often face the challenge of balancing the goals of strengthening national or religious identity, and of ensuring full citizenship to minority groups and genuine appreciation of diversity.

The basic competency and thematic elements described in this chapter can be built into a pedagogically coherent and progressive framework, as illustrated schematically in Box 2.23. This framework shows the progression from simple applications of basic competencies for children in lower primary classes to more complex applications of these competencies for upper primary and secondary classes. The 'cyclic' curriculum leads to reinforcement of learning outcomes throughout schooling at regular intervals. Elias (2003) emphasizes the need for *explicit* teaching of intra-personal and interpersonal 'life skills' in *each* year of schooling, together with their application to locally relevant themes.

The methodology for field evaluation will differ at different levels of schooling. For younger children, oral questions and classroom observation of basic competencies may be appropriate, whereas at secondary level, it may be useful to also use written tests and questionnaires. Field trials would indicate appropriate methodologies to use with upper primary students.

A framework for evaluation of curriculum and of student learning, based on the categories listed in Boxes 2.4 and 2.6 above, is set out below (see Box 4.5). Basically, an adequate coverage of the areas mentioned in this chapter is an entitlement of all students, and evaluators can use the framework to see if this coverage is taking place.

To achieve the learning objectives set out in this type of framework, teaching-learning methods should connect with the student at a personal level, to help develop appropriate values, attitudes and behaviours, of individuals and peer groups. These teaching-learning methods are considered in chapter 3, which considers the 'how' of LTLT and life skills education.

Box 2.23

Exemplar holistic curriculum framework to help develop skills and values for learning to live together⁴³

Initial Schooling
(skills and values introduced, with application to simple life situations)

Similarities and differences

Active listening

Communication

Handling Emotions

Perceptions and Empathy

Co-operation

Problem-Solving

Conflict Resolution

Negotiation

Mediation

Reconciliation

Middle Schooling
(skills and values development, with application to different aspects of living together)

Similarities and differences:

Citizenship, human rights, diversity (CHRD)

Inclusion/exclusion:

CHRD

Active listening

Peer mediation, Gender

Communication:

Sexual and reproductive health/HIV-AIDS prevention (SRH)

Handling emotions:

Gender, SRH

Perceptions and empathy:

CHRD, Gender

Co-operation:

SRH, CHRD
Environmental conservation (EC)

Assertiveness:

SRH, CHRD, Gender

Analysis:

CHRD, SRH

Problem-Solving:

SRH, CHRD, Gender, EC

Conflict Resolution:

SRH, CHRD, Gender, EC

Negotiation:

SRH, CHRD, Gender, EC

Mediation:

SRH, CHRD, Gender, EC

Reconciliation:

SRH, CHRD, Gender

Illustrative Upper Schooling Modules (applying skills and values, with focus on specific topics)

Sexual and reproductive health, prevention of HIV/AIDS and other adolescent health risks (locally relevant themes)

- Communication
- Handling emotions
- Perceptions and empathy
- Assertiveness
- Negotiation

Peace, citizenship, human rights, diversity, humanitarian norms (locally relevant themes)

- Inclusion/exclusion
- Communication/assertiveness/advocacy
- Perceptions and empathy
- Co-operation
- Problem analysis and problem solving
- Negotiation, mediation, conflict resolution
- Reconciliation

Gender (locally relevant themes)

- Similarities and differences
- Active listening
- Communication
- Handling emotions
- Perceptions and empathy
- Co-operation
- Assertiveness
- Analysis
- Negotiation

Environment, other topics....

- Inclusion/exclusion
- Communication
- Co-operation, problem-solving, mediation, etc....



3

HOW SHOULD WE BE DOING IT? TEACHING- LEARNING PROCESSES FOR THE LTLT/LIFE SKILLS DIMENSION OF CURRICULUM

It is the view of this Guide that particular pedagogic practices are required for LTLT and life skills – practices that can work a transformation on students. To achieve the goals and education objectives discussed in the previous chapter, we need to work with students in ways that not only build their knowledge but give them practice in developing basic competencies, and that help broaden their values, attitudes and behaviours to encompass living together with mutual respect and solving problems through cooperation, negotiation and compromise.

For this type of personal transformation and development, we need to use what we know about human behaviour – for example, the transformative effect of cooperative group work, role plays or of talking with each other in small therapeutic groups. ***In other words, we need to use experiential methods, set in a context where there is personal involvement and commitment by each individual participant. Students need to be fully aware that they are learning personal skills and values for living together, and be committed to this.***

The LTLT/life skills dimension of curriculum clearly demands special skills and commitment on the part of the teachers, who themselves usually need special training and support for this work. Moreover, it is important for the ideals of mutual respect, human rights and democratic principles to be reflected holistically both in the working of the school and in teacher training processes. National textbooks and examinations should likewise support this dimension of curriculum. Box 3.1 summarises current thinking on good practice – and can be used as a reference when designing programme evaluation. The present chapter discusses these criteria in more detail.

Box 3.1.

Criteria for designing and assessing effective teaching-learning in the LTLT/ life skills dimension of curriculum

- Participatory, inclusive and experiential classroom methodologies (for all subjects and) especially for learning to live together/life skills themes, incorporating stimulus activities, discussion and personal reflection
- Earmarked time for these social and emotional development/active citizenship/HIV-AIDS prevention and similar education activities, plus structured teaching materials and strong teacher preparation and support
- Systematic practice of skills (a) in class, (b) outside class but in the school (eg in the playground), and (c) outside school, in structured, planned and monitored practice sessions (classwork and homework).
- Participatory, inclusive and democratic principles in school life and management, modelling the principles taught in the classroom
- Textbooks and other education materials that model and encourage skills, values, attitudes and behaviours required for living together and life skills

The participatory approach to education requires students and teachers to *practise* the basic social competencies which are at the heart of the learning to live together and life skills curriculum. Experiential methods used in the school curriculum introduce and reinforce basic life competencies, especially if these competencies are explicitly highlighted, and their relationship to daily life and citizenship repeatedly discussed or referred to - but this is difficult if teachers lack the needed skills. Obura (2007) notes the contemporary convergence in curriculum and pedagogical theory (Box 3.2).

Box 3.2**Convergence of curriculum and pedagogical theory**

Two pedagogical trends converge:

- Curriculum content – broadening, to include social skills needed in the workplace and personal life, and for social cohesion
- Methodology – interactive and participatory teaching/learning approaches, which are built on social skills.

(Adapted from Obura, 2007)

3.1 Participatory, experiential, inclusive and active classroom methodologies

Methodologies. If the goal is for students to learn and internalise attitudes and behaviours based on respect for all human beings, then the teaching-learning process has to reach the inner seat of personal identity, to enable the sense of ‘us and them’ to be broadened to ‘us’. The challenge is to replace exclusion and antipathy by empathy and concern for the basic needs of human beings beyond our immediate friends, relatives and our ‘side’ of a conflict. This requires analytical thinking but also active and experiential approaches such as structured games, creating skits and enacting role plays, -providing personal practice in and commitment to responding constructively to conflictual situations, - as illustrated in Box 3.4. The psychosocial needs of students and teachers affected by traumatic situations must also be taken into account.⁴⁴

Box 3.4**Criteria for designing and assessing teaching-learning methods for human rights education**

- Experiential and activity-centered: involving the solicitation of learners’ prior knowledge and offering activities that draw out learners’ experiences and knowledge
- Problem-posing: challenging the learners’ prior knowledge
- Participative: encouraging collective efforts in clarifying concepts, analyzing themes and doing the activities
- Dialectical: requiring learners to compare their knowledge with those from other sources
- Analytical: asking learners to think about why things are and how they came to be
- Healing: promoting human rights in intra-personal and inter-personal relations
- Strategic thinking-oriented: directing learners to set their own goals and to think of strategic ways of achieving them
- Goal and action-oriented: allowing learners to plan and organize actions in relation to their goals (ARRC, 2003).

Box 3.5 illustrates an experiential lesson based on stimulus activity followed by class discussion and reflection.

Box 3.5

Example of an experiential lesson from the INEE Peace Education Programme for year 2 and year 6 students on 'Similarities and Differences' (multiple identity, inclusion)

- Explain to the children that they must form groups according to what the teacher calls out, as quickly as possible
 - Call out a series of categories, eg (year 2) everybody wearing something green, red,, blue, white; (year 6) everybody who likes maths, everybody who likes eating, everybody who likes English
 - As soon as the groups have formed, call out a new category
 - After four or five different categories, ask the students to sit down or gather around
 - Make an opportunity for discussion about what happens when a person belongs to two or more groups
 - (Year 2 – multiple identity) Discuss that we all belong to many different groups but the groups should not prevent us from learning and living together peacefully. The groups we are in are often not things that we have a choice about and so it is unfair to think or act badly to those who are different from us
 - (Year 6 – add in the concept of inclusion) Discuss that groups are necessary for societies but that when we discriminate between groups this causes conflict.
- (INEE, 2005: 58, 178)

For an example of a classroom observation schedule to monitor or evaluate teaching methodology, to see if experiential methods are being used, see Annex 2.

Training of teachers in LTLT/ life skills (for their own lives/ for teaching). Active and experiential learning methods are unfamiliar to teachers in many countries, who may lack skills in facilitating open class discussion, especially on personal or social issues.⁴⁶ In developing countries especially, active learning approaches are held back by:

- a perceived and real lack of classroom resources
- a tradition of children showing silent respect for their elders rather than holding discussions or raising questions with them
- lack of familiarity with the subject matter
- lack of reference materials
- sensitivity of the topics, whether human rights, civics or sexual matters.

Hence, education for learning to live together and life skills competencies requires major in-service training programmes as well as support for teachers' initial work in the classroom. Evaluators will focus on the adequacy of teacher training and support (see chapter 9), and other factors affecting classroom practice.

Box 3.6
Training teachers

UNHCR's programme of peace education in the refugee camps in Kenya provided the peace education teachers with two weeks' training in each of three successive school vacations, a pilot-tested 'teacher activity book' with a full set of lesson plans, and classroom support from trainers during term time.

Northern Ireland's new 'citizenship education' programme (focused on reconciliation in a divided society) provided several days in-service teacher training for several (professionally qualified) teachers from each school as well as carefully structured classroom resource materials.

Sierra Leone is developing an 'Emerging Issues' course for teacher training colleges, to cover LTLT/life skills issues identified during a workshop of national teacher educators. The 'emerging issues' course will draw on the experiential methodology of the INEE peace education programme.

3.2 Providing an earmarked period on the timetable

Earmarking special periods. One approach to implementing the curriculum framework is to set aside a weekly period or hour of studies each week throughout schooling, to be devoted to participative active learning related to learning to live together and life skills, whether called Citizenship, Peace, Life Skills, Ethics etc or having different subject titles each year, term or semester.

Earmarking special study units within an existing 'carrier' subject or subjects. Another approach is to set blocks of this content in an existing school subject, throughout the years of schooling but clearly distinguishing them as 'activity' periods where teaching/learning is very different from routine chalk-and-talk methods in other classes. One major problem is that examination-oriented classes based on taking down notes from the blackboard frequently get behind schedule, meaning that time-consuming experiential and non-examined activities get cut out.

Inserting blocks of content within more than one subject is even more difficult. Without careful planning, there may be poor sequencing and coherence from the viewpoint of the individual student.⁴⁷

Reminders/ reinforcement. Teachers – and textbooks – can build reminders of LTLT/ life skills into all their teaching, e.g.:

- 'Now we have been cooperating (special activities in maths).'
- 'In this story (fictional or historical) people had different viewpoints. What were their 'narratives'? How could they have solved their problems? – Does this remind you of peer mediation?'

In reality, it is best to combine all these approaches. But they have particular implications for training. The separate periods approach requires training the smallest number of teachers. The reminders technique requires training of textbook writers as well as teachers in general.

Finding time. How can the earmarked time be found in a crowded school curriculum? It is often thought that by including citizenship or peace education within existing subjects, no extra timetable time is required. But this is not true, unless other material is subtracted from the previous curriculum, especially as experiential approaches are needed:

- Experiential learning requires organizing students to do special activities, often in pairs or groups, and then spending time discussing these activities in pairs or groups and with the whole class. This takes more time than class dictation or copying from the blackboard (although the learning gains may be greater in the long term).
- The work of school and class councils is also experiential and requires earmarked time for classes to discuss issues for submission through their representatives to school councils or executives and to receive feedback on issues discussed; and teacher skills are needed to facilitate discussion, enable recording of views etc.

The best approach, to avoid crowding out of active citizenship and life skills education, is thus for the education authorities to make a clear policy of allocating an additional weekly period for this experiential work, making it a separate subject, or a separate unit within either one or two 'carrier' subjects. In making this type of decision, an important question is how to find teachers who are comfortable with experiential learning and open class discussion on sensitive issues:

- The separate subject approach may enable separate teachers with the appropriate skills and attitudes to be hired and trained.
- The 'carrier subject' approach may mean that elderly teachers are asked to facilitate a discussion among adolescents about teenage love and the relative merits of abstinence and condoms.
- Head-teachers may need help in developing timetables that allow appropriate teachers to handle these topics.

Monitoring and evaluation of an LTLT/ life skills initiative will examine the advantages and problems associated with the chosen timetabling policy, including whether the scheduled lessons take place at all, the capacity of the teacher to use experiential methods and whether the head-teacher encourages this. Box 3.7 illustrates some of the policy issues to be considered.

Box 3.7.

Comparison of intervention models for learning to live together/life skills themes⁴⁸

	Advantages	Typical problems
Integration/ infusion approaches	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A 'whole school' approach • Uses existing school subjects • Many teachers involved • Potential for reinforcement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Difficulty of ensuring cohesion and progression in what students learn (skills and values for peace, human rights, citizenship, preventive health behaviours) • Difficulty of accessing, training and supporting all teachers in skills-based experiential approaches and influencing all textbooks • Lack of lesson time for experiential activities and discussion • Can be lost among higher status elements of curriculum • Pressure to focus on examination topics • Some teachers do not see relevance to their subject • Potential for reinforcement seldom realized due to other barriers • Teacher turnover necessitates costly training and support programmes • Students may not become conscious of what is being taught or identify with the values of learning to live together
Cross- referencing approaches	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Special skills and values-focused lesson units prepared centrally for insertion by subject teachers as enrichment or application of certain topics means that information and guidance is provided to non-specialist teachers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Difficulty of cross-referencing to subject syllabi • Difficulty of accessing, training and supporting teachers of subjects concerned in skills-based approaches • Lack of lesson time for experiential activities and discussion • Pressure to focus on examination topics • Teacher turnover necessitates costly training and support programmes
Carrier- subject approaches	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teacher training and support easier because fewer teachers involved and some have relevant background due to their subject experience • Teachers more likely to see the relevance of the skills and values • Cheaper and faster to integrate the components into materials of one subject than to infuse them across all 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Risk of an inappropriate subject being chosen (eg. biology is less good than health education or civic education for HIV/AIDS education because of the social and personal issues, and the tendency of science teachers to focus only on transmission of knowledge) • Needs an extra timetable period for new experiential content • Pressure to focus on examination topics • Some of the subject teachers may be unsuited to experiential approaches and facilitating discussion of sensitive topics • Teacher turnover necessitates long term training and support programmes for carrier subject teachers
Separate subject approaches	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The specially trained teacher needs intensive training but through constant practice gains competence and is motivated to keep the job by actually teaching the skills, values and behaviours required by his employers • Clear labelling of the subject and adequate time allocation assist students to internalize appropriate values and behaviours 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Requires decision to find space in existing timetable or add an additional school period to the school week • Pressures on the specially trained teachers to do other things, especially if their programme is given low status • In small isolated schools, the specialist teachers need additional tasks to fill their timetable • Teacher turnover necessitates long term training and support programmes but for a limited number of teachers

3.3 Participatory, inclusive and democratic principles in school life and management

Student participation in class and school activities can be a first stage of citizenship. In these circumstances, students can learn at first hand how to participate in a school or class council which takes significant decisions, how to organize committees, and how to cooperate to help solve problems of fellow students, the community and the environment. Peer mediation can help solve relationship problems and reduce bullying.

At classroom level, the individual teacher can ensure that each student gets the opportunity to participate in class activities, without discriminating against girls, minority groups, children with disabilities or learning problems, or children from marginalized groups. Students can participate in making decisions on their own learning, both in setting individual targets and contributing (with the teacher) to class decisions on what and how to learn. An important issue is to prevent the use of corporal and humiliating punishments as showing disrespect to students. Modern teacher training emphasises constructive approaches to classroom management rather than punishments, and the evaluator will examine whether this training is adequate and what other factors are at work.

Box 3.8

Healing classrooms

The International Rescue Committee has focused in recent years on the concept of teacher development, having found that under-qualified refugee teachers had little self-esteem, and hence limited confidence to follow new teaching methods. Its 'healing classroom' approach combines a focus on the well-being of students and teachers with an integration of psychosocial concerns into lesson planning and classroom management.⁴⁹

It is important for the whole school to demonstrate constructive living together, as in the model of a child-friendly school, developed by UNICEF and other child-focused agencies. Box 3.9 illustrates the criteria for assessing whether a school is 'child-friendly'.

Box 3.9

Characteristics of a child-friendly school⁵⁰

A child-friendly school:

- Recognizes the rights of every child
- Sees the whole child in a broad context. The staff is concerned about what happens to children before they enter the school system (in terms of health, for example) and once they are back home.
- Is child-centered, meaning that there is an emphasis on the psycho-social well being of the child.
- Is gender sensitive and girl-friendly. Staff is focused on reducing constraints to gender equity, eliminating gender stereotypes and promoting achievement of both girls and boys.
- Promotes quality learning outcomes. Students are encouraged to think critically, ask questions, express their opinions, and master basic skills.

Box 3.9**Characteristics of a child-friendly school⁵⁰**

- Provides education based on the reality of children's lives. The students have unique identities and prior experiences in the school system, their community and families, which can be taken into account by teachers in order to promote student learning and development.
- Acts to ensure inclusion, respect and equality of opportunity for all children. Stereotyping, exclusion and discrimination are not tolerated.
- Promotes student rights and responsibilities within the school environment as well as activism within their community at large.
- Enhances teacher capacity, morale, commitment and status by ensuring that the teachers have sufficient training, recognition and compensation.
- Is family focused. The staff attempt to work with and strengthen families, helping children, parents and teachers to establish collaborative partnerships.

Whole school programmes are a strong educational tool. Good head-teachers may automatically adopt this approach, while others may require training and incentives to do so (Box 3.10). An evaluator will look to see if the school 'ethos' supports LTLT/ life skills taught in the classroom.

Box 3.10**Examples of whole school programmes catering to LTLT/ life skills**

- Child-friendly schools (promoted by UNICEF, Save the Children and others)
- Peace focus (integration of peace and transformation into all school processes e.g., curriculum, peer education, awareness raising of teachers and parents)
- Rights-based education and human rights awareness; eg UNICEF Rights Respecting Schools
- Democratic citizenship focus (class and school councils, curriculum themes, participative pedagogy)
- Service learning
- Associated Schools Network Project (UNESCO)

3.4 Interactive radio instruction.

Given the problems of teacher under-qualification, lack of training, and sometimes absenteeism, there is a strong case for including *interactive radio instruction* in a programme of education during times of reconstruction or state fragility, - to strengthen teachers' skills, as well as supporting literacy, numeracy education and life skills education. Evaluation of the LTLT/ life skills elements can be integrated in the evaluation of the programme as a whole.

Box 3.11

Interactive radio instruction

The Education Development Center's (EDC) programme for schools in South Sudan provides a daily 27 minute literacy/numeracy session for the early primary school years, with enrichment elements covering health, land-mine awareness, HIV/AIDS prevention, peace education etc. The radio narrator asks teachers to use specific participative methods that provide both students and teachers with experience of active learning, which can then be applied in other lessons. EDC likewise integrates life skills elements into its school radio programmes in Somali.⁵¹

3.5 Textbooks and other education materials that model and encourage skills, values, attitudes and behaviours for LTLT/ life skills

Textbooks can be a powerful tool for 'learning to live together', or for glorifying war, building negative attitudes to certain social groups or neighbouring countries. Textbooks must thus be taken into account in designing and evaluating the learning to live together dimension of curriculum.⁵² This includes evaluating the textbooks themselves – see chapter 4 below.

UNESCO has suggested the following principles as a starting point for national discussions on textbook renewal:

'Quality textbooks and other learning materials:

- are essential to a quality, rights-based education for all...
- incorporate human rights principles in their content and integrate pedagogical processes that teach peaceful resolution to conflict, gender equity, non-discrimination and other practices and attitudes for "learning to live together" in their instructional design.
- Facilitate learning toward specific measurable outcomes which take multiple perspectives, learning styles, and modalities (including knowledge, skills and attitudes) into account
- Facilitate learning in ways that encourage active and equitable participation by all learners involved in the learning experience.
- Are affordable, durable, and accessible to every learner.' (UNESCO, 2005: 11)

Eliminating the negative. It is important to eliminate from textbooks anything, whether text or graphics, that denigrates women, people from minority groups, people with disability, citizens of neighbouring countries and so on, or that glorifies armed combat and fails to document the suffering caused to both sides and to civilians by war. Even if textbooks do not openly glorify war, by focussing only on the history of battles, conflicts and territorial gains/losses rather than peace time achievements, they present war as 'normal' and routine.⁵³

Box 3.12**Adjusting history curricula**

The Georg Eckert Institute in Germany has specialised in bringing historians together from countries that were formerly enemies, and helping them work together on producing a narrative of past conflicts that are acceptable to both sides and do not glorify war. They analyse how different countries present the same historical events: for example, one 2007 edition of their journal examines how India and Pakistan present history and also religious practices in their textbooks.⁵⁴

Following conflict and transition in southeast Europe, major efforts have been made to renew textbooks in ways that support peace, human rights and democracy. A recent stocktaking (UNESCO, 2006b) noted that between 1990 and 2005, most countries in the region revised their history curricula and textbooks at least once, and in some cases, several times. Most countries had attempted to replace negative stereotypes of minorities and neighbouring groups, and to introduce multi-perspective approaches and interactive pedagogies, but more remains to be done both in terms of textbook contents and what happens in the classroom.

Modelling the ‘basic life competencies’ and introducing subject themes for active citizenship, peace, human rights and skills-based preventive health. Since these themes have to be learned using active learning approaches, it is not evident that a textbook will always help. The danger in some countries is that students will be told to learn the contents of the textbook by heart rather than understanding and practising the skills that are to be learned – for example, learning definitions of basic life competencies such as assertive speech or mediation rather than practising them.

In these countries especially, the challenge is for textbooks, and national examinations, to minimise the ‘learn it by heart’ mentality and maximise classroom activity, participation, frank discussion of personal and social attitudes, practice of new behaviour and strategies and internalisation of LTLT/life skills values and attitudes.

For this to be done, ***textbook writers need to participate in special workshops*** which introduce LTLT/life skills education, including the use of participatory active learning and open classroom discussion of attitudes and behaviours in this area. With this personal and professional development, writers may then seek to apply what they have learned to the editing or development of textbooks. It is not difficult to select stories and activities that model inclusion, effective responses to bullying, and how to avoid being pressured into unwanted and unsafe behaviours, and to put them into the textbooks with suggestions for the teacher regarding active learning approaches suited to the country concerned. The same is true for issues at the societal level, such as activities which model democratic principles, according someone their rights or raise debates about the environment. The main point is that the textbook writers have to be empowered and motivated to use this approach.

More generally, textbook writers for any subject can try to reinforce basic life skills such as cooperation, problem analysis and problem solving, detecting bias, building empathy skills and awareness of different perspectives and so on, by including them in suggested activities. For example, after suggesting that students on two sides of the room take turns in the successive stages of a maths or reading activity, teachers can stress that this is an example of good listening and cooperation, which help to build a better life for the student and the society. Evaluators can examine textbooks to identify whether this kind of support is provided to the teachers.

Box 3.13

Including self-evaluation in textbooks

Textbooks and student workbooks (where available) can encourage self-evaluation by students, by asking them to reflect on what they have learned. The OXFAM resource book *Developing Rights*, designed for 11-14 year olds, contains a grid with a number of statements such as

- 'I know what a right is'
- 'I said what my ideas were about the rights list'
- 'I can imagine what it would be like to be someone who was denied basic rights'.

Students tick if they agree.

Students also complete sentences such as:

- 'One thing I could have done better was.....'
- 'One thing I have changed my mind about is.....'

Such self-evaluations – adapted to local circumstances – enable student reflection, but also, if collected with the students' permission, enable teachers to reflect on the lessons. A simple tally of the students who ticked the box 'I asked questions' may inform evaluators of the real degree of participation as opposed to teacher's sometimes partial memory.

Examinations. There is intense debate about whether programmes such as education for peace, citizenship or HIV/AIDS prevention should be part of school and national examinations.

- *Against exams:* Teaching for examinations tends to detract from time-consuming active learning sessions and open-ended class discussions. -It may encourage a rote learning approach.
- *In favour of exams:* The status of non-examined subjects can be so low that the lessons are cancelled to make more time for studying examined subjects. Or the non-examined subjects are assigned to a less effective teacher.

There are no easy answers to this debate. However, it is hoped that writers of examinations can participate in workshops in which they are immersed in the life skills, citizenship and peacebuilding dimension of curriculum and then seek ways in which they can strengthen this dimension as part of renewal of examination criteria and processes.

3.6 Contact between different groups

The 'contact' approach, based on bringing together young people from different – sometimes hostile – groups has been used in various countries, where there is geographic, ethnic, linguistic and/or religious separation between young people, eg when they do not attend the same schools but may live close by. 'Contact methods' can be particularly effective when traditionally hostile

groups meet for the first time, under well prepared circumstances. Contact can be planned as a regular neighbourhood or local activity or, due to distance, may be organised at less frequent intervals.

Research suggests that the contact approach requires certain conditions to be effective, including the opportunity for the young people to cooperate on meaningful tasks. The participants must also be of equal status, not one group feeling disempowered compared to another. There is also a 're-entry' problem when they return to mix with peers who have not participated in the contact process. In this regard, it is important that there the students study and practise LTLT competencies and concepts, so that they have a cognitive and value framework that can help them hold onto the idea that 'we are all human beings' when they get home.

This approach can provide a complement to formal learning, as in the contact 'peace events' organized in Sri Lanka for trainee teachers attending Sinhala medium and Tamil medium colleges, as part of wider peace education initiatives.

As discussed with the 'twinning' initiatives mentioned earlier, immediate evaluation of attitudes after a contact event or programme needs ideally to be supplemented with longer term investigation of individual or group behaviours and orientations.

3.7 Matching teaching-learning methods with content and objectives

Teachers and head-teachers who have received limited training on interactive teaching methods often do not realize that particular methods are suited to particular lesson objectives. For example, they have been told that they should do 'group work' – but do not know why it is sometimes advantageous (students use active communication, practise listening, cooperation, negotiation, and because of this deeper personal involvement, may learn the thematic content better). Hence teachers may use group work when being inspected, but not otherwise! Another example is role play: if students play roles that are familiar or high status, they may gain less in empathy and understanding of another's 'narrative' than if they are asked to play an unfamiliar or despised role. This matching of methods and content is an important criterion for evaluators looking at LTLT/ life skills programmes in schools or teacher education, and in evaluation of textbooks.





4

HOW CAN WE USE OUR OBJECTIVES AND PEDAGOGIC CRITERIA TO EVALUATE CURRICULA AND TEXTBOOKS ?

This Guide aims to encourage each education ministry or NGO programme to design its own conceptual framework for learning to live together/life skills/ citizenship/ peace/ human rights education. One approach would be to use the categories suggested in chapters 2 and 3, after adapting them to suit local conditions and programmes. Another approach is to develop a curriculum framework based on review of national education policy documents, seminars and workshops, and preliminary textbook analyses (taking account also of national commitments under the Article 29 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, and under other international treaties and programmes). The framework can be used for curriculum and textbook analysis and for analysis of learning outcomes measured during evaluation of field programmes (see chapters 8, 9).

In this chapter, the Guide explores the evaluation of curriculum and associated teaching-learning materials for use in the classroom. Often these materials take the form of school textbooks, supplementary materials, teacher guides and sometimes teacher training manuals. These educational sources provide a framework and a direct support to classroom-based learning, and can be examined as a stand-alone evaluation or as part of a broader evaluation.

4.1. Evaluation goals

Curriculum and textbooks can be evaluated against LTLT/ life skills goals. For example, if the Ministry sets a learning goal of conflict transformation and the textbooks model diverse people resolving conflicts constructively, then this is consistent with the aim to promote positive life skills and a tolerant and peaceful society. The curriculum and textbook could be examined in relation to reference to this goal and the degree to which they actively support teachers promoting conflict transformation in their classrooms.

However, materials might actually be antithetical to LTLT goals. For example, curriculum or textbooks might consciously or unconsciously promote inter-ethnic separateness or bias. Such textbooks are sometimes carried over from earlier times, and may continue to be used due to lack of alternatives (though teachers can be offered guidance on which parts to omit).

In a post-conflict or transitional situation, there may be an urgent need for revision of textbooks for the next year, with evaluators focusing primarily on identifying harmful elements that should be removed. This will enable textbooks to be printed for immediate use in the schools.

Another approach, which can be adopted ahead of renewal of textbooks, is the production of supplementary materials for students or teachers guides. An example is the INEE Peace Education Programme 'Teacher Activity Book' which outlines LTLT/life skills lessons for the first eight years of school. Other examples can be supplementary booklets for students on LTLT/life skills themes, or resource books for teachers. These can fill the gaps identified by textbook evaluation. Supplementary materials can be produced by governments or NGOs, and may feed into later editions of school textbooks - as happened with mine awareness materials in Mozambique, for example.

Over the longer term, a good curriculum evaluation of the type described here will be important in the actual design of an updated and re-oriented curriculum and a new series of textbooks. The evaluation will be helpful to textbook writers, whether these are education ministry specialists or writers in the private sector.

The 'Progressive Framework' developed by the World Bank and others for dialogue with states emerging from fragility illustrates the different requirements at each stage of a post-conflict or similar situation, with curriculum evaluation required or implied to underpin each step forward:

Box 4.1**'Learning content' elements of the Education for All Fast Track Initiative's 'Progressive Framework' for education support in fragile states****Interim arrangements**

Review of learning content in line with basic learning needs and protection issues (eg HIV/AIDS protection, conflict prevention and rights)

Transitional mechanisms

Interim curriculum updating and building of institutional capacity for curriculum development, including elements of peacebuilding

Development target

New curriculum framework reflects national consensus on political, economic and human development strategy

A comprehensive analytical framework for assessing curriculum policy in relation to social and civic reconstruction is provided in Tawil and Harley (2004:31-35).

4.2. Evaluation processes

Linking with curricular review processes. The timing of curriculum evaluation is crucial, so that it links into plans to revise or to replace school textbooks. Where international donors are supporting the revision of and printing of textbooks, they should allow time and where necessary provide resources so that a thorough curriculum analysis regarding the life skills and anti-bias/pro-living together/human rights/citizenship dimension can be conducted beforehand. Donor support for textbooks in a divided society should be allocated following a curriculum review conducted under the auspices of a committee which includes representatives of the different social groups, to ensure the textbooks promote social cohesion (Greaney, 2003).

Where there is no change of government, and the aim is to improve the curriculum as part of general quality improvement for schooling and to strengthen the contribution of schooling to the quality of life and social functioning of the society, then curriculum and textbook renewal can be planned over a period of years, with a stronger research base. For the area of learning to live together and life skills, this research base should feature the active participation of students (from both genders and all social groups) – as respondents and also as researchers. This will help align curricula so that they can intersect with the real lives of young people and help achieve the type of educational goals discussed in chapter 2 above.

Similar evaluations may be made of curricula and textbooks for pre-service and in-service training of teachers.

Linkage with national examinations. Officials concerned with national examinations can be associated with curriculum evaluation activities, in order that they may take action at a suitable opportunity to reflect some aspects of 'learning to live together' and life skills in national examinations. For example, an examinations department project officer or focal point could participate in technical discussions and progress meetings, to develop familiarity with the conceptual framework, methodology and findings. Since teachers and students are influenced by the content of examinations, the impact of LTLT and life skills initiatives will be strengthened to the extent that objectives,

principles and pedagogy are reflected in examination marks. However, there is a danger that teachers will ask students to learn the textbook by heart in order to gain maximum points. It is critical that examiners understand ways of incorporating the spirit of LTLT/ life skills without giving marks for rote learning (but without unduly penalizing students from remote schools where more sophisticated pedagogy is rare).

Given that experiential teaching of LTLT/ life skills may tend to be neglected due to pressures of 'examination subjects', there is an argument for including basic skills and key themes in the examination, in ways that promote good teaching. There could be an open-ended question on the process of mediation for example, which would mean that schools would have to teach the stages of mediation, including review of the narratives of both parties to a conflict, and identification of basic needs and some win-win solutions. Questions relating to thematic content will give the theme more prestige – it could be considered a step forward to include HIV/AIDS awareness in the national school leaving examination.

Training the team of analysts/evaluators. A team of educators has to be trained in the fundamentals of learning to live together and life skills, so that they can conduct the analysis. In particular, they will study how national curricula and textbooks may have consciously or unconsciously included elements that favour one gender (usually males), particular ethnic or religious groups and so on, or may lead to negative views of other groups, and promote violence and war or acceptance of violations of human rights. This training should include examples of both exemplary and weak curricula and textbooks, so that the analysts are alerted to common faults as well as missed opportunities. If the evaluators are not accustomed to active approaches to learning, they should also be acquainted with the limitations of a purely knowledge transmission approach and the use of active learning and experiential methods; - as we know from HIV/AIDS education, the transmission of knowledge (without practice in how to use it in social situations) may have negligible effect on the behaviour of many young people.

Box 4.2

Development of an analytical framework for textbook evaluation in Morocco

In 2004–2005, a textbook review was undertaken in Morocco to evaluate gender equality and human rights perspectives in school textbooks. The study was conducted by Human Rights Education Associates (HREA, an international NGO) in cooperation with the Moroccan Ministry of National Education, the Central Committee for Human Rights Citizenry, and in partnership with several women's and human rights NGOs.

A first step was to develop the analytical framework for the evaluation, a process which took three months and resulted in a document of 32 pages. The staff of HREA's Morocco office spent over three months developing the criteria, involving a sociologist and many highly experienced educators in the process and referencing international human rights treaties (CEDAW and the UDHR) and the Moroccan Family Code. The research team examined the development of the textbook in Morocco and debated which questions could best address the presence/absence of women/girls in the textbooks. They also studied the Moroccan Chart on Reform to the Educational System, and looked at comparative studies on textbooks, particularly examining the recent Turkish experience critiquing the presence of human rights values in the textbooks.

Box 4.2

Development of an analytical framework for textbook evaluation in Morocco

The textbook review necessitated the use of techniques and tools that could help to ensure objectivity, accuracy and the comparison of the quantitative data. Thus, HREA developed charts to fill out and a template incorporating the criteria. The template called for information on the textbook (i.e., its title, subject, school level, authors (male or female), editors, ISBN) in addition to the name and professional affiliation of the reviewer. The template included 21 charts; the first four charts attempted to measure the representation of individuals in the textbooks according to different variables, the fifth to tenth charts looked for the appearance of the characters in various positions, while charts 11 to 15 dealt with stereotypes according to different variables (i.e., distribution of roles, adjectives associated with men and women, etc). Chart 16 measured the representation of efficiency according to age and gender. Lastly, charts 17 to 21 looked at the presence or absence of certain human rights principles such as gender equality, freedom, dignity, tolerance and solidarity in the textbooks through both text and image.

In January 2005, eleven male and eleven female educators were trained for four days, and subsequently analysed 43 textbooks in the fields of Arabic, Islamic Studies, History and Geography, Home Economics, Arts, and French. At the conclusion of the review process, the researchers and HREA developed a set of recommendations which were submitted to the Ministry of National Education to help revise and improve textbooks in Morocco. In December 2005, the report was adopted and endorsed by the Ministry of National Education. HREA-Maroc is drafting a manual to be published and distributed by the Ministry of National Education (Sabir, 2006).

4.3. Criteria and tools

Based on experience in diverse settings, Tibbitts (1997b) suggested practical criteria for the review of texts relating to human rights, and these criteria are applicable to LTLT and life skills generally:

- The use of culturally relevant examples
- Overall representativeness in text and illustrations of gender, ethnic groups, majority and minority culture members
- The avoidance of stereotyping in language and illustrations
- The presence of local issues of concern
- Avoidance of jargon or polemical language
- Sensitivity to the material conditions of the classroom
- Reference to local, national and international documents and mechanisms guaranteeing human rights.

Curriculum and textbook evaluation requires an analytical framework based on criteria of this type, linked with the goals, educational objectives and pedagogy discussed in chapters 2 and 3. Box 4.3 shows an extract from a framework of this kind relating to the place of 'democracy and diversity' in schooling (mainly at secondary level).

Box 4.3**Coverage of 'democracy and diversity' themes in school programmes**

RATING	Hardly at all	Somewhat	Strongly
<p>Theme: unity and diversity</p> <p>Are students taught about the complex relationships between unity and diversity</p> <p>(a) in their local communities?</p> <p>(b) in the nation</p> <p>(c) in the world?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do students discuss the ways in which nation states have defined the criteria for citizenship and dealt with the multiple identities of individuals? • Do students have the opportunity to consider the relationships between unity and diversity in various sites of identity, such as gender, race, ethnicity, social class, sexual orientation, religion and ability? 			
<p>Theme: human rights</p> <p>Does the teaching of human rights underpin citizenship education courses and programmes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do courses and programmes increase understanding of the concepts, foundations and practices of human rights? • Do courses explain how human rights concepts provide a basis for dialogue and offer a set of shared values that is particularly important for diverse multicultural societies? • Do courses introduce the major international human rights documents such as the UN Charter, UDHR, CRC? • Can teachers distinguish between protection, provision and participant rights of children? 			
Other themes (total of four principles and ten themes)			

A recent assessment tool regarding education in fragile states includes questions relating to curriculum (USAID, 2006). Answers to the questions could be categorized as 'strongly, somewhat, hardly at all', as above. Questions in the tool include:

- Do curricula perpetuate and legitimize ethnic/political/religious violence?
- Do curriculum and educational materials emphasise the history, accomplishments, customs, values and traditions of (only) one social group?
- Is the classroom environment participatory or inclusive?
- Does the quality of the education help build democratic culture?
- Does education give people the skills needed to participate in political life?
- Are students being taught about their role as citizens and the role of government in providing essential public services?

- Does the education system encourage national unity? Does the education system reflect and support democratic processes?
- What civic values are taught and practiced in the school?
- Is peace education part of the non-formal and formal curriculum?
- Are teachers trained in conflict resolution or peace education?
- What is the psychosocial impact of violence on students and teachers?
- Do classroom norms support or mitigate a culture of violence?
- What problem-solving and conflict resolution skills are taught?
- Are curriculum content and learning materials being considered as a way to mitigate against fragility or reinforce resiliency?

Box 4.4

Curriculum and textbook evaluation in Turkey⁵⁷

Curriculum evaluation can be carried out by non-governmental organizations. In Turkey, an NGO conducted an analysis of textbooks used in primary and secondary schools, in terms of content that was explicitly or implicitly negating concepts of human rights and democracy. The analysis was conducted by trained volunteers: 165 teachers, 51 parents, 71 university students. Content analysis showed weaknesses classified into 7 categories and 38 sub-categories. These findings were shared with the education ministry prior to a 2005 reform of curricula and textbooks. In 2007, the process was begun again, to examine the new textbooks.

Conceptual framework for analysis of coverage and presentation

Box 4.5 below gives an example of a conceptual framework for the evaluation (and design) of textbooks and other educational materials. It includes:

- 'key competencies' and thematic areas (from chapter 2)
- teaching-learning processes (as in chapter 3)
- criteria noted earlier in this chapter.

For simplicity, these elements are presented sequentially, even though there are inter-relationships.

The columns in Box 4.5 are set out to show whether particular key competencies or themes are covered strongly, somewhat, only a little or negatively. For each line, a tick can be placed in the appropriate column.

Box 4.5**Schema for evaluation (or planning) of curricula and textbooks – or analysis of field evaluation data**

COVERAGE OF OBJECTIVES	Strong	Some	Little	Negative e.g. bias, aggression
<p>Basic life competencies</p> <p>Interpersonal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accepting existence of differences, multifaceted personal identity • Empathy • Lessening bias and prejudice • Inclusion, non-discrimination, fairness, justice • Respect for others and for their needs • Good interpersonal communication • Cooperation and teamwork (including in heterogenous groups) • Assertive communication/refusal skills • Negotiation/mediation/conflict resolution • Advocacy oriented to helping others, peacebuilding, citizenship, human rights 				
<p>Intrapersonal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Emotional awareness • Emotional self-management, eg of anger, grief, stress • Increasing personal confidence and self-esteem/self-respect 				
<p>Cognitive</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Analysing and solving problems (problems involving people) • Strengthening skills for decision-making (decisions involving own life, and other people) • Developing 'critical thinking' skills (esp. in relation to societal problems and their solution). 				
<p>Subject themes with associated development of attitudes/values supporting active citizenship and/or social cohesion/ peacebuilding, human rights</p> <p>Personal development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social and emotional development • Healthy relationships (including refusal skills for unsafe sex and substance abuse), • Safety <p>Conflict resolution, cooperative problem-solving</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Schemas for negotiation, win-win problem-solving, mediation 				

HOW CAN WE USE OUR OBJECTIVES AND PEDAGOGIC CRITERIA TO EVALUATE CURRICULA AND TEXTBOOKS ?

Box 4.5

Schema for evaluation (or planning) of curricula and textbooks – or analysis of field evaluation data

COVERAGE OF OBJECTIVES	Strong	Some	Little	Negative e.g. bias, aggression
Unity in diversity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Respect for all human beings • Tolerance/appreciation of diversity/preventing inter-group hostilities • Gender sensitivity • Respect for persons with disability 				
Human rights and responsibilities <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Human needs • Human rights and responsibilities • Rights of children, women • Rights of marginalized groups • Humanitarian law (laws of war) 				
Civic roles <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation • Democratic processes • Rule of law • Civil society • Good governance • Conflict prevention/building peace after conflict (where relevant) 				
Care of the natural environment Other themes, as appropriate Overarching (spatial): local, national and global dimensions of citizenship and peacebuilding <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local • (National – if not covered above) • International 				
Teaching-learning processes (suggested in curriculum/ textbook/guide –or observed during field evaluation) Open class discussion (facilitated for development of students' comprehension, skill development and commitment) following a stimulus activity				

Box 4.5**Schema for evaluation (or planning) of curricula and textbooks – or analysis of field evaluation data**

COVERAGE OF OBJECTIVES	Strong	Some	Little	Negative e.g. bias, aggression
<p>Active/participative/experiential stimulus activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Physical activity to stimulate active learning, • -games, music, dance, artwork etc • Instructional games focused on life competency development and/or subject matter • Brainstorming • Pair work • Group work • Role plays, skits, dramas • Community service • Advocacy activities..... • Affirmation and inclusion of all students • Use of constructive (not violent or humiliating) discipline 				
<p>Approach (especially in textbooks)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The use of culturally relevant examples • Representative coverage in text and illustrations of gender, ethnic groups, majority and minority culture members • Avoidance of stereotyping in language and illustrations • Presence of national issues of concern • Avoidance of jargon or polemical language • Sensitivity to the material conditions of the classroom. 				

Box 4.5, if filled in with ticks in appropriate boxes of the matrix, would indicate visually where an existing textbook or programme was strong or weak. Another option would be to write brief comments in the boxes of the matrices. Box 4.5 can be adapted to have a different set of column headings:

- Knowledge and concepts
- Skills
- Values/attitudes and modeling prosocial behaviours.

A similar framework is needed to cover the different levels of study e.g. by school year, or groups of two years (years 1 and 2, 3 and 4, etc), or groupings such as lower primary and upper primary. This is important because children can best develop their understandings and values in the field of LTLT/life skills, if they can benefit from a cyclic curriculum which reinforces earlier learning and deepens understanding and commitment. For this purpose, Box 4.5 could be adapted for use with primary school textbooks with column headings such as the following:

- Years 1-2
- Years 3-4
- Years 5-6
- Years 7-8.

Choosing a framework. Pilot testing an evaluation activity will show what categories best meet the national or local setting. For example, if a version adapted from Box 4.5 is developed, pilot testing will show that some elements can be unified, while other categories may be sub-divided and new categories added.

Many programmes will use a totally different analytical framework, based on their particular approach, concerns and experience. Hence Box 4.5 and its suggested adaptations are not meant to be seen as the 'right' framework, but are offered to readers to illustrate the need for a holistic framework of this kind.

This conceptual framework will be referred to again, in the discussion on programme evaluation. For example, it can be used to classify the content of transcripts of interviews with school students or teachers undergoing training (see chapters 8, 9).

Evaluation of curriculum content and textbooks represents an important step towards enriching the LTLT/life skills dimension of schooling. We now look at the broader picture of how a country or NGO may work to strengthen, monitor and evaluate this dimension of their programmes.



5

WHAT ARE THE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN EFFECTIVE NATIONAL (OR NGO) PROGRAMME?

Strengthening education for constructive citizenship, peacebuilding and life skills cannot be undertaken simply by introducing new policies, curricula, textbooks or guidelines. Various programmes have tried this, with limited impact.

An effective innovation process requires action at all levels of the education system. Monitoring and evaluation likewise has to include sub-systems and actors, such as:

- Various sections of the education ministry, and of associated units dealing with curriculum development, professional development of teachers, examinations; directors and senior managers of NGO education programmes
- Middle level managers in provincial and district education offices; NGO education staff

- Schools and other educational programmes
- In a federal system, - education ministries in each state or province
- Teacher training institutions or units, and education faculties at universities.

Experience shows that a successful programme requires high level commitment to LTLT/ life skills education, careful planning for a system-wide approach, and lots of capacity building and support to education managers and teachers, as this is a new and demanding field for many of them.

Drawing on past good practice, some elements of a possible strategy for an education ministry or NGO education programme are shown in Box 5.1. The present chapter considers these elements in turn. ***These same elements can constitute criteria for monitoring and evaluation, -in questions such as ‘Has this action been taken?’***

Box 5.1

Elements of strategy or plan for strengthening the learning to live together (LTLT) /life skills dimension of education (education for citizenship, peace, human rights, HIV/AIDS prevention etc)⁵⁹

Element 1. Preparatory actions: identifying national and regional human resources for start up; identifying ongoing innovative programmes; establishing an advisory group; building stakeholder consensus; deciding on priority education goals and objectives

Element 2. Strong leadership policy commitment and vision statement

Element 3. Creation of a core development team,, training of this team and other trainers and committed head-teachers in programme design, monitoring and evaluation

Element 4. Establishment of a network of pilot or model schools, with timetabled LTLT/life skills lessons and a holistic approach throughout the school, to trial materials and methods (and serve as a training resource)

Element 5. Training and support for a team to work on strengthening the LTLT/life skills dimension of curriculum, textbooks, supplementary materials, teacher guides, and examinations:

(a) for special course units on these themes

(b) for other subjects

(drawing on pilot school experience in content and pedagogy)

Element 6. Strengthening the LTLT/life skills dimension of teacher training curricula and methods, both pre-service and in-service

Element 7. Training middle management eg district education officers, supervisory staff and head-teachers in the new approach

Element 8. Using non-formal education strategies and multiple communication channels (mass media, civil society), to reinforce messages to the wider population. Inserting LTLT/life skills into existing interactive radio instruction.

Element 9. Establishment of LTLT/life skills monitoring and evaluation plans and capacity in relevant departments of the education ministry or other organisations

Element 10. Long term commitment and funding.

5.1 Preparatory steps and consensus-building

Inventory of resources, material and human. Preparatory steps include identifying ongoing innovative programmes and materials in education for citizenship, life skills, peace, human rights, environment and related themes, both in the country or region and internationally; and identifying national and perhaps international specialists in this field to help with capacity building and start up.

Advisory group. Establishment of an advisory group can help build consensus and momentum. For a national programme, this group would include representatives of relevant sections of the education ministry and associated units concerned with curriculum, textbooks, examinations, and teacher training. Depending on local conditions, other stakeholders may be included. It is desirable to establish an advisory group or sub-group on monitoring and evaluation as early as possible, to ensure that data collection is built into strategy and planning.

Consensus-building among stakeholders. A key step is to build awareness and consensus among stakeholders about the proposed initiatives. It is important that programmes in this area are seen as 'outside politics' and culturally acceptable. Otherwise they may be short-lived. Problems may include:

- Different religious groups may want different things included or excluded from the curriculum (for example sexual health, or humanist perspectives)
- The government may be suspicious of the motives of some NGOs who bring their own citizenship or peace education programmes to the process
- In a post-conflict society, there may be different factions who may want a particular version of the conflict portrayed, or who argue that the conflict should not be mentioned at all.

Multiple stakeholders must be brought on board, including parents and community leaders, as well as leaders of various religious groups and civil society institutions. The support of teacher organisations, headteachers and local education administrators is vital. Even where there is strong leadership from the top, these groups need to be brought into the policy development process at an appropriate stage, preferably from the start, to build the maximum consensus on the path forward.

Mechanisms are needed also to incorporate the views and voice of students and young people, since we are seeking ways to help them develop skills, attitudes and behaviours that will enable them to cope with their environment and foster a peaceful and prosperous society within the rule of law and with respect for the rights and welfare of all.

Awareness-raising. Introductory workshops are needed to develop the capacity of stakeholders to define the objectives of the new strategy and to contribute to its implementation, monitoring and evaluation.

5.2 Strong leadership policy commitment and vision statement

Strong leadership is helpful in dealing with curriculum change. For example, if the president or minister of education decides that post-conflict reconstruction would benefit from education for peace, human rights, citizenship and life skills in the schools, then the process of innovation is easier. Likewise, for NGO programmes, the initiative needs strong commitment from the top, and stable budgetary arrangements.

5.3 Creation and training of a core development team and committed trainers and head-teachers

Capacity building for a core team is especially important in areas such as education for peace, human rights, citizenship and life skills, as these themes are unfamiliar to and/or considered 'sensitive' by many educators. They will often require training in:

- Basic life competencies (including interpersonal, personal and cognitive/problem-solving skills linked to appropriate values)
- Overview of the thematic areas noted in chapter 2
- Interactive and experiential methods of teaching the above (see chapter 3).
- Monitoring and evaluation of all the above.

Essentially the core team needs to draw on international and national expertise, through participative workshops and planning processes in which they personally experience and develop the range of skills, concepts and pedagogies set out in chapters 2 and 3 above. This can include initial work on adapting pre-existing materials and methods to the national setting and trialling them. Methods of monitoring and evaluation described later in this Guide will help them identify and develop effective approaches and teaching-learning activities.

Box 5.2.

Example of UNICEF-supported start up for life skills education

1. Five-day workshop of key educators from the education ministry and NGOs, introducing the concept of 'life skills' education as helping children to meet risks and opportunities in their lives, using (and explaining) experiential methods
2. Participants then consult with colleagues, children, parents, teachers (using workshop-style format as appropriate) to identify what children and adolescents need to learn in preparation for their personal lives and lives in society
3. Five-day follow-up workshop to identify learning outcomes required by children and adolescents to face life challenges and opportunities
4. Two five-day training of trainers workshops, with extensive experiential work and practice training of teachers. This creates a group of trainers to take the programme forward.
5. Analysis of priority learning outcomes in this way facilitates subsequent conduct of a 'baseline' evaluation, design of new course units and monitoring and evaluation of achievements.⁶⁰

5.4 Establishment of a network of pilot or model schools

Pilot schools. Because learning to live together and life skills deal with themes that can be culturally or politically sensitive, it is important that materials and methods are pre-tested in pilot schools. They must be adapted to local sensitivities and take account of the operational conditions in the schools (eg shortage of books, stationery, space) and the capacities of teachers.

A good approach is for the core team to create and provide technical support to a network of pilot schools:

- Accessible but representing geographical areas and different social and economic settings; perhaps in clusters for mutual support and cross-fertilisation.
- With enthusiastic head-teachers who understand the purpose of the innovation and allocate timetable time for it, accept the principles of student participation, non-violence etc.
- Linked to teacher training institutions, -and later used for inducting new teachers into the new approaches through school visits or teaching practice.
The core team will need a plan for its monitoring and evaluation activities in the pilot schools:
- Monitoring data that pilot schools and teachers should document on a regular basis (including notes on pilot lessons and materials, difficulties encountered)
- Baseline evaluation data on students and teachers
- Evaluation of teacher performance and attitudes, school climate and student learning after completion of specific course units and time periods
- Analysis of teachers' lesson notes to enable preparation of revised lesson plans and materials.

5.5 Renewal and/or enrichment of curriculum and teaching-learning materials, to promote LTLT/ life skills

The process of curriculum renewal in line with national education goals is usually intended to create a learning context and to include specific learning experiences supportive of LTLT/ life skills including healthy relationships, active citizenship, peace, and human rights. The whole curriculum should be compatible with these goals. Chapter 4 illustrated the evaluation of existing curricula and teaching-learning materials in terms of faults and gaps in relation to key LTLT/ life skills goals and objectives. A similar framework can be used to support the development of a new generation of textbooks and/or supplementary course materials.

Based on the experience being gained in pilot schools, the core team and specially trained writers can:

- Draft and build consensus around a new curriculum framework which systematically introduces and reinforces the competencies and themes for LTLT/life skills in each year of schooling
- Develop, evaluate and adapt LTLT/ life skills course units for other schools, that introduce the competencies and themes described in chapter 2 above. (The course units can form part of a stand alone subject or be included in carrier subjects, -as discussed in chapter 3.) Materials for in-service and pre-service training as well as lesson guides for teachers will be needed, because of the complex and sensitive nature of the subject matter.

- Assist with training of teacher trainers and local teachers.
- For the longer term, train textbook writers on ways of reinforcing the LTLT/life skills learning outcomes by repeating similar themes and skills development explicitly in their respective subjects. Also train the writers in how textbooks can help teachers to use participative and experiential methods for all subjects.
- Evaluate each new set of materials through trialling them in pilot schools.
- Help review national examinations and student assessments so that they reflect LTLT/life skills competencies, themes and pedagogy.

5.6 Capacity-building for teachers and teacher educators

Awareness-raising and capacity building for teacher educators. A first step is for teacher trainers at university and teacher training institutions to participate themselves in training workshops with the core team. This can lead to a wider understanding and recognition of the person-oriented LTLT/life skills dimension of curriculum. It can also lead to the identification of specialists who can get more deeply involved take responsibility for training, monitoring and evaluation in this area.

Renewal and enrichment of the teacher training curriculum. In many countries, teacher training does not include much explanation or experience of active learning techniques. This is a priority area for the teaching of the school curriculum in general.

Thus teacher training in LTLT/life skills may require training both in interactive experiential pedagogy and in the competencies and themes cited in chapter 2 above.

Box 5.3

Beware of cascades!

In-service training for LTLT/life skills can be organized in various ways. The 'cascade' approach of having trainers quickly train another layer of trainers who then train teachers is not effective for transformational goals such as creating teachers who can confidently use experiential methods and teach sensitive subjects to teenagers! There can be no substitute for systematically providing teachers with multiple experiential workshops led by committed trainers, even though this may require phasing in over several years.

In Northern Ireland, for example, a new citizenship education programme was phased in over five years, to allow sufficient training for teachers newly entering the programme. Evaluation has been built into the programme on a long term basis.

The INEE Peace Education Programme provided ten days of training for peace education teachers in each of three vacations, supplemented by mentoring in the classroom by mobile trainer-supervisors.

Monitoring and evaluation. There should be a clear line of responsibility for organizing monitoring and evaluation of pre-service and in-service teacher training and support.

5.7 Capacity building of regional and local managers and supervisors

A sensitive reform can only succeed if there is no 'weak link in the chain'. This means awareness-raising for managers at all levels of the education system, so that the needed resources, including teachers, teacher training, teacher supervision, teacher guides, textbooks and so on, are in place when needed. The support of local administrators is essential. For example, if the district education officer does not allocate fuel for a field visit by a mobile trainer, then the training cannot take place.

Hence, the field supervisors, inspectors or advisers based at district level should participate in motivational LTLT/life skills workshops so that they themselves can and will support schools in the innovation through monitoring and other support. Evaluation of a national programme will include assessment of the awareness level, attitudes and motivation of district level staff for LTLT/life skills work.

Box 5.4

'Democracy in education' programme for school supervisors and inspectors, Gambia,

Workshops were held for supervisors of schools in each of the six regions, based on a draft Guidebook.

The modules tackled:

- Principles and justifications for democracy in society and in education
- Indicators of democracy in schools and classrooms
- The nature of a 'democratic professional'
- Self-evaluation
- Democratic relationships in supervision and advisory work
- Democratic problem-solving.

The programme was based on an action research model over a two year period, which ran a workshop in one region but then returned to the previous region to evaluate how or whether the ideas were being put into practice. The final Guidebook, Democratic Professional Development was based on these evaluations and the participants' comments on the workshops⁶¹. This programme was a continuation of work on democracy in the teacher training college⁶², where it was realized that it was not enough for teacher trainees to learn about democracy there, but that they needed continuous support in their daily teaching lives.

5.8 Reinforcement through non-formal education and multiple channels of communication

The education ministry may hopefully be able to collaborate with other relevant ministries to reinforce the LTLT/life skills messages learned in school. These messages have sometimes been relayed through interactive radio instruction in schools and through factual, advocacy and 'soap opera' messages for general listeners. Newsletters and magazines have been used to reach young people in schools or youth generally. LTLT and life skills messages have been incorporated in adult literacy materials, stand alone courses and vocational skills training courses conducted by government and NGOs, as well as accelerated learning programmes for out-of-school adolescents.

Box 5.5

Multiple channels in refugee camps in Kenya

UNHCR's Peace Education Programme complemented school classes by 'Community Workshops', which covered the same skills and concepts in a 36 hour course (five days or ten half days) taught by specially trained facilitators. The aim was to train 20% of youth and adults through the workshops, on the basis that about half might pass on the message to about 10 people in their immediate environment, giving good reinforcement in the community of lessons learned in school. Special events were held, providing informal learning. Field evaluation after four years showed significant impact (Obura, 2002).

5.9 Establishing the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) function

The monitoring and evaluation function requires appropriate structures and resources in education ministries and other concerned organisations. Precise arrangements can be developed through exploratory workshops with key officials and stakeholders.

Box 5.6

Locating the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) of LTLT/life skills

Curriculum and textbooks units:	include staff trained in M&E for LTLT/life skills
Education ministry M&E units, EMIS:	include staff trained in M&E for LTLT/life skills
Examination boards:	some staff can be trained as focal points in assessment of LTLT/life skills
University education faculties, teacher training institutions:	some specialists can develop expertise in M&E of LTLT /life skills
Special programmes, projects eg for refugees, internally displaced or post-conflict populations:	budget for M&E of LTLT/life skills

Allocation of M&E responsibilities. There is no need for conflict between different organisational units regarding monitoring and evaluation tasks, as there is much to do. The critical requirement is to share out the tasks according to staff capacity, and to have good cooperation and coordination, - as is appropriate for 'learning to live together'.

M&E planning and coordination team. A working level team is needed, perhaps answering to the overall advisory group, a M&E advisory sub-group, or a steering group. The team can combine educators working on LTLT/life skills pilot projects or key school subjects such as social studies

with others having specialist knowledge of M&E. International support to this team may be useful in the early stages, for purposes of capacity-building. This team has to play a facilitative role, getting stakeholder consensus over the goals and design of the M&E process, and the interpretation and use of its findings.

Capacity-building. A key feature of the monitoring and evaluation plan would be capacity-building for M&E. We do not advocate a ‘high tech’ approach to this field in countries with weak economies and a recent history of conflict. However, as countries move towards greater sophistication in the measurement of learning achievements in key subject areas, then we advocate that the ‘citizenship’ and life skills dimension be specifically included in achievement monitoring.

Developing a M&E plan. The development of a monitoring and evaluation plan involves the clarification of goals, associated indicators (evidence that these goals are being met), the identification of kinds of data to be collected, by whom and how regularly, organizing the analysis of this data, and promoting the use of this information for improving educational efforts. These tasks are reviewed in chapters 6 and 7, which give an introduction to programme monitoring and evaluation, in relation to LTLT/ life skills.

Box 5.7

Illustrative approach to preparing a M&E plan

An example of a simple six-step process that can be used is as follows:

- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| 1. Focus: | Identify what LTLT/life skills programme(s) or activity(ies) to monitor and evaluate |
| 2. Questions: | Determine the overarching questions you will attempt to answer |
| 3. Indicators: | Decide what data to collect to answer these questions (don't aim to collect too much – this causes delays in collection and analysis, and may reduce data quality) |
| 4. Data collection: | Determine data sources, methods, types of instrument, samples |
| 5. Logistics: | Decide when to collect and who will collect data, – regularly for monitoring and periodically for evaluations. |
| 6. Analysis/feedback: | Plan to undertake simple analyses first and report them promptly to decision-makers, stakeholders and concerned specialist staff. |

Chapters 6 to 10 below focus on the monitoring and evaluation of field LTLT/life skills programmes. The Guide aims to help education authorities and NGO programme managers to get feedback on the effectiveness and impact of traditional and new education programmes in terms of developing knowledge, skills, attitudes and behaviours favourable to active citizenship, peace, human rights and life skills.

5.10 Long term commitment and funding

Committed national officials and specialists. For a national programme, there needs to be a team of influential educators within and outside the education ministry who are committed to this area over the long term. There needs to be a continuing budget line for a core team to sustain training, monitoring and evaluation, and development work in this area, as well as for needed teaching-learning materials.

Head-teachers. The key figures in educational innovation at school level are the head-teachers, whose support for any LTLT/life skills initiative is essential. Innovative teachers rely on heads to approve increased talk in their classes, rearrangement of furniture and holding lessons outdoors, for example, and for allocation of timetable time to LTLT/life skills. Head-teacher motivation over the longer term results from personal conviction and from ongoing incentives such as local and national praise and recognition (based on monitoring and evaluation).

Donor support and sustainability. Donor funding for an initiative in the field of LTLT/ life skills can be phased down somewhat after an initial period of capacity-building; BUT if it is phased out completely then the programme is unlikely to survive in what may be a turbulent and under-resourced education ministry or under-funded refugee education programme. There have been many initiatives in this area which have lasted as long as the donor staff who promoted them, or as long as a particular crisis was on international television stimulating donor interest. Citizenship, peace, human rights and life skills are too important for this situation to continue. The LTLT/life skills dimension should become a central feature of curriculum discourse, justified through research, monitoring and evaluation.

Box 5.8

Long term commitment

GTZ's long term support of education for marginalized populations in Sri Lanka affected by conflict and natural disasters has created a relationship of trust which enables GTZ to work with the education ministry on issues of social cohesion, peace education and related teacher training, as well as monitoring and evaluation. GTZ has supported the first national policy on Education for Peace and Social Cohesion, which cuts across all sub-sectors of education and aims to bring together coherent and sustained activity.



6

MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF FIELD PROGRAMMES: WHAT DATA IS TO BE COLLECTED?

Monitoring and evaluation (M&E) are ways of finding out how well an education programme, project or activity is achieving its goals and objectives. This will influence decisions about whether or not to continue a programme or practice, or how to improve it. M&E helps us look at the educational experience of the student, and whether through the curriculum, textbooks, pedagogy and school climate, the student gains knowledge, skills, attitudes and values supportive of active citizenship, life skills, peace and human rights.

Monitoring and evaluation is vital from the earliest pilot stages through to established programmes that need to move with the times and learn from good practice. Monitoring and evaluation should be built into LTLT/life skills programmes and budgets, to ensure that new programmes contribute effectively to social cohesion, citizenship and personal life skills development.

Box 6.1

Examples of scenarios for M&E initiatives:

- Evaluation of existing curriculum and teaching-learning materials for LTLT/life skills content (see chapter 4 above)
- M&E of field education programmes to assess LTLT/life skills awareness and learning
- M&E of LTLT/life skills pilot initiatives in schools or teacher training
- Similar activities focused on marginalized groups eg conflict-affected populations

Programme monitoring. Monitoring is the regular collection of data - a way of checking that a certain programme or activity is taking place. Often, monitoring in an educational setting is carried out by the educational actors themselves - teachers, headteachers, district education staff. The data, especially on inputs and activities, is collected regularly over an extended period of time, and is therefore useful as part of any evaluation. ***Hence data relevant to the LTLT/life skills dimension of education should be collected through regular monitoring processes, to help programme development and feed into programme evaluation.***

Programme evaluation. Evaluation is a more in-depth study of the conduct and achievements of an activity or programme, conducted as a special exercise and sometimes, but not always, led by an expert evaluation team. A distinction is often drawn between formative and summative evaluation:

- *Formative evaluation* is conducted during a project or programme
- *Summative evaluation* is conducted at the end of an initiative.

However, for education this distinction is less useful, since the aim is to achieve continuing improvements in the quality and relevance of children's learning - meaning that in a sense, most evaluation of schooling is formative.

Criteria. Internationally accepted criteria for programme evaluation include:

- Relevance
- Effectiveness
- Efficiency
- Impact
- Sustainability.⁶³

6. 1 The relationship of monitoring and evaluation

Monitoring. Monitoring data on LTLT/ life skills can be collected through generalist field staff or by specialists. During pilot projects, the data will often be collected by specially trained monitoring-advisory staff, and can be quite detailed (helping guide the development of the pilot project).

Box 6.2

Monitoring by generalist staff

For nation-wide programmes, monitoring will often be through non-specialists such as district-level supervisory staff with many other responsibilities, and will be limited in scope. Hence, it is important to train and motivate these staff to take an interest in the LTLT/life skills dimension, and encourage them to give it priority. The monitoring staff can collect vital information on whether supplies have reached schools and whether teachers have been trained or need training. If trained and motivated, they can also enquire and observe whether the LTLT/life skills lessons do actually take place as scheduled, and whether head-teachers, teachers and students appreciate them. They can ask to observe a citizenship or life skills class and see the pedagogy used, as well as looking at students' notebooks.

Use of monitoring data by evaluators. Evaluations can be carried out by 'in-house' evaluators, that is, evaluators attached to an implementing organization, such as a Ministry of Education or an implementing NGO. Alternatively, or in addition, there can be an external evaluator, someone independent of the implementing organization who is hired in order to carry out the evaluation. Regardless of where evaluators are based, they will draw upon monitoring information that has already been collected in-house as part of programme implementation.

6.2 Participatory processes for organizing monitoring and evaluation activities.

It is very important that evaluations find a way to involve all stakeholders. This approach is known as participative evaluation, and can include:

- school staff, education ministry personnel, academic specialists
- parent-teacher associations, school management committees
- women's groups, youth groups, other civil society organizations
- donor agencies.

Box 6.3

Human rights-based approach to evaluation

The participation of stakeholders and beneficiaries at all stages of evaluation is consistent with the human rights-based approach to programming, which is increasingly being implemented by international agencies.

The human rights principles that are the foundation of this approach are:

- explicit linkage to human rights
- non-discrimination and attention to vulnerable groups
- participation of stakeholders
- empowerment of stakeholders
- accountability.

Evaluators can develop an internal checklist to ensure they follow these principles.

The lead evaluator must decide which stakeholders to involve in evaluation design and implementation. This decision is critical, as it will affect the quality and range of the input that the evaluator will receive. The process should involve not only stakeholders with authority and responsibilities in relation to the evaluation objectives, but those who the programme impacts directly. Whenever possible, the direct beneficiaries of LTLT/life skills programming – that is, children and youth – should be consulted and even directly involved. This involvement should not be “token” but genuine.

Older students can participate directly eg. undertake youth surveys, conduct interviews, or organise focus groups.⁶⁴ Ideally student representatives can participate from the design stage onwards. They are well placed to understand the concerns, attitudes and values of the age-group concerned, and the life problems that they face. If students conduct their own consultations – complementary to those of adults - this will serve to empower and develop capacity among young people as well as cross-checking information obtained by adults.

6.3 Identifying monitoring and evaluation goals, focus and questions

Rationale and goals. At an early stage of planning monitoring and evaluation, it is important to identify the overarching goals for these activities. The aims can be set out as questions such as the following (set out in the Foreword), which cater to traditional education systems, pilot programmes and recent LTLT/life skills initiatives respectively :

Main question: *‘Does our traditional programme meet our current goals in the LTLT/ life skills dimension?’*

Main question: *Does our new LTLT/ life skills initiative - in our pilot/model schools – achieve its goals?*

Main question: *Does our system-wide LTLT/ life skills initiative achieve its goals?*

It is important to be clear about the reasons for trying to answer these questions. Who will use the results of the studies and how will these results potentially be used? Will programmes be extended or modified? New materials developed or new activities introduced? New personnel hired? Funding renewed? These policy issues will help in determining the scale and scope of an evaluation, as well as the burden to show the impact of a practice. They will show what kind of information is needed.

Focus. Based on the goals, a decision can be made on focus. For example, there might be interest in knowing about the impact of new curriculum standards or a teacher education initiative, as illustrated below.

Are new curricular standards related to citizenship education in grades 6-8:

- (a) *increasing the amount of citizenship that is taught at these grade levels?*
- (b) *increasing opportunities for student participation in school life?*
- (c) *increasing student competencies?*

Or

Are teacher exchanges between colleges in different ethnic settings contributing to:

- (a) *Improved trainee attitudes towards other ethnic groups?*
- (b) *Trainee interest in learning language of another ethnic group?*
- (c) *Trainee interest in learning and teaching about peace, citizenship, human rights?*

The levels of analysis could be multiple: schools or colleges, classrooms, teachers and pupils. If this is a national programme, a decision would need to be made about whether data would be collected for all schools or teacher training institutions (usually much too expensive and difficult, especially when attitudes and behaviour change are involved) or only a sampling of schools or institutions (and on what basis such a sample might be selected).

Key questions. The next step would be the formulation of key questions which reflect the overall goal and the areas of focus. Key questions are not the same as the specific questions that might be asked to teachers or students in surveys or interviews, but the main questions that we would want monitoring and evaluation to be able to answer. These questions are sometimes called indicators (Birzea et al., 2005). For example, in relation to new curricular frameworks for citizenship education, the key questions might be:

- *Are teachers familiar with the new citizenship education standards?*
- *Are the new citizenship standards affecting how citizenship education is being taught and practiced in schools?*
- *Is there any evidence of increased citizenship competencies on the part of students (and teachers) as a result of the new standards?*

For key questions when evaluating 'education for democratic citizenship' within a school, see Box 9.3 below.

The key questions can be developed into a 'results chain' or 'logic model' that further develops them into more specific questions.

Box 6.4

Constructing a logic model or results chain

A logical framework (or logic) model is a summary programme description, which shows the logical relationship between goals, objectives, activities, resources invested, and assumptions underlying the programme:

Goals>>>Objectives>>>Outputs>>>Activities>>>Inputs>>>Assumptions

A closely related concept is the 'results chain', which looks at the various stages of a programme and its impact.⁶⁵ Have the programmes have been implemented in the intended way (outputs), and is there evidence of achievement of intended learning and behavior (outcomes and impact)? (In this model, programme designers and evaluators are also asked to be explicit about the assumptions underlying the presumed causal relationship of process and outputs to outcomes and impact.)

Inputs>>>Process>>>Outputs>>>Outcomes>>>Immediate impact>>>Societal impact

Output data -on programme implementation - is collected through monitoring activities, which often take place in educational settings every few months or yearly. Outcome and impact data - on students' learning and behaviour - is collected through evaluations that usually take place after one or several years of programme implementation.

Terminology. Some evaluators use the terms impact and outcomes in different ways from those shown above, - for example, using 'outcomes' for longer term effects. 'Outputs' as described here could sometimes be called 'activities' or 'processes'. Hence it is important to define the way these terms are being used in a particular setting.

Continuing with the citizenship education example, for the key question 'Are teachers familiar with the new citizenship education standards?' the following results chain questions might be developed:

- *Are the curricular standards effectively disseminated to headmasters, department heads and teachers? (Ministry output, school input)*
- *Can teachers identify the key learning goals associated with the citizenship education standards? (Ministry outcome, school input)*

Following the identification of the key questions, we develop indicators to accompany each of these questions.

6.4 Indicators

Indicators are pieces of information (sometimes written as questions) that help us answer the key questions.

Box 6.5 Indicators

Indicators are ways of summarizing data and observations.

Quantitative indicators tell us how many, how often, how much. They are basically numbers, percentages, ratios etc.

Qualitative indicators help to describe or measure something that has happened eg how, when, who, where, which, what, why, and subjective things like attitudes, opinions and values.

Indicators should be SMART (first five items below) and useful to the programme:

Some qualities of a good indicator:

- Specific
- Measurable
- Attainable
- Relevant
- Time-framed
- Able to be disaggregated (eg by gender)
- Verifiable
- Having a meaning that is easily understood.

The development of indicators takes skill and practice but will be very helpful in helping to understand changes in programme output and outcomes over time. Many times, it is possible to take a research or evaluation question and slightly shift the language in order to develop an indicator.

For example, the question ***‘Are the curricular standards effectively disseminated to headmasters, department heads and teachers?’*** can be turned into indicators such as:

- *Percentage of schools which have received a hard copy of the curricular standards*
- *Percentage of schools and staff who have received training on the curricular standards*
- *Whether the standards are posted on the Ministry of Education website*
- *Whether the standards have been included in a national educators’ newsletter.*

This example illustrates that indicators of ‘outputs’ from an education ministry (eg dissemination of hard copies of the curricular standards to schools) may be ‘inputs’ from the viewpoint of the school.

The question ***‘Is our in-service teacher training initiative successful in promoting peace or citizenship education for students?’*** can generate indicators such as:

- *Measurable teacher skills and knowledge in relation to peace or citizenship education (outcome of training)*
- *Teacher use of these skills and knowledge in the classroom (outcome or direct impact of training)*
- *Skills, knowledge and attitudes of students in these teachers’ classrooms, as compared to those promoted in the teacher training programme (immediate impact compared to overall programme goals for student learning).*

Generally speaking, three or four indicators might be developed for each key question or stage of a results chain. Given the intensive study of a programme during an evaluation, there will be more indicators for an evaluation than in the normal monitoring and reporting process.

Box 6.6 below gives examples of possible results chain indicators written as 'data' while Boxes 8.4 and 9.1 in later chapters suggest results chain indicators through questions.

Box 6.6

Examples of indicators for a peace education initiative

Results chain

Indicators

Inputs (national level):

Peace and conflict transformation education mandated through stand alone and/or cross-curricular framework and policy for peer mediation in schools
Funds set aside in national budget for staff trainings and learning materials

Inputs (school level):

Number and percentage of teachers having the teacher resource book
Number and percentage of concerned teachers who have received special training for the course
Number of teachers getting and using sheets of large paper for wallcharts

Process (national level):

Announcement and publicising of thematic integration of peace and conflict transformation education into national curricula; stakeholder involvement
Preparation and production of learning materials
Identification of educational institutions and NGOs to assist in teacher training and support, and student trainings for mediation
Posters and awareness-raising materials developed for students
Description of peer mediation programme models

Process (school level):

Number and percentage of teachers assessed as using experiential teaching-learning of various types during the course; problems encountered
Student reports on teaching-learning processes used in the course

Outputs:

(National level) Numbers of learning materials disseminated
Number of teachers participating in in-service teacher trainings
Number of classes/students participating in peer mediation training
Number of classes/schools teaching peace education themes
Number of classes/schools reporting special events or extracurricular activities related to peace education
Number and percentage of students completing the course
Number and percentage of students trained as peer mediators

Outcomes:

Qualitative and quantitative data on student learning

Box 6.6**Examples of indicators for a peace education initiative**

Immediate impact:	Number and percentage of students reporting newly learned behaviours Teachers and others reporting on observed behaviour Number of successful mediations recorded by peer mediation teams Number of fights and bullying recorded in school register
Societal impact:	Data on youth involvement in community activities Anecdotal evidence that some of the students who followed the course are doing mediation in the community Other indicators – see Annex 3.

6.5 Time frame for collecting evaluation data

Different timings may be considered for gathering data on impact, such as.

- After-only design: data collected during or after a course
- Before/after design: data collected before and after a course
- Time series design: data collected before a course and at intervals thereafter.

Where resources permit, data can be collected for similar groups of students following and not following the course:

- Control group design: collecting data from similar groups of students following and not (or not yet) following the course (to identify changes unrelated to the course)

Box 6.7**Longitudinal studies**

Where possible, evaluation should be designed so that the same groups of children can be studied over a cycle of schooling, to note changes in knowledge, attitudes, values and behaviours. This longitudinal approach has been adopted, for example, for citizenship programmes introduced in England and in Northern Ireland.

'Tracer studies' of young people who have followed innovative peace or citizenship-oriented programmes can help measure longer-term impact, – on a case study basis, as it is difficult to trace a class of students after they have left an educational institution. 'Backwards mapping' may also be possible in some situations, looking at the educational experiences which may have been 'triggers' for young people's active citizenship (Davies, 2005).

6.6 The problem of attribution

Can observed positive changes in behaviour found after students complete an education programme be attributed to the programme? 'Causal links' in the logic model may suggest that answer is 'Yes', but other outside factors might explain the results. Although we may be eager to show that LTLT programming has certain behavioral results with children, we should be honest in actively seeking explanations that are unrelated to the programme intervention.

- For example, a reduction in violence in a refugee camp after the introduction of a peace education programme in schools and for adults coincided with an increased police presence. The evaluator concluded that both factors probably contributed (Obura, 2002). In another situation, a failure to see an immediate reduction in violence might be related to external factors, such as increased poverty or political instability.



7

DATA COLLECTION

Following the identification of the “what” – monitoring and evaluation questions and associated indicators – a detailed plan will need to be developed for the collection of data. Data collection must take into account both sources and methods of data collection.

7.1 Sources

Using data that is collected regularly. When an LTLT/life skills program is implemented within a school system, it may be the case that existing student assessments and school-based information (such as incidents of violence) can be part of the data that is used in monitoring and evaluation. If these are insufficient to answer an important question then the evaluators can consider developing new sources but for a national programme especially, should be prepared to make long-term commitment to this data collection.

Collecting special data for evaluation purposes. Additional data could include focus group interviews with students and teachers, interviews with students, teachers, head-teachers and trainers, written tests and questionnaires, observations and other data collection instruments closely related to the goals of the programme. It will also be necessary to determine who will be collecting what data, as it is likely that data collectors will include those based both inside and outside of the educational system.

For example, if schools already collect information in relation to subject-specific teaching, can this be used to identify the number of contact hours between students and teachers for a specific LTLT/life skills programme area? If the initiative involves the introduction of a peer mediation program and there is no institutional mechanism for monitoring school-wide enrichment programs, then a new monitoring and evaluation task may need to be introduced.

Problems related to the collection, transmission and processing of data should be identified as early as possible so that strategies can be developed for addressing them. Evaluations that look at outcomes and impact rather than inputs and outputs will often require the involvement of specialist evaluators or researchers, even if based partly on monitoring data collected from within the educational system, because of the need to collect and analyse additional information.

7.2 Methods

There are numerous approaches to data collection and many considerations for choosing which to use.⁶³

Box 7.1

Typical methods for evaluation of outcomes and impact⁶⁷

- Reviews of existing data
- Questions for interviews and/or focus groups (focus groups can also be asked to perform and discuss a skit- short impromptu drama)
- Written tests and questionnaires (where students have good reading skills and comprehension, and are willing to report truthfully on attitudes and behaviour)
- Direct observation (in classrooms, playground, meetings etc)

Quantitative and qualitative approaches to data collection were summarized by Obura (2007) as shown in Box 7.2.

Box 7.2 Options for data collection instruments	
<p>Quantitative Tools of Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use of secondary statistics Statistical surveys Questionnaires, self-administered Questionnaires, assisted self-administered Questionnaires, through rapid, highly structured oral interview Interviews, structured Telephone structured interviews Content analysis 	<p>Qualitative Tools of Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Interviews, semi-structured Interviews, unstructured Telephone interviews Focus group discussions Case studies Field observations Participant observation Videos Artefacts Documentary research and textual analysis of a variety of texts including diaries, life histories, etc.

Obura (2007) provides data collection examples related to different LTLT themes (see Annex 3). The choice of methods will be influenced by balancing:

- Methodological considerations (what are viewed as the “better ways” to collect reliable and valid data in relation to evaluation questions), and
- Feasibility (the amount of resources and human capacity that are available for the tasks).

There are many resources available that detail techniques for the development of surveys, conducting interviews, sampling, analysis and so on. It is beyond the scope of this Guide to go into depth on each of the potential data collection methods. Users of this Guide who feel the need for additional technical know-how should consult one or more of these other resources.

7.3 Special methodological considerations

M&E is a complex field, even where observations are relatively straightforward. The learning of skills, concepts and values for living with others is not straightforward. Hence especial care is needed to make data as valid and reliable as possible. This includes adapting methods to meet local culture and capacities.

For difficult environments (eg post-conflict), it is best to decide what information is really needed for future decision-making, and to use:

- Simple methods
- Common-sense approaches to design, such as collecting good data in a few locations
- Off-the-record informal discussions about what is possible and what is really happening.

For more stable environments with more technical capacity, however, the use of more sophisticated M&E may help to generate interest in and support for the programme.

7.3.1 Validity and reliability of data

Data must be **valid** – giving a true picture, and **reliable** – meaning that it is consistent on different occasions or when collected by different evaluators. This is quite difficult when dealing with a sensitive subject like personal behaviour and attitudes, -or whether schools are following government policy! Students and teachers may consciously or unconsciously give answers that are biased or inaccurate, -perhaps to please the interviewer or because they do not acknowledge their own weaknesses even to themselves.

To overcome personal **bias** and other measurement problems, the best solution is to use several different approaches, and compare the results. *‘This might mean, for example, using several different ways of assessing communication skills, such as observation in typical interactions, a self-report checklist, and role play. It may involve using information from different sources: the teacher, the student, peers or others.’⁶⁸*

This use of multiple approaches is called **triangulation**. Triangulation means using various sources and types of information, and getting different viewpoints, to see if they point to similar conclusions. It can also lead evaluators to ask more questions. For example:

- If reported fights in the playground decrease and students tell evaluators that they have stopped fighting, these two results reinforce each other.
- If reported fights are unchanged, but students say they have stopped fighting, perhaps the students are giving biased replies to please the interviewer. Can the evaluators probe more deeply?
- If reported fights are unchanged or increase, but students say they have stopped fighting, perhaps very minor fights are now recorded, because of the changed perspective of the students and teachers? Can the evaluators check out whether the type of fights recorded by the school has changed?

An important aspect of validity is to be inclusive in terms of who is studied in relation to a programme. This means ensuring that a healthy cross-section of types of respondents are included in data collection, and that their responses can be clustered according to background characteristics.

In this regard, Obura (2007) stresses the need to interview a valid cross-section of the community when conducting a survey of the impact of an education programme. In a developing country, for example, the interviewees should include:

- Community respondents: Illiterate women over 35 years (the most neglected category ever interviewed, mostly omitted); 'heads' of households (generally male); adults (male and female) over 25 yrs who have been to school; community leaders (traditional, from the current structures, religious, women leaders, rich business people, the most educated people). Relevant specific occupational profiles, such as farmers, fisherfolk, herders; or from religious groups; or ethnic groups; etc.
- Education sector respondents: It is important to separate out the 'expert' (educators') opinion on education and the non-expert. Also, perceptions/data from school heads and sector administrators are generally different from that of rank and file teachers; and female teachers often respond differently from male teachers.
- Learners: Learners are the main focus of the evaluation. Their responses should be treated as a separate category from the expert education sector responses. Some recent programme graduates, one- to five-year graduates, should be included among interviewees, if possible (Obura, 2007: 42).

Another aspect of validity is to acknowledge the limitations of the evaluators themselves. Evaluators bring their own cultural and personal experience and attitudes to their task, and therefore have to work hard at avoiding bias. This is one reason for involving a wide range of stakeholders in the evaluation, and taking their guidance into account. In addition, it is good practice for evaluators to describe their own background in the evaluation report.

'Another feature of qualitative method is the honesty, the openness with which researchers describe their own approach to their work: their views, which they understand may be biased; their expectations, which they realise may be informed by ignorance; their approach, which they know is coloured by their previous experience. Sharing this information means permitting the reader or observer to detect bias in the approach to investigation or evaluation. Unlike the quantitative researcher who assumes the objectivity of his work, and his method, the qualitative researcher reduces his subjectivity by his explicitness. With regard to evaluation, this means that all decisions regarding choice of evaluation method and selection of instruments are fully explained.' (Obura, 2007:33).

7.3.2. Adjusting to different settings and cultures of monitoring and evaluation

In some societies, notably North America and Europe, there has been a long history of developing written questionnaires that cover social and emotional development, attitudes, values and behaviour patterns. The specific questions (test items) have been checked statistically to ensure that they give answers harmonious with others having a similar intention. There may be nationally standardized sets of responses to these questions.⁶⁹

In many countries, however, this sort of test development and standardization has not taken place as yet. If they are traditional societies, written questionnaires about attitudes and behaviour may in any case be of limited use, due to a strong tendency to disbelieve the anonymity of the process, leading to invalid responses.⁷⁰ Even face-to-face interviews may encounter cultural problems.

Points to be aware of include:

(a) *Fear and anxiety*: the subject matter can be sensitive. People may be unwilling to reveal their behaviour patterns and attitudes in matters such as politics, religion or personal relationships, because it – in exercises which are perceived to be lacking in protection for respondents – their responses could damage their reputation or friendships, and in some settings put them in danger. Students may believe that their comments on these matters will influence their teachers to have a better or worse opinion of them, -as they may not be confident of complete anonymity (an evaluator might make a comment that implicates them, even unintentionally, or the teacher may recognize their handwriting). These factors can be especially important in traditional or authoritarian societies, and where people feel insecure.

(b) *Social norms: people may bias their replies to please the interviewer or marker of the questionnaire*. Even in Western societies, where there is a social value requiring people to 'speak out' and say something 'different', people may adapt their reply to please the interviewer or teacher, to show good manners and create friendly feelings. In many more traditional societies, there is a social norm of giving the reply that is polite to the other person, such as saying 'Yes' as a courtesy to a visitor or influential person, even when the answer is really 'No'. In these societies, there are indirect ways of finding the answer, such as using 'go-betweens'. Perhaps evaluators can adapt this idea, -by training some young people as interviewers.

(c) *Other psychological, social and cultural factors*:

- Students may bias their replies out of a sense of solidarity with - and to please - their teacher, giving good reports on a programme which they may not really feel strongly about.
- There may be a 'culture gap' between respondents and evaluators. Sometimes an interviewer from outside a community (an international evaluator or a national professional from another region) cannot be certain about what a respondent understands a question to mean, or the question itself may be rooted in the thinking of another culture.
- Some cultures value self-praise while others require modesty.
- In any society, respondents may exaggerate their own good intentions and behaviour!

7.3.3 Use of elicitive methods

A strategy for addressing the above-mentioned problems is getting people to talk about an issue without the evaluator giving indications of preferred or 'right' answers. Lederach calls this *eliciting* their response.⁷²

Box 7.3

Elicitive questions used in a baseline study for a peace education programme

The following elicitive questions were asked of adults and young people in a baseline study in the refugee camps in Kenya where a peace education programme was being instituted by UNHCR. The questions were asked again after the programme had been functioning for four years, and the answers were compared to assess impact within the community:

1. What is peace?
2. What would you do if someone pushed ahead of you in the queue for water?
3. Whose responsibility is it to maintain peace in the camp?
4. What do you do and what does the community do to keep peace in the camp?
5. What can you do to ensure peace in the future? (a) in the camp? (b) in your country? (c) in the world?

The essence of *elicitive* or *open-ended* questioning is to get people to speak spontaneously and thus to show 'what is on their mind' and the values and attitudes they hold (or prefer to mention). This contrasts with than asking them narrowly conceived questions which reflect the ideas and worldview of the interviewer. People may be asked a very 'open' (rather than a 'closed') question, such as 'What is peace?' or 'What are the characteristics of a good citizen?' The replies are analysed, to see which themes and viewpoints are most often mentioned spontaneously. These methods can be used during interviews with individuals, with 'focus groups' etc. A related approach makes use of drawings etc.

Box 7.4

Elicitive methods based on art, writing and drama

- Asking students to make drawings on LTLT/life skills themes, and then asking them to talk about the drawings
- 'Draw and write': asking students to draw a picture on a theme such as 'the good citizen' or 'my rights' and to write a few words or sentences of explanation. This is a useful and simple tool in assessing constructs and understandings.
- Asking students to construct a short drama or role play on a given theme
- Asking some or all students to keep a diary, for a shorter or longer period of time.

Another approach uses anthropological principles of participant observation, as when a young researcher regularly participates in a course, alongside the other participants. He or she will choose a position somewhere between silent observer and full participant, according to circumstances. Teachers can of course act as participant observers, although the dual teacher-as-researcher role is not always easy to manage.

The conversations or written materials arising from elicitive approaches are analysed ('content analysis') to see what themes and concepts are at the forefront of respondents' minds, using a framework as in Box 4.5 above, or a framework developed from examining the responses themselves.

Box 7.5

Quick hints for conducting an evaluation

- Involve all stakeholders in evaluation design, implementation and follow-up action.
- Obtain high level authorization for an evaluation, and consider establishing an advisory group to maximize cooperation and 'buy-in' to the results.
- Select field evaluators with needed language and education skills, provide intensive training and cross-check the reliability and validity of their work.
- Interview all categories of stakeholders and participants (from education ministry to local community groups, teachers and students) regarding their understanding of the programme and their perception of its importance, strengths and weaknesses.
- If a programme is beginning or under consideration, undertake a baseline survey of ongoing activities and of the knowledge, skills and attitudes of the target group –and of teachers.
- If a programme involves many schools, teacher colleges etc, undertake a high quality evaluation in selected institutions rather than collecting poor quality data for all
- Pilot test all formats (eg interview schedules, questionnaires, tests) before finalization. Reduce data formats to what can be easily collected and analysed.
- Use open-ended interviews and group discussions with students to reduce respondent bias.
- Use written questionnaires and tests with care, since they may give unreliable and biased results especially in some settings, and comprehension rates may be low
- Don't get bogged down in time-consuming complex analyses, –start with simple tabulations and if necessary work on a sub-sample of the data, –aim to get preliminary results quickly.
- Design evaluation instruments that will result in recommendations for future action – how to improve programme content, effectiveness and sustainability.



8

MONITORING AND EVALUATION AT SCHOOL LEVEL

8.1. Goals

Regardless of the LTLT/life skills programme design – whether it is focused on resource development and teacher training, or an after-school programme, for example – learning by children and youth will remain the focus of the effort. In this chapter we look at the ways of monitoring and evaluating this learning in schools. This can take place at one or all of the following points in relation to an LTLT/ life skills intervention, whether national or within a particular NGO project or school:

- when a new initiative is under consideration ('needs assessment')
- when the initiative is about to begin ('baseline study')
- during the initiative (monitoring and 'formative evaluation')
- at the end of a particular stage of the initiative ('summative evaluation').

8.2. M&E Processes

8.2.1 Collecting data in schools

Monitoring usually involves regular collection of limited data from all schools. Evaluators may visit a limited number of schools, such as a group of pilot schools (and a similar group of non-pilot schools for comparison). For a national programme, evaluators may focus on a random stratified sample of schools, or on representative schools – schools which illustrate different operational conditions and population groups. Evaluators may also wish to visit known ‘good practice’ schools, which illustrate a programme at its best, to see what can be achieved under favourable conditions.

If data collection is to be coordinated and at least partly carried out by non-school personnel, entry to each school will need to be negotiated with the concerned authorities. The sequence of events within the school is important, so that there is full cooperation – it is good to begin with a friendly conversation with the principal and then (selected members of) the staff.

School-based M&E will involve all members of the school community, or at least samples of representative groups, as well as community stakeholders. Because we are looking to see how programming affects behavior and attitudes, qualitative approaches are particularly appropriate. A typical process is shown in Box 8.1.

Box 8.1

Example of M&E procedure at school level

- | | |
|----------|---|
| Stage 1. | Collection of basic information maintained at school level (inputs, process, any records of student behaviour and activities) |
| Stage 2. | Open-ended interviews and focus groups: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Principal (own learning and changes; plus inputs, process, changes in student achievement, behaviour and activities)• Teachers and other personnel (as for principal)• Students (feedback on lessons or activities, perceptions of their value, reported changes in own behaviour or others)• Parents/ Parent-Teacher Association/ Community Education Committee/ community groups/general population in the locality (as appropriate) |
| Stage 3. | Lesson observation, examination of teacher and pupil written materials |
| Stage 4. | Administration of written questionnaires (if any). |

8.2.2 Assessment processes

Some aspects of assessment have been considered in chapters 6 and 7. Briefly, to assess students’ competencies we have to use different approaches when observing or testing students’ knowledge, concepts and skills, and when measuring attitudes, values and behaviours.

Assessment of knowledge and cognitive skills: Interviews and observation of lessons and class discussions can be used to assess learning related to knowledge and concepts. For older students (and adults), use can be made of written tests using multiple choice and open-ended questions,

covering the key competencies and themes of the course units. They should always be trialled with students before use. Comprehension of written tests may be a problem, even with students who have completed primary school, - especially in developing countries affected by conflict or other crises.

Assessment of attitudes, values and behaviours. Written questionnaires are problematic in many settings, and more valid results may be obtained through interviews, focus groups and other methods, using elicitive techniques (see chapter 7).

Box 8.2 **Assessment**

"The term 'assessment' may be used in education to refer to any procedure or activity that is designed to collect information about the knowledge, attitudes, or skills of a learner or group of learners.

A more detailed definition is that assessment is:

'the process of obtaining information that is used to make educational decisions about students, to give feedback to the student about his or her progress, strengths, and weaknesses, to judge instructional effectiveness and curricular adequacy, and to inform policy'.⁷³

8.2.3 Measuring change

There are several techniques for measuring change and development in students' knowledge, skills, attitudes and behaviour, including.

- (a) *'Before and after' interviews, questionnaires, tests.*
- (b) *Direct questions about the impact of a course.*
- (c) *Asking students about the impact of several school subjects.*
- (d) *Observing students' participation in classroom lessons*
- (e) *Observing students' participation in whole school activities and school climate*
- (f) *Measures of behaviour changes associated with the school setting*
- (g) *Measures of behaviour changes in society.*

Data collection instruments relating to these categories are illustrated below.

8.3. Criteria and tools

Identifying data requirements. The data requirements will be based on the key questions underlying the evaluation and/or a results chain/log frame (as discussed in chapter 6).

- Key questions can be used as the basis of presentation when the aim is to assess the general status of LTLT/life skills education in a normal education programme
- A results chain or logical framework is important when looking at the results of a specific Initiative, where new resources and teacher training have (hopefully) been supplied to strengthen this dimension of learning. Key questions can be formulated for each stage of the results chain.

A key-questions framework is presented in Birzea et al. (2005), as the basis for school level evaluation of existing coverage of 'education for democratic citizenship' (EDC) - see Box 8.3. This framework was designed for use within Europe, including countries in transition, and would need adaptation for use elsewhere. It was designed for school self-evaluation, prior to a new initiative to strengthen EDC, but can be adapted to external evaluation. The term 'EDC' could be replaced without much problem by LTLT, or human rights, or citizenship!

Box 8.3

'Key questions' for evaluating education for democratic citizenship (EDC) within a school

Areas	Key questions ('quality indicators')
Curriculum, teaching and learning	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Is there evidence of an adequate place for EDC in the school's goals, policies and curriculum plans?2. Is there evidence of students and teachers acquiring understanding of EDC and applying EDC principles to their everyday practice in schools and classrooms?3. Are the design and practice of assessment within the school consonant with EDC?
School ethos and climate	<ol style="list-style-type: none">4. Does the school ethos and climate adequately reflect EDC principles?
Management and development	<ol style="list-style-type: none">5. Is there evidence of effective school leadership based on EDC principles?6. Does the school have a sound development plan reflecting EDC principles?

Data requirements using a results chain framework are illustrated in Box 8.4. Here the data collection relates to a specific initiative that has already been taken to promote LTLT/life skills education. Special efforts are needed to collect information relating to the 'theory of change' – to the ways in which the activities are expected or believed to have a transforming effect on students and lead to beneficial impacts on attitudes and behaviour.

Box 8.4**Examples of data collection for M&E of a LTLT/life skills course in a school****Context**

Was the programme accepted by the school management committee, the parent teacher association, the wider community? What are the main concerns of these local stakeholders regarding student learning needs (eg education about HIV/AIDS), about the programme itself and its place in the curriculum?

Inputs

Did the programme take place as planned? Were the materials received on time? Did the teachers receive the needed training and conduct the full number of lessons? Was there support or training from programme supervisors visiting the school, and how often? If there have been problems regarding inputs, how can they be solved? Were there any events which prevented the school from functioning or the lessons being conducted?

Processes

What was the approximate study time in hours devoted to the programme units (if applicable) for the different years (grades)(classes) ?

Classroom observation (see ...) and class records (& feedback from staff and students): How many lessons were conducted using participative and experiential methods? Could the teachers make the link between stimulus activities and the lesson objective? Did the teachers use their training?

Do the teachers need more training, and if so, what should be the focus of this training? Have other teachers been affected by the programme, -have they praised it or complained about it?

Outputs

How many students completed which parts of the course?

What physical evidence is there of the course work?

What voluntary activities were undertaken as part of the course work?

What results were obtained in tests or examinations?

Outcomes and immediate impact on student behaviours

What learning outcomes can be deduced from the interviews with students and observers, using elicitive (open-ended) methods? -see suggested questions below

What results are obtained in written questionnaires?

Have there been quantitative or qualitative changes in student behaviour in the school? (see Annex ...)

Have there been changes in school climate? (see 9.4 below)

Wider social changes partially attributable to the impact of the programme

Are there events or changes outside the school which may be partially attributed to the programme?-see list of indicators in Annex4.

The tools that follow offer suggested questions and themes for interview and focus groups. They are arranged according to the methods listed in section 8.2 above. For convenience of layout, the tools are placed together at the end of this chapter. No special tools are offered for written tests and surveys, since these are more familiar, and – as discussed earlier – may be less applicable in some of the adverse situations addressed by the Guide.

It may be useful to have a focus group discussion or mini-workshop with a group of teachers before finalizing the questions for students. This could focus on what the teachers believe or hope that they have taught the students –in relation to LTLT/life skills, either directly as the substance of lessons, or indirectly as part of class and school organizational arrangements and events. Data from students will indicate whether the teachers' views are realistic.

List of tools for interview and focus group work:

Box 8.6 Examples of elicitive questions that can be asked without referring to a particular course

Box 8.7 Examples of elicitive questions that can be used with students, whether or not there has been a special course

Box 8.8 Examples of elicitive questions about a special course

Box 8.9 Examples of questions for teachers and head-teachers about a special course

Box 8.10 Examples of additional questions for community members about the impact of a special course

Box 8.11 Examples of additional questions for project field staff

See also Annex 2 for an example of a classroom observation schedule

Elicitive questions that can be used 'before and after'. For a needs assessment or baseline study, we cannot ask students about their experience of a new LTLT/life skills course, because it hasn't happened yet. We can give ordinary tests of knowledge and skills, related to the proposed course. And we can ask relevant 'elicitive' (open-ended, 'drawing out') questions in interviews and to guide discussion in focus groups. Box 8.6 gives examples of interview questions that can be used before as well as after a course (these questions do not refer to a specific course). These questions can also be used as appropriate with groups other than students, such as out-of-school young people, parents, community members, teachers and other educators.

Asking students about the impact of several school subjects. Another possibility is for an evaluator to talk with students about their overall perception of their school learning and experience, without indicating a special interest in LTLT or life skills. The idea would be to find out students' views when they do NOT know what the evaluator has in mind. These questions can be used whether or not a special LTLT or life skills course has been introduced in the school. These interviews would have to take place before the evaluation activities clearly related to LTLT or life skills, as word travels fast. Some possible questions are illustrated in Box 8.7.

Asking students directly about a specific course or activity. If students have completed part or all of an LTLT/life skills course unit, they can be asked questions or – where appropriate – given written tests about knowledge and skills included in the programme.

In terms of impact, they can be asked about how it has affected them.

Box 8.5**Aligning impact questions to participants' 'theories of change'**

The questions to students and others about a special course can be designed in part to match the 'theories of change' held by teachers, students and others about how the course may be transformative. For example, - 'After the first year of the course (or after the lessons on anger management or 'I- statements'), did you find any change in your behaviour towards others, and if so, what do you think caused it? What particular lesson activities influenced you the most? Did the effect last? Did the course have the same effect on your friends?' See also Box 8. 7.

Observing students' participation in LTLT/life skills lessons – and classroom climate and pedagogy. Classroom observation is a well-established pedagogic field and many formats exist for noting the interaction between students and teachers. For present purposes, the observation can yield data on whether students (and teachers!) have acquired skills in facilitating discussion, promoting cooperation, and showing respect for others, as well as their grasp of knowledge and concepts related to citizenship, human rights, peace and life skills. The observation will show whether the teacher has been adequately trained for interactive and experiential learning, and its application in this area.

The evaluators will need to train the 'classroom observers' well in order to obtain reliable (reproducible) and valid results. As part of the training, several observers can observe the same lesson, followed by comparison of the notes they take and development of further guidelines for effective standardisation.

The observation format should feature key elements of the actual training and guidance given to teachers for their LTLT/ life skills work, so that the effectiveness of training can be assessed and improvements made. For an example of an observation format of this type, see Annex 2.

Whole school programming, climate and events. The culture, 'climate' and daily practices of school – not only the formal curriculum – greatly influence the ability to reach LTLT goals. Some LTLT interventions are focused on the overall school community or an event that involves all students. For example, a school may adopt one of the LTLT themes and use it to try to improve democratic and participatory processes within the school. Monitoring and evaluation of this kind of programming might involve many different members of the school community (including students and teachers) examining issues such as decision-making structures in the school.

Schools or researchers could also collect data relating to specific 'whole school' events, such as a mock election or human rights awareness day.

In addition to drawing on tools presented elsewhere, data specifically on school climate often include relations and information sharing between different members of the school community, transparency of decision-making, and school leadership. School climate surveys can be aligned to goals of LTLT/ life skills programmes such as:

- student participation in school governance and discipline
- dispute resolution systems/mediation
- sense of fairness in relation to school policy
- inclusion of marginalized students and responsiveness to needs.

School climate surveys are often administered to every member of a school community, and sometimes to a sampling of parents. When not included as part of a formal M&E process, they can be self-administered in order to foster self-improvement.

Questions for teachers and head-teachers about a specific course or activity. Some of the questions mentioned in earlier Boxes are relevant. Examples of possible questions specifically for use with teachers and head-teachers (adapted from Ashton, 2007b) are shown in Box 8.9.

Questions for parents and members of the community. Various of the questions in the above-mentioned Boxes can be used. Those in Box 8.6 can help give a picture of the knowledge base, attitudes and values in the community. Alternative or additional questions about the impact of a particular new course or activity are illustrated in Box 8.10.

Questions for project field staff. Field staff may be asked similar questions to those for teachers. In addition, questions about teachers' attitudes and competencies, and the practicalities of field support, can be added, as illustrated in Box 8.11.

8.4 Data analysis

This Guide does not present standard analysis procedures for survey data, but focuses only on aspects particular to LTLT/life skills.

Experienced educators need to look at the data emerging from the school surveys, and situate it within the results chain categories and/or key questions framework. Student learning may be categorized further using a framework of the type set out in chapter 4, in Box 4.5. The framework may be developed or adapted to fit the responses (while sufficiently reflecting goals and objectives to identify gaps and weaknesses).

For further comments on analysis, please see chapter 10.

Box 8.5**Examples of elicitive questions that can be asked without referring to a particular course****Values**

- What are the most important values held in this society? What are their advantages (how do they help people and society have better lives?) What are their disadvantages (do they do harm?)

Concepts

- What is or are peace/tolerance/human rights and responsibilities/a good citizen/etc... ?
(Choose 1 or 2 items)
- Who is responsible for peace/tolerance/human rights and responsibilities/a good citizen/etc... ?
(Choose 1 or 2 items)

Knowledge and skills

- What can you tell me about the legal systems and constitution of the country? What do you know about the structure of local and national government? About voting? About the United Nations?
- What knowledge, skills and values are important for maintaining health and safety during the adolescent years (from about age 12 to 20) when young people come under the influence of their peers?

Past and likely future behaviour ('self-reported' behaviour)

- What would you do if someone pushed ahead of you in a queue for food, water or money? What are the most frequent types of violent behaviour in the home and society?
- Are there some things that people do in school or your community that are against the rights –or well-being – of women or children? (Ask about military recruitment of children under 15 years, if appropriate.)
- Do people in your local area cooperate to solve problems? Can you give examples? (Then) Who organizes this cooperation?
- Do you belong to any associations or organizations?
- Have you voted/do you plan to vote in local elections?
- (For young people) Are there some things your friends do that you don't like because they are bad for health or safety, or are harmful to others? Can you give examples? (Then) What do you do if your friends tell you to do these things? (Then, if appropriate) Can you give examples, from people of your own sex, # or people of the opposite sex?

Box 8.6

Examples of elicitive questions that can be used with students, whether or not there has been a special course

1. What school subjects do you like best? Why?*
2. What school subjects do you dislike? Why?*
3. What are the most useful things you have learned in school? (Follow-up: When –in which subject areas or other aspects of school– did you learn these things?)
4. What things have you learned in school that help you in your personal life and to get along with other people? (Follow up: When –in which subject areas or other aspects of school– did you learn these things?)

If wished (or in pilot testing, to get to specifics):

5. What have you learned in science and health education lessons that is helpful in your life?
6. What have you learned in social studies/citizenship/peace education lessons (choose local title) that is helpful in your life?

Box 8.7

Examples of elicitive questions for students about a specific course

Broad questions

1. Do you like '....' (give local name for the subject matter)?
Follow up:- If Yes: What do you like? If NO, why not?
2. Do you believe that this course will be of **use** to you and other students in your present or future lives?
Follow up:- If Yes: How?
3. What has the course added to your **knowledge**, or has it given you new ideas and concepts?
4. What special **skills** have you learned during the course?
5. How has the course changed your own or other students' **values and attitudes**? (ask for examples)
6. Has the course changed students' **behaviour**? Can you give examples, for yourself or others?
(If appropriate) Have you seen bullying in your school? Can you give examples (teachers, students; physical or other bullying? Gender-based harassment)? Did you discuss bullying during the course?
Has the pattern of bullying changed since the course?
7. Is there any change in how you and your fellow students feel about people who are from a **different social group** to you? Or in how you behave towards them?

Box 8.7**Examples of elicitive questions for students about a specific course**

8. **(Theory of change - example)** After the first year of the course (or after the lessons on anger management or 'I- statements or gender etc), did you find any change in your behaviour towards others, and if so, **what do you think caused it?** What particular lesson activities influenced you the most? Did the effect last? Did the course have the same effect on your friends?

Thematic questions

- 9-11. (For three lesson topics suited to age and linked to key goals) Do you remember lessons about '...?'

Follow up: - What did you learn from those lessons? Has it changed how you and your friends think about things?

Follow up: - Can you give an example of how you or someone else behaved differently because of those lessons?

(Repeat this question for three (or more) key themes from the course that are likely to affect students' behaviour.)

Wrap-up questions

12. (Where relevant) Has the course changed your thinking about **violent conflict** in your own country or other countries (or violence and pressure in personal relationships)?
Follow up: - If Yes: How? What are the problems caused by armed conflict? (Peace overview) or violence/pressure in personal relationships (Life skills)
13. Has the course changed your thinking about the rights and **responsibilities of citizens** of this country? If so, how? (Civic and human rights overview)
14. What kind of **teaching and learning activities** did the teacher use during the course? Were there some special activities that you really liked or found interesting? (The aim here is to see if the teacher used active methods or just 'talked at' the class.) (Teaching methods overview)
15. How did **parents** and other family members react to this course when students told them about it? (Community response overview)

Box 8.8**Examples of questions for teachers and head-teachers about a special course****Impact**

Have you seen any **changes in your students** that you attribute to the course? Please give examples of changed attitudes and behaviour. What do you think caused these changes? Was impact related to some particular parts of the course or methods? Do you believe that this course will help your students in their present and future lives in some way?

Box 8.8

Examples of questions for teachers and head-teachers about a special course

Has there been any **impact on you** personally or on your teaching as a result of your being trained for/ teaching this course?

How have **parents** reacted to these classes?

What would help to improve the **quality and sustainability** of this work over the longer term?

Inputs

Was the **training** you received adequate? How could it be improved?

Is the **support** you receive from head-teachers/ district/project staff adequate? How could it be improved?

What **materials** do you have for teaching the course? Are they sufficient? How can they be improved?)

Process

What are your thoughts and observations on how the programme is being **implemented** at your school?

Have there been any **challenges** or **barriers** to implementation?

Have there been any changes in **teachers' skills** or teaching styles as a result of the programme?

What are the attitudes of **staff, students and parents** to the programme?

Box 8.9

Examples of additional questions for community members about the impact of a special course

In what ways have the **attitudes and behaviour** of the student(s) been affected by the new course?

What do you think **caused** these changes?

Do the students **discuss** the new course with you? What do they find good or bad about the course? What knowledge and ideas have they shared with you? Do they have new skills?

Based on your observations of impact, do you have **suggestions** for improving the course?

Box 8.10

Examples of additional questions for project field staff

What training have you received regarding the new course..?

What time have you been able to give to monitoring and supporting this in the schools? Have you or your staff observed these lessons? In your opinion, is the new course being taught regularly as scheduled? Is it being taught according to the methods indicated? What is the attitude of school heads, teachers, students, parents? In your opinion, is the initiative sustainable? What will be required to make it a success and to achieve the objectives?



9

MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF TEACHER TRAINING/ PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

9.1. Goals

LTLT/life skills programming requires preparation of teachers and others working with youth. It may also involve training of other adult members of the school and educational community or those working with youth in non-formal settings. Headteachers, for example, should be made aware of LTLT/life skills programme goals in order to facilitate their support.

Professional development programs can range from brief awareness workshops to a sequence of trainings and in-school mentoring for serving teachers. Clearly, teacher training institutions have especial responsibilities in this area.

9.2. M&E Processes

There are several stages for M&E of professional development activities, such as:

- Evaluation of the teacher training curriculum (pre-service, in-service) for coverage of the LTLT/life skills dimension and associated teaching methodology as such, and for reflecting this dimension in teaching and college processes
- M&E that takes place during and at the end of training courses, whether pre-service or in-service
- M&E of the support mechanisms for teachers implementing new LTLT/life skills initiatives
- M&E related to impact on behavior of those who have been trained: for example, if and how teachers are using a new citizenship curriculum in the classroom. This intersects to some degree with school surveys, classroom observation and impact on students, which we addressed earlier.

9.3 Criteria and Tools

Programme evaluation for pre-service teacher training resembles that for schools, in that the trainees are hopefully undergoing learning experiences regarding the basic competencies and subject themes described in chapter 2. Hence the evaluation schemas can be similar and the same types of interview and written tests and questionnaires can be used, though with more advanced knowledge and concepts. However, the teacher training also has to impact on what the teachers will teach and how they will teach it. Hence, there will be additional questions relating to the teaching role itself. Questions may be asked at the level of the national system, individual teacher training institutions or in-service training courses (and schools where trainees or those recently trained teach).

If the aim is to do a baseline study of courses before a new initiative is developed, then a key questions approach can be used, similar to that illustrated in Box 8.3. If the aim is to study the effectiveness of a specific course or initiative, then a results chain or logical framework approach is useful, - as illustrated in Box 9.1.

Box 9.1**Examples of data collection for M&E of teacher training in LTLT/life skills for teachers themselves and/or to train teachers for a LTLT/ life skills initiative for schools****Context**

Was the programme accepted by the director and staff of the teacher training institution? –Or, for in-service training, by the head-teacher and parents?

How does the renewal of this dimension of curriculum and the associated participative teaching methods fit in with the rest of the teacher training programme, and plans for future reform?

Inputs

Did the programme take place as planned? Were the materials received on time? Did the teacher trainers receive the needed prior training and conduct the full number of lessons? Was there support or training from specialist LTLT/life skills staff, and how often? If there have been problems regarding inputs, how can they be solved? Were there any events which prevented the courses from taking place? Did trainers and trainees have access to reference materials in the fields of citizenship, human rights, conflict resolution, life skills?

Process

How is this dimension of curriculum reflected in the national programme of in-service and pre-service teacher training? What time is devoted to basic life competencies, subject matter themes and required teaching methods?

How many experiential workshop sessions (hours) did the trainees participate in? What were the themes?

How many sessions (hours) did each trainee spend leading experiential workshop activities on basic life competencies and subject themes, with the whole group of trainees, with a sub-group, or in schools?

Do the trainers need more training, and if so, what should be the focus of this training? Have other trainers been affected by the programme, –have they praised it or complained about it?

How adequate was the microteaching practice and classroom practice?

Outputs

How many people were trained in-service or pre-service for general awareness of this dimension of curriculum or for teaching LTLT/life skills areas?

How many completed which parts of the course?

Did this lead to special certificates or credits towards a teaching qualification?

What physical evidence is there of the course work?

What voluntary activities were undertaken as part of the course work?

Outcomes of training: direct impact on teacher behaviours in their schools (or during teaching practice)

What learning outcomes can be deduced from the interviews with trainee teachers and trainers, using elicitive (open-ended) methods?

What results are obtained in written tests and questionnaires?

(In teacher training institution) Have there been quantitative or qualitative changes in trainee attitudes and behaviour? Have there been changes in the institutional climate?

What evidence is there of learning and change? When observed in classroom teaching, how well do the teachers apply what they have learned? (Use a classroom observation schedule if possible.)

Box 9.1

Examples of data collection for M&E of teacher training in LTLT/life skills for teachers themselves and/or to train teachers for a LTLT/ life skills initiative for schools

Have teachers instituted new activities such as peer mediation, anti-bullying campaigns, girls clubs etc as a result of in-service training? Have schools stopped corporal and degrading punishments?

What are the comments of school principals and others regarding the performance of teachers who have undergone this training?

Wider social changes partially attributable to the impact of the programme

Do the teachers think they will play (or have already played) a more active role as citizens, peacebuilders, mentors for youth etc as a result of this training?

Is there anecdotal evidence of teachers undertaking new activities outside the school which can be linked to the training?

Specific interview questions for teacher trainees and teacher trainers. Many of the questions for students suggested in the chapter on evaluation at school level can be asked of trainee teachers and teacher trainers. In addition, questions can be asked about the training process as such. Possible questions for teachers under training are given in Box 9.2, while specific questions relating to the role of teacher trainers are illustrated in Box 9.3.

Analysis. Data may be analysed using an adapted version of the conceptual framework in Box 4.5, or using a framework specially designed to meet the national situation.

Box 9.2

Illustrative questions for teachers undergoing or completing training relating to LTLT/life skills

Note: the word 'trainee' here refers for convenience to persons undergoing pre-service or in-service teacher training.

A. Personal outcomes and impact of course

Broad questions

1. Do you believe that this course will be of **use** to you and other trainees in your present or future lives?
Follow up: If Yes: How?
2. What has the course added to your **knowledge**, or has it given you new ideas and concepts?
3. What special **skills** have you learned during the course?
4. How has the course changed your own or other trainees' **values and attitudes**? (ask for examples)
5. Has the course changed trainees' **behaviour**? Can you give examples, for yourself or others? Do you and your fellow teachers feel motivated to apply LTLT/life skills learning in your own lives?
(For institutions) Have you seen bullying in your institution? Can you give examples (trainers, trainees; physical or other bullying? Gender-based harassment)? Did you discuss bullying during the course? Has the pattern of bullying changed since the course?

Box 9.2**Illustrative questions for teachers undergoing or completing training relating to LTLT/life skills**

6. Is there any change in how you and your fellow trainees feel about people who are from a **different social group** to you? Or in how you behave towards them?
7. (Theory of change – example) After the first year of the course (or after the lessons on anger management or 'I- statements or gender etc), did you find any change in your behaviour towards others, and if so, what do you think caused it? What particular activities influenced you the most? Did the effect last? Did the course have the same effect on your friends?

Thematic questions

8-10. (For each of three lesson topics linked to key competencies and themes) Do you remember some lessons/workshop about '...':

Follow up: What did you learn from that session? Has it changed how you and other trainees friends think about things?

Follow up: Can you give an example of how you or someone else behaved differently because of that session?

11. (Where relevant) Has the course changed your thinking and attitudes regarding **violent conflict** in your own country or other countries (or violence and pressure in personal relationships)?
Follow up: If Yes: How? What are the problems caused by armed conflict? (Peace overview) or violence/pressure in personal relationships (Life skills)
12. Has the course changed your thinking and attitudes regarding the **rights and responsibilities of citizens** of this country? If so, how? (Civic and human rights overview)
13. (Where relevant) Has the course changed your thinking and attitudes regarding **HIV/AIDS prevention** and responsibilities toward those affected? (Life skills)

B. Questions relating to teaching role

14. What kind of teaching and learning activities did the trainers use during the course? Were there some special activities that you really liked or found interesting? (The aim here is to see if the trainers used active methods or just 'talked at' the class.) (Training methods overview)
15. How well do you feel prepared to teach the basic life competencies and subject themes listed in chapter 2? Do you feel prepared for – and convinced of the rationale for – using experiential methods? If not, can you suggest improvements in the training and offer suggestions for additional training?
16. Do trainees (and trainers and teachers) have sufficient support in terms of (revised) textbooks, lesson guides, and other support materials to cope with this sensitive and often new area of curriculum?
17. Did trainers make a connection between respect for all human beings, human rights etc and the more child-centred and active approach to teaching advocated for effective learning and 'child-friendly schools'? Between this and the 'code of conduct' for teachers (if there is one)? Did you and other trainees understand this connection? Can you explain it?

Box 9.2

Illustrative questions for teachers undergoing or completing training relating to LTLT/life skills

18. Can you describe your own 'theory of change' regarding how LTLT/life skills training affects you and other trainees and how it will affect students? (especially with regard to the explicit goals and objectives of the initiative)
19. Can you describe some lessons you have taught in your school or during practice teaching that cover this area of curriculum? What were your objectives and methods? What did students learn (cognitive and values/attitudes)? What additional training could have helped you be more effective?

Questions about teacher contact programmes (where relevant)

20. In your opinion, are teacher exchanges between colleges in different ethnic settings contributing to:
 - (a) Improved trainee attitudes towards other ethnic groups?
 - (b) Trainee interest in learning language of another ethnic group?
 - (c) Trainee interest in learning and teaching about peace, citizenship, human rights?

(Questions 1-13 adapted from Ashton, 2007b: 114)

Box 9.3

Examples of questions specifically for teacher trainers

- Have you received adequate training to be able to train others in interpersonal, intrapersonal and cognitive (analysis and problem solving) key competencies? Which aspects are difficult for you and why?
- Do you feel competent to teach subject areas such as human rights and responsibilities, citizenship, peace/conflict resolution, relationship management for HIV/AIDS prevention etc? Which areas are difficult for you and why?
- Do you feel that the training you provide to teacher trainees will be effective? Have you observed changes in trainees' personal attitudes, values and behaviour? Have you observed them applying this training in the classroom – were they effective?
- How can the training be improved?
- What is your attitude and that of fellow trainers to this dimension of curriculum?



10

DRAWING CONCLUSIONS

One of the concerns of policy makers and especially of funders (curriculum planners, finance ministries and donors) is whether the LTLT/life skills programme is being successful in meeting its goals. As has been noted earlier, this can be seen in terms of the results chain or logical framework. Success can be shown in terms of outputs, outcomes and immediately attributable behaviour gains. Success on these indicators helps justify continued resource allocations, as a likely contribution to positive societal change.

10.1 Analysis and formulating an evaluation report

The analysis need not be complicated – and the best guide is common sense! Are the planned activities actually taking place? To what extent are goals and objectives being met? What factors contribute positively and what are the constraints? Or a SWOT approach can be used: what are the programme's Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats? What guidance emerges for the future?

The examples given below illustrate possible structures for evaluation reports focused on the three prototype situations which the Guide has identified earlier:

- traditional programmes (Box 10.1)
- LTLT/life skills pilot programmes (Box 10.2)
- LTLT/life skills programmes already in use (Box 10.3).

There will be some overlap in the analysis of these contrasted situations. However, for convenience, they are considered in turn.

Box 10.1

Analysis and conclusions: evaluation of traditional schooling

Main question: 'Does our traditional programme meet our current goals in the LTLT/life skills dimension?'

Data: curriculum evaluation; school sample surveys; sample surveys of teacher training institutions/programmes; interviews with education managers sample at all levels.

Analysis:

- (a) Analysis of **national education goals and associated education objectives** gives a conceptual framework for desired curriculum (key concepts, subject/cross-cutting themes) and pedagogy coverage of LTLT/life skills. This provides a framework for M&E.
- (b) Content analysis of **curriculum and textbooks** against the conceptual framework shows weaknesses, strengths and gaps.
- (c) Content analysis of open-ended **student responses (and other data) from schools** compared to the conceptual framework shows weaknesses, strengths and gaps in relation to LTLT/life skills key competencies and subject themes (knowledge, concept development, skills, attitudes/values, behaviour), and pedagogy experienced. Data from any multiple choice tests and questionnaires gives similar/divergent results.
- (d) Similar to (c), for interview data from **teachers, headteachers, local and national education managers, other stakeholders**.
- (e) Students', teachers' and others' comments confirm/disconfirm/enrich the **theory of change** assumptions underlying the way the existing school curriculum is expected to influence LTLT/life skills behaviour
- (f) Similar to (c), (d), (e) but for **teacher training programmes**. Analysis separately considers influence on teachers/trainees themselves and on their professional skills, attitudes and behaviour.
- (g) Analysis of **constraints** on achievement of the goals in terms of context, inputs and processes in the schools and other parts of the education system shows why some goals were achieved, others not, and unforeseen consequences.

Box 10.1**Analysis and conclusions: evaluation of traditional schooling**

(h) Based on the analysis, conclusions are drawn and proposals offered on how to **design an initiative** to strengthen the LTLT/life skills dimension of schooling (eg policy, pilot projects, phased textbook renewal etc) and how to build M&E of this dimension into national (or other programme) structures.

- The conclusion may be that the traditional curriculum is so subject- and examination-centred that it has little coverage of citizenship, human rights, conflict resolution or life skills – or that it has negative coverage eg disparaging minorities, women, neighbouring countries and giving a one-sided (glorification) view of war.
- Or it may be found that there is good coverage for some themes, but that methods of pedagogy are inadequate to generate more than rote learning.
- Or the school culture and ethos may be found to counteract the LTLT curriculum.
- From such conclusions, a set of recommendations can be drawn up, for ways of strengthening the LTLT/ life skills dimension of curriculum and institutional practices of the school, including appropriate pedagogy and review of school culture and practices. These recommendations can be tested against data on teacher capacity, availability of textbooks and other education resources, and so on, as well as attitudes. This can help generate proposals for action, eg the need for piloting in schools with good leadership, the need for teacher training and support, and so on.

Box 10.2**Analysis and conclusions: pilot LTLT/ life skills programme in progress**

Main question: Does our new LTLT/life skills initiative - in our pilot/model schools – achieve its goals?

Data: curriculum evaluation; surveys of sample of involved schools (and control schools not involved); sample surveys of (involved and control) teacher training institutions/programmes; interviews with (involved) education managers sample at all levels.

Analysis:

- (a) Analysis of **national education goals, pilot project goals, associated education objectives** gives a conceptual framework for desired curriculum (key concepts, subject/cross-cutting themes) and pedagogy coverage of LTLT/life skills. This provides a framework for M&E.
- (b) Content analysis of **new LTLT/life skills materials and activities, and classroom and whole school activities**, against conceptual framework shows weaknesses, strengths and gaps.

Box 10. 2

Analysis and conclusions: pilot LTLT/ life skills programme in progress

- (c) **Results chain:** data on inputs, processes and outputs shows that the initiative did/did not take place as planned. Content analysis of open-ended student responses (and other data) from schools compared to conceptual framework shows weaknesses, strengths and gaps in relation to LTLT/life skills key competencies and subject themes (knowledge, concept development, skills, attitudes/values, behaviour), pedagogy experienced. Data from any multiple choice tests and questionnaires gives similar/divergent results. Data from pilot/model schools and control (non-participating) schools (or classes) shows similarities/differences. The difference do/do not relate to the length of exposure to the innovation. Data on self-reported behaviour, behaviour reported by school or families, independent measures of behaviour in immediate community agree/disagree with each other. Data on school practices reported by learners, teachers, heads, others agree/disagree with each other.
 - (d) Similar to c), for interview data from **teachers, headteachers, local and national education managers, other stakeholders**.
 - (e) Students', teachers' and others' comments confirm/ disconfirm/ enrich the **theory of change** underlying the way the existing school curriculum is expected to influence LTLT/life skills behaviour
 - (f) Similar to (c), (d), (e) but for **teacher training programmes** (including headteacher training). Analysis separately considers influence on teachers/trainees themselves and on their professional skills, attitudes and behaviour.
 - (g) Analysis of open-ended questions to other stakeholders and senior national and local education managers/ministry staff indicates their **attitudes** towards the LTLT/life skills dimension of the curriculum and the recent initiative.
 - (h) Analysis of **constraints** on achievement of the goals in terms of context, inputs and processes in the schools and other parts of the education system shows why some goals were achieved, others not, and unforeseen consequences.
 - (a) (i) Based on the analysis, conclusions are drawn and proposals offered on how to **improve the performance of the pilot initiative/model schools, how to design a wider initiative** to strengthen the LTLT/life skills dimension of schooling (eg policy, pilot projects, phased textbook renewal etc) and how to build M&E of this dimension into national (or other programme) structures.
- The conclusion may be that some of the pilot/model schools are doing excellent work, based on headteacher support and dedicated teachers. Some topics and pedagogic techniques may need strengthening in all schools. Strategically, the analysis must ask whether the programme as it stands can be expanded stepwise to more schools with feasible resource requirements, and/or whether elements of the programme can be incorporated into national curriculum and textbook renewal, and renewal of teacher training.

Box 10.3**Analysis and conclusions: national (or NGO) LTLT/ life skills programme already introduced****Main question: Does our system-wide LTLT/life skills initiative achieve its goals?**

Data: curriculum evaluation; sample surveys of schools; sample surveys of teacher training institutions/ programmes; interviews with education managers sample at all levels.

Analysis:

- (a) Analysis of **national education goals including goals of LTLT/life skills initiative and associated education objectives** gives a conceptual framework for desired curriculum (key concepts, subject/cross-cutting themes) and pedagogy coverage of LTLT/life skills. This provides a framework for M&E.
- (b) Content analysis of **curriculum and textbooks and/or of new LTLT/life skills materials, and classroom and whole school activities**, against conceptual framework shows weaknesses, strengths and gaps.
- (c) **Results chain**. Data on inputs, processes and outputs shows that the initiative did/did not take place as planned. Content analysis of open-ended student responses (and other data) from schools compared to conceptual framework shows weaknesses, strengths and gaps in relation to LTLT/life skills key competencies and subject themes (knowledge, concept development, skills, attitudes/values, behaviour), pedagogy experienced. Data from any multiple choice tests and questionnaires gives similar/divergent results. Data on self-reported behaviour, behaviour reported by school or families, independent measures of behaviour in immediate community and wider society agree/disagree with each other. Data on school practices reported by learners, teachers, heads, others agree/disagree with each other.
- (d) Similar to c), for interview data from **teachers, headteachers, local and national education managers, other stakeholders**.
- (e) Students', teachers' and others' comments confirm/ disconfirm/ enrich the **theory of change** underlying the way the existing school curriculum is expected to influence LTLT/life skills behaviour
- (f) Similar to (c), (d), (e) but for **teacher training programmes** (including headteacher training). Analysis separately considers influence on teachers/trainees themselves and on their professional skills, attitudes and behaviour.
- (g) Analysis of open-ended questions to other stakeholders and senior national and local education managers/ministry staff indicates their **attitudes** towards the LTLT/life skills dimension of the curriculum and the recent initiative.
- (h) Analysis of **constraints** on achievement of the goals in terms of context, inputs and processes in the schools and other parts of the education system shows why some goals were achieved, others not, and unforeseen consequences.
- (i) Based on the analysis, conclusions are drawn and proposals offered on **how to strengthen the LTLT/life skills initiative** (eg policy on timetabling and examinations, more training and support of teachers, supporting materials) and how to build M&E of this dimension into national (or other programme) structures.

Box 10.3**Analysis and conclusions: national (or NGO) LTLT/ life skills programme already introduced**

- The conclusion may be that some of the schools ('innovators', 'early acceptors') are doing excellent work in line with the system-wide initiative, with reasonable attainment of the LTLT/life skills goals, -based on head-teacher support and dedicated teachers. Other schools may be behind on the 'adoption curve' for the initiative, and may fall into the categories 'early majority' acceptors, 'late majority' acceptors or 'resistors'/'laggards'. Strategically, the analysis must ask whether the programme can be improved to bring all schools to a satisfactory standard, or whether to keep 'innovators' and 'early acceptors' as 'model' schools, and incorporate easier parts of the innovation into the national curriculum in an easier way. Well-performing schools might serve as a resource for testing new materials and for training of teachers. In any case, there will certainly be a need for capacity-building through ongoing training of trainers and teachers, and for improving processes and supporting materials through taking note of school survey results. If the field survey indicates that many schools are not giving time to the programme, then possibilities include stronger earmarking of time as a separate subject or within a carrier subject (s), and requiring documentary evidence of programme activities as part of school supervision and reporting and/or national examination systems. If surveys show that school practice is slow to match curriculum messages, then more focus needs to be given in future to transforming institutional practices within schools.

10.2 Reporting on impact

Policy-makers and funders often talk of ‘peace education’, ‘citizenship education’ or ‘HIV-AIDS education’ as a solution to huge national problems that can only be resolved through long-term multi-sectoral efforts and political will. In fact, LTLT/life skills education programmes can only contribute to a solution, and that too if they are adequately resourced and maintained over the long term.

In order to encourage continued long-term support for an initiative, therefore, evaluation reports should be structured to show positive results clearly. Success is best reported beginning with proof of implementation, and moving on to the most clear-cut outcome and direct impact data, such as attitudes and in-school behaviour. Using evidence regarding key informants’ support for ‘theories of change’, this data can provide support for any evidence regarding behavioural impacts out of school, where attribution is more difficult and the time frame is longer. It is wise to report in the following sequence:

- Description of implementation (did it happen as intended, - or otherwise)
- Gains in measurable knowledge, concepts and skills
- Gains in attitudes, values and self-reported behaviour
- Gains in objective behaviour/behaviour reported by others which key respondents attribute credibly to the programme (eg decreased fighting in school)
- Changes in school practice
- (If desired) Respondents’ theories of change
- Gains or losses in behaviour in the community or wider society, - the net result of many factors besides education.

Regarding gains in knowledge, concepts, skills, attitudes, values and behaviour, it is good to relate these to the length of exposure of the students to the initiative – thereby hopefully strengthening the case for a cyclic curriculum approach and for extended programme development and support (including research, monitoring and evaluation). Depending on finance and the intended audience, the report can include photographs of activity, or examples of student work.

10.3 Using an evaluation report

It is said that the value of an evaluation report lies not so much in what is written as in what use is made of the report, starting with the draft report. Evaluators can present their findings to key policy makers and to stakeholders in general once the first draft is available, in order to get feedback:

- (a) to make it easier to understand
- (b) to indicate points where more analysis is needed
- (c) to discover if the preliminary findings are accepted by the stakeholders and if they have constructive recommendations to improve the report
- (d) to enhance widespread awareness of and ‘ownership’ of the findings by getting stakeholders involved in finalizing the presentation and analysis.

Once the report is finalized, then all actors should quickly use it to move the programme forward. If the report lies on a shelf for months, and if then presented, no-one may be impressed. A continuing sequence of organized activities and events is needed, for dissemination and follow up of the evaluation report. As the blacksmiths say: 'Strike while the iron is hot!'

It is often nice to have a 'launch' of the report of a successful programme, which can get publicity in the media, and where official and dignitaries can be invited. This need not be expensive, as it can be held in a school or college. Students can showcase activities and exhibitions, tell of what they have learned, demonstrate the drama or role plays they have used in learning as well as providing simulations of their school council meetings or peer mediation sessions. Students can also practice and demonstrate participation skills by being responsible for organizing the event (with the support of teachers)!

10.4 Organising an exploratory or planning workshop for strengthening monitoring and evaluation of LTLT/life skills

A first step in strengthening monitoring and evaluation of LTLT/life skills is to convene a planning workshop of key educators and interested stakeholders. It is hoped that the present Guide can be a useful resource in preparing for this workshop. Suggested outlines for possible workshops are shown in Annex 5, covering the different scenarios – traditional system, pilot LTLT/life skills projects, and ongoing focused LTLT/life skills programme. The exploratory or planning workshop can focus on adapting the broad ideas sketched in the Guide and in other international resources, to meet the goals, priorities and situation facing educators in a particular location and programme.

Best wishes

We hope that any evaluation undertaken with the help of this 'tool' will help make learning to live together, life skills, education for citizenship, peace and human rights more widely recognized as an important dimension of the curriculum, and will show clearly the positive response of students to these programmes focused on their respective future lives and contribution to society.

Please help

Please feed back your experience and suggestions for improving this Guide to the writing team (care of: ma.sinclair@gmail.com).



ANNEXES

ANNEX 1. CONCEPTS OF CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

‘Civic education’ or ‘education for democracy’ was traditionally quite a narrow concept, -of learning some facts about local and national government. In recent years, there has been a move towards ‘citizenship education’, which basically encompasses what has been described in this Guide as ‘learning to live together’.

It may be useful therefore to briefly introduce some of the recent literature on citizenship education.⁷⁷

Council of Europe 'Education for democratic citizenship'

Recent developments in citizenship education focus on developing students' skills, values and attitudes as well as basic factual knowledge. In the more developed countries, governments have been concerned over issues of voter apathy as well as controversies and conflicts arising from increasingly diverse societies (-a result of enhanced migration within and between countries). In developing countries, citizenship education is seen as promoting social integration and national development, while in 'fragile states' including post-conflict situations citizenship education is seen as also helping mitigate 'fragility' (USAID, 2006).⁷⁸ This has strengthened interest in citizenship education.⁷⁹ For example, an international 'Diversity, Citizenship and Global Education Consensus Panel' was convened by the University of Washington in Seattle, reporting in 2004. The panel identified four principles and ten concepts in their report *Democracy and diversity: principles and concepts for education citizens in a global age*. The principles comprised 'unity and diversity', interdependence, human rights and opportunities to practise democracy; while the concepts selected were democracy, diversity, globalisation, sustainable development, empire/ imperialism/ power, prejudice/ discrimination/racism, migration, identity/diversity, multiple perspectives, and 'patriotism and cosmopolitanism' (Banks, 2005). The international panel focused especially on education for democracy and diversity in the United States: the concepts would need adjusting to meet the specific needs of other societies.

Osler and Starkey (2006) categorised citizenship programmes on a spectrum from minimalist (eg about elections) to maximalist (understanding how society should work to benefit all). They emphasised that knowledge alone is not enough to achieve the citizenship goals, and that a personal 'affective' sense of involvement in the education activities is essential, to enhance a sense of multiple or hybrid identity rather than a narrow 'in-group' identity, and to develop 'maximalist' competencies to effect change.⁸⁰

Box A1.1
Osler and Starkey's components of citizenship education⁶¹

Minimal	<p>Cognitive (knowledge, concepts)</p> <p>Information:</p> <p>Is there a focus on specific information about democracy, human rights, discrimination, civil society, values?</p>	<p>Affective (feelings, personal choices)</p> <p>Cultural/personal identities:</p> <p>Does the education programme explore/affirm students' various multiple (or hybrid) identities, including a regional identity (eg Europe, Africa)?</p> <p>Does it promote intercultural development? (Relates to feelings and choices)</p>
Maximal	<p>Inclusion:</p> <p>Does the programme prepare participants for social/economic inclusion and security?</p> <p>Does it have an equal opportunities focus, or one which addresses the specific needs of women/girls in claiming their citizenship rights?</p> <p>Does the programme have active methods and encourage participation in the wider society?</p>	<p>Competence:</p> <p>Does the programme develop skills for democratic participation, including political literacy and skills to effect change eg advocacy?</p>

Nelson and Kerr (2005:8) identify 'active citizenship' as requiring the three C's: **Curriculum** in the classroom, which provides the underpinning knowledge, understanding and skills; a school **Culture**, enabling active participation in school democratic structures; and volunteering within the wider **Community**.

According to the Council of Europe, the concept of 'education for democratic citizenship' aims at preparing people for civic and political participation, respecting rights and accepting responsibilities, and valuing cultural and social diversity (Birzea et al, 2005: 24.)

Box A1.2

EDC Principles (from Birzea et al., 2005:25)

Education for democratic citizenship:

- Is based on the fundamental principles of human rights, pluralist democracy and the rule of law
- Refers in particular to rights and responsibilities, empowerment, participation and belonging, and respect for diversity
- Includes all age groups and sectors of society
- Aims to prepare young people and adults for active participation in democratic society, thus strengthening democratic culture
- Is instrumental in the fight against violence, xenophobia, racism, aggressive nationalism and intolerance
- Contributes to social cohesion, social justice and the common good
- Strengthens civil society by helping to make its citizens informed and knowledgeable, and endowing them with democratic skills
- Should be differentiated according to national, social, cultural, historical contexts

These principles were cited and reiterated in a comparative study of ‘education for citizenship and democracy’ in Latin America. Espinola (2005) emphasized the role of youth participation, in school and otherwise, as critical to building responsible citizenship in the region. Reimers and Villegas-Reimers (2005) proposed a programme of research to develop more adequate citizenship preparation at secondary school level. Cox (2005) noted the need for today’s students to balance a sense of local, national and global identity, as well as the challenge of organizing ‘participation’ on a large scale. He characterised changes in educational objectives in Chile in the 1990s as a move from previous ‘civic education’ traditions to ‘citizenship education’.⁸²

Box A1.3.

From civic education to citizenship education (Chile)⁸³

CIVIC EDUCATION

- Focus on political institutions
- Assigned to the last courses of secondary school
- Oriented to the acquisition of knowledge – focus on contents

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

- Double focus: political institutions and expansion of issues to ‘actual social problems’
- Present throughout the school sequence
- Oriented towards the acquisition of knowledge, skills and attitudes

Likewise in Mexico there has been a review of the multiple approaches to the curriculum subject entitled 'Civics and ethics education', leading to a new curriculum framework structured around three axes, namely:

- Ethics education
- Education for life
- Citizenship education.

These are seen to require eight civic and ethics competencies, namely:

- Self-knowledge and care
- Self-regulation and responsible exercise of freedom
- Respect for and valuing of diversity
- Sense of belonging to the community, the nation and humanity
- Management and resolution of conflicts
- Social and political participation
- Regard for legality and sense of justice
- Understanding and appreciation of democracy. (Gomez-Morin, 2005:92)

Education authorities in Colombia have likewise tried to move forward from a weekly period of civics education to 'a school that organizes itself in function of the democratic values it intends to form'. The education minister sought to place citizenship education on the same level of importance as mathematics, language, natural and social sciences, beginning with the development of national standards for citizenship competencies to be conveyed through the school. A first step was a baseline study in 2003 administered to all children in years 5 and 9 of schooling (Jaramillo, 2005).

According to Patti & Espinosa (2007), the standards are organized within three dimensions:

- Living together and peace
- Participation and democratic responsibility
- Plurality, identity and value of differences
- Respect and defence of human rights (transversal/cross-cutting).

The standards identify several types of citizenship competencies: emotional, cognitive, communicative, integrative (action) and knowledge-based, and are organized by the developmental level of the students.

Box A1.4

Examples of Colombian citizenship competency standards

Living together and peace: 'I address, in a peaceful and constructive manner, the daily conflicts in my school and family life and contribute to the protection of children's rights' (year 4-5)

Participation and democratic responsibility: 'I participate, in my immediate context (with my family and classmates) in the construction of basic agreements about norms for the achievement of mutual goals and I follow them' (year 1-3)

Pluralism, identity and appreciation of diversity: 'I expressly reject all forms of discrimination or social exclusion and make use of democratic mechanisms to overcome discrimination and demonstrate respect for diversity' (years 10-11) (Patti & Espinosa, 2007: 113)

Villegas-Reimers (2002), also writing for Latin American readers, stressed that ‘education for democracy’ entails not only understanding about how democracy works and how governments and society are organized, but also the values underlying democracy, which she identifies as respect and tolerance, integrity, self-discipline, justice, freedom and human rights.

There are ongoing programmes in South East Europe focused on the strengthening of education for citizenship and human rights during a period of political transition, under titles such as civic education and active citizenship (UNESCO and CEPS, 2004). The Council of Europe has supported these activities and has recently developed useful ‘tools’ for evaluation, teacher training and school management of education for democratic citizenship.⁸⁴

There is increasing attention to the teaching of history, which forms part of a child’s induction into citizenship. As an example, Tibbitts (2006) shows how history teachers and their students in the Western Cape Education department in South Africa benefited from a professional development project ‘Facing the past- transforming our future’, developed in collaboration with the NGO Facing History and Ourselves. For revision of history curricula in south-east Europe in support of education for democratic citizenship, see UNESCO (2006b).

Box A1.5 shows a draft citizenship education resource manual for teachers in Liberia, designed to complement materials for peace and human rights education.

Box A1.5
Draft citizenship education framework for teacher manual, Liberia

Topic	Sub-topics/Activities
What is a citizen?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Belonging to a family, a community Being part of a nation Civic rights and responsibilities The global village
I am Liberian	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What makes me Liberian? Where is my country? Liberia as a nation Liberia: a vision of liberty, a vision of the future
Civic participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helping each other Making changes Who is left out? Embracing diversity
Environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All around me: cleanliness My country; my planet What can I do for the future?



Box A1.5
Draft citizenship education framework for teacher manual, Liberia

Topic	Sub-topics/Activities
Transparency and accountability	Why should I be honest? What does it mean to be accountable? Who are the duty-bearers in our society? Truth and Reconciliation Commission Media
Branches and levels Of government	Who makes the rules? Levels of government –national, county, local Responsibilities and functions of the levels of government

Peace education at school level overlaps greatly with education for citizenship and for human rights. The term 'peace education' is typically used when there is an especial concern about international or civil conflict. However, for younger children it focuses on skills and values for living together, including non-violent solutions to conflict, - as do citizenship and human rights education. For older students there is a focus on building 'positive peace', - meaning a society in which there is social justice, good governance, participation and a strong civil society etc. - key elements in modern citizenship education.

ANNEX 2. EXAMPLE OF A LESSON OBSERVATION SCHEDULE

There is an extensive literature on classroom observation, to which the reader can refer. There are many lesson observation formats, which focus on the way the teacher conducts a class and how much time is spent on different activities, A simple categorization for the latter is:

Percentage of student time:

- Listening to the teacher
- Individual work
- Group work
- Whole class work/discussion.

Classroom observation is especially important for lessons addressing the goals of citizenship, life skills, peace and human rights, – for goals affecting the student as an individual person and his or her values, attitudes and behaviours. Good teachers use stimulus activities and link them through discussion and reflection to values and future behaviour, but many teachers will need monitoring and support to achieve this skill.

Each organisation or evaluator will develop an observation schedule suited to the particular programme, setting and evaluation goals. Where there is a special project to promote citizenship, peace, human rights and/or life skills education, then the observation schedule should reflect the

special training and guidance given to teachers, and should include the ability of teachers to use or adapt the supporting lesson guides or materials.

An example of a set of questions to ask in observation of a lesson in the area of LTLT are given below. The lesson should reflect the philosophy and principles behind LTLT, (as well as being generally effective). One would expect lessons to demonstrate respect for the learner, as well as students showing respect for the teacher; and for the teacher to be aware of the rights of the learner to learn, in terms of the preparation and ambience needed for learning. Teachers should also be aware of the learner's right to be treated with dignity, to participate and to have their voice heard. The questions below draw attention specifically to LTLT goals – for all lessons there would of course also be general questions about use of blackboard, time planning, use of visual aids and so on. For life skills education such as education for HIV/AIDS prevention, more specific questions can be added regarding the extent to which the lesson made contact with students in terms of the immediate challenges they face and helped them practise appropriate skilled responses.

TEACHER OBSERVATION SHEET (LTLT)

Topic:

Overall scheme/course this was part of:

Time and length of lesson:

Grade/Year of schooling:

Number of children present in class: Girls ... Boys...

A. LESSON CONTENT AND PREPARATION

- What was the source of the lesson content:
 - Prepared specially by the teacher?
 - 'Teacher Activity Book' or similar guide, or published scheme?
 - Little apparent preparation?
- If from a Teachers' Book, was it followed as specified? If no, what alterations were made and why?
- Did the teacher effectively link the content of this lesson to previous activities and work in LTLT?
- Did the children appear to understand the content?
- Did they ask questions if they did not understand?
- Were suitable explanations given?
- Were the concepts suitable for the children, at the appropriate level? Did the teacher attempt to give practical examples of any more abstract concepts?
- Did the teacher appear to understand the lesson and the concepts?
- Were there practical activities for the children to do? How did these vary from previous lessons?
- Was opportunity for discussion built into the lesson?
- Was group work built into the lesson, and if so, how were the groups organised? Did the students appear to be used to group work?
- Was the teacher flexible in thinking about seating arrangements and use of space (if possible)?

B. LESSON BEGINNING AND SCENE SETTING

- Was the teacher punctual, showing respect for the learner?
- Did the teacher greet the students warmly?
- How did the teacher settle the class, if necessary?
- Did the teacher explain the aims of the lesson, what was to happen, and what was hoped to be achieved by the end of the lesson in terms of knowledge, skills or attitudes in LTLT? Did the teacher relate this effectively to the real life situation of the students as well as previous lessons and how students had integrated them into their lives?

C. INTERACTION AND PARTICIPATION

- What was the balance between teacher talk and student talk?
- Did the teacher use mainly open or mainly closed questions?
- Did the teacher ask questions of specific students or the whole class, and when?

- How did the teacher understand 'discussion'? Students answering his/her questions? Students raising questions? Students debating issues? Teacher presenting two sides of an argument and asking students their views? etc
- How did the students take part in discussion? Did all take part, or only some? If only some, were there patterns in this, for example, more boys than girls or vice versa? How did the teacher encourage participation? Was group work used?
- Did the children appear interested in the lesson? How did they show their interest?
- Was the teacher flexible in terms of building on student response or did he/she stick rigidly to the lesson plan?
- Did the lesson relate well to the personal lives of the students and show signs of engaging their personal commitment?

D. RELATIONSHIPS

- Did the teacher appear to respect all the students? Only some?
- Did the students appear to respect the teacher?
- How did the teacher address the students? Did he./she know their names?
- Describe the body language and general presentational style of the teacher (welcoming, caring, formal, informal, distant etc),
- Did the teacher use humour and make the lesson fun?
- Did the teacher move around the class (if this was physically possible) to try to engage all the students?
- Describe the teacher's voice: was this varied/loud/clear/monotonous/enthusiastic/weak/soft/aggressive etc?
- How did the teacher (or students) ensure discipline? What classroom 'rules' seemed to be in operation, and who had decided these? Was there any indication that the children had taken part in drawing up the rules (e.g. a behaviour contract on the wall written by the students)?
- Was the discipline humane? Or harsh? Did the teacher relate the discipline in the classroom to the topic of the lesson (for example, peace, living together, conflict resolution etc)?
- Were the students encouraged to make suitable reparations for any 'bad' behaviour, or simply punished? Was any corporal punishment used or threatened?
- Did the students appear to respect each other?
- Were students encouraged to help each other with their work, – show cooperation, or was there a competitive or individualised environment?

E. LESSON END AND FOLLOW-UP

- Did the teacher review the lesson and check what had been learned in knowledge, skills or attitudes – and how it might relate to students' own lives?
- Did the children participate in evaluating the lesson?
- Did the teacher tell the children what was to happen in future lessons?
- If homework was set, did the children appear to understand what they should do? Could they cooperate in their homework?
- Did you or the teacher (or the children) notice any change in behaviour or attitude of the children related to the lesson or to the course?

ANNEX 3. MATCHING DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS TO EVALUATION OBJECTIVES

Objective types	Data collection instruments	Examples of discrete components of achievement and key questions
Behavioural a. Peace ed b. Citizenship ed c. Lifeskills	<p>Observation – participant observation or non-participant observation, in several social settings (home, classroom, street); note-taking on behaviour & events, & collecting opportunistic verbal reports</p> <p>In-depth interviews with subjects, peers, other people close to subjects (family members, teachers, etc.) relating to (i) self and/or (ii) others' behaviour, attitudes, etc.</p> <p>Possible use of: focus group discussion & questionnaires</p>	<p>a. Learners use mediation to contain disputes (key question: do learners use mediation to contain disputes?)</p> <p>b. Learners listen with respect to differing opinions (key question: do learners listen with respect to differing opinions?)</p> <p>c. Some learners exhibit delayed first sexual activity (key question: do some learners delay first sexual activity?)</p>
Attitudinal a. Peace education b. Citizenship ed c. Lifeskills	<p>Observation – participant observation or non-participant observation</p> <p>In-depth interviews, range of types, relating to (i) self and/or (ii) others' behaviour, attitudes, etc.</p> <p>Focus group discussion</p> <p>Possible use of questionnaires</p>	<p>a. Learners have empathy for former enemies (key question: do learners have empathy for former enemies?)</p> <p>b. Learners appreciate importance of active citizenship (key question: do learners appreciate importance of active citizenship?)</p> <p>c. Learners have confidence in succeeding in the workplace (key question: do learners have confidence in succeeding in the workplace?)</p>
Cognitive a. Peace education b. Citizenship education c. Life skills	<p>Written questionnaires, essays, structured interviews, focus group discussion</p>	<p>a. Learners can describe examples of inclusive and exclusive behaviour (key question: can learners...?)</p> <p>b. Learners can write/speak about strategies to improve local environment (key question: can learners...?)</p> <p>c. Learners can describe HIV transmission modes (key question: can learners...?)</p>

Adapted from Obura (2007: 55).

ANNEX 4. SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPACT AND OTHER INDICATORS (extracted/adapted from Obura, 2007)

Gathering information on quantifiable indicators provides a useful introductory step in an evaluation of change in the locality. A frequent criticism on the number of crimes reported is that crime could be reducing while crime reports are increasing. Further investigation, such as interviews with informed respondents and the general public will fill out the picture. Measuring qualitative indicators produces a far richer harvest of data on what is happening, the perceptions (real or false) of the situation, people's feelings, their level of confidence, and their hopes for the future. Listening to people talk freely provides a total context.

In the indicator lists below, selected indicators have been listed as examples per programmatic cluster of very much longer lists which could be drawn up, relating to each specific programme. In other words, the indicators selected are very far from being exhaustive. It would be useful, however, to produce exhaustive lists of indicators for specific programmes for which the aims, targets, objectives and activities have already been stated in detail. The lists below give prominence, in turn, to one type of indicator or to one type of programme.

IDEAS FOR QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR SOCIETY, WHOLE SCHOOL AND/OR FOR INDIVIDUAL CLASS

(a) General behavioural indicators (by gender, age, social group)

- Number of violent assault incidents/crime/sexual harassment reported to police involving schoolchildren; number of perpetrators/victims
- Number of reported rapes/sexual assaults per year involving schoolchildren
- HIV incidence and prevalence (in country, local area, school)
- STI incidence (in country, local area, school)
- Pregnancy rates (under 20 yrs); age of first pregnancy (in country, local area, school)
- Age of first marriage of school leavers
- Existence/coverage of local conflict management programmes, HIV/AIDS prevention and care programmes, citizenship/environmental initiatives
- Number of community members voluntarily trained in conflict management, HIV/AIDS prevention etc

(b) At school and class level: behavioural indicators directly related to school (by gender, age, social group) -for the whole school or the class:

- Number of fights recorded by school or class teacher
- Number of bullying incidents recorded by school
- Percentage of students saying that fights are frequent (and/or that they have been in fights)
- Percentage of students saying that bullying is common (and/or that they have been bullied or bully others) (physical, verbal)
- Number of sexual harassment incidents in school (students, teachers) (physical, verbal)
- Number of rapes involving children in the school, class (perpetrators, victims)
- Number of people (safely) circulating at times & in places in/related to school previously thought to be risky
- Number of peer mediation sessions (where applicable)

- Number of meetings held between schoolchildren and representatives of school authorities; official meetings between children and parents; meetings between children and the community
- Number of visits by schoolchildren's representatives to the school's administrative offices; to community institutions
- Access of schoolchildren to school accounts and to other community, institutional accounts
- Number of school-generated completed community projects
- Number and type of community projects schools are involved in/numbers or schoolchildren involved
- Existence/number of interactions between children & local authorities/social institutions
- Instances of change in (any) school/class policy, regulations or practices resulting from children's intervention
- Number of different topics discussed by the DC school committee
- Number of incidents involving successful CM management by school/class members per year, other related incidents
- Class scores on reported behavioural change

c) By programme indicators: input, process, output, outcomes

Conflict management/resolution/mediation (CM)

- Number of CM hours/programmes refresher training for teachers per year
- Level of head's training in CM issues
- Existence of school and class policy re social cohesion/peace building, etc.
- Curriculum and whole school policy review carried out re social cohesion
- Existence of school committee (teachers & children) for social cohesion; committee goals & tasks set; regular assessments done
- Existence of school CM resources/reference materials for staff, children, parents:
- Existence of CM resources/reference materials for staff, class, parents
- Number and types of CM programmes running; hours per term
- Number/coverage of anti-sexual harassment, anti-bullying, peer mediation programmes in school for staff, children, parents
- Existence of class committee (teachers & children) for social cohesion; committee goals & tasks set; regular assessments done
- Number of interactions of school/class/class members with other school or community CM programmes
- Class scores on knowledge, and knowledge of skills, related to conflict management, democratic/civic and HIV/AIDS
- Class scores on attitude tests related to CM, DC and HIV/AIDS
- Number of adults/children trained in conflict management/mediation/ resolution (CM)
- Number of adults & children in school trained to deal with sexual harassment/rape

HIV/AIDS

- Availability of HIV prevention resources/reference materials for children, teachers, parents
- Numbers of female teachers in leadership positions
- Existence of school policy promoting HIV prevention
- Curriculum compatibility exercise carried out re HIV prevention
- Existence of school/class committee (teachers & children) on HIV prevention; committee goals & tasks set; regular assessments done

- Numbers/coverage of HIV prevention education programmes in the school
- Existence of school HIV prevention resources/reference materials for staff, children, parents
- Existence of school plan for support to HIV affected children & their families
- Existence of an HIV prevention school programme for staff
- Existence of school plan for support to HIV affected teachers & their families
- Availability of trusted adults to the school for HIV counselling

Democratic/civic

- Existence of school DC resources/reference materials for staff, children, parents
- Numbers of female teachers/other minority figures in leadership positions
- Existence/ number of meetings of a school council including teachers & children or teachers, children & parents, to promote democracy in the school
- Existence of DC school/class committee (at least teachers & children); committee goals & tasks set; regular assessments done – committee may be a school council subgroup
- Existence of DC crosscurriculum compatibility coordinator/coordination mechanism
- Existence of school policy to promote democracy in the school
- Existence of a process to identify/promote democratic practices in the school & to identify/change anti-democratic practices
- Existence of class policy or code on class relationships, procedures or practices

IDEAS FOR QUALITATIVE INDICATORS (for class, school, general programme evaluation)

Evaluating inputs and process

Conflict management/resolution/mediation

- Confidence in conflict mediation mechanisms within the school/class
- Modes of female access to post-conflict programmes
- Nature of power relations across the school community/classroom
- Perception of power relations across the school community/classroom, by diverse social groups
- Quality of women's/minority figures' leadership in the school
- Perception of power of women/minority leaders in the school & local context
- Quality of conflict management programmes in the school
- Methods used in school/class management of conflict
- Perception of the methods used for CM in the class/relating to class members in the playground

Democratic/civic

- Quality & type of adult female/minority leaders in the school
- Nature and quality of citizenship education resources/reference materials for staff, children, parents
- Nature and quality of interaction between school & local authorities/institutions; & between school and the community
- Profile of interaction initiators & actors
- Perceived efficiency level of school management ???by the children
- Degree of openness of school management to children's/parents' scrutiny & involvement
- Perceived openness of school management
- Nature and quality of school policy and plan promoting citizens' rights within the school
- Degree and quality of implementation of the policy
- Nature and quality of school curriculum compatibility with promoting good citizenship

- Nature and quality of citizenship education programmes in the school
- Capacity of the programme(s) to equate human rights responsive activities within school to those in the wider community
- Nature and quality of school plan for support to vulnerable children and their families
- Nature and quality of school plan for support to vulnerable citizens in the community
- Nature and quality of a good citizenship programme for staff
- Nature and quality of school plan for support to vulnerable teachers & their families
- Nature and quality of teacher/class, children/children interaction & perceived teacher/teacher and teacher/head interaction
- Profile of class leaders
- Profile of marginalised children in the class & type/degree of marginalisation
- Perceptions of teachers' citizenship qualities and level of trust in teachers
- Perceived efficiency level of teachers' class management by the children
- Quality & type of female management experienced by the class
- Nature and quality of children's participation in class committee promoting democracy in the class
- Nature and quality of class committee goals & tasks set; M&E

HIV/AIDS

- Nature and quality of related resources/reference materials for children, parents
- Quality & type of women's leadership role models in the school
- Nature and quality of HIV prevention education programmes in the school
- Nature and quality of school plan for support to HIV affected children & their families
- Nature and quality of an HIV prevention school programme for staff
- Nature and quality of school plan for support to HIV affected teachers & their families
- Perception by staff and students of the adults counsellors available for HIV counselling
- Perceived quality & type of women leaders in the school
- Nature and quality of the class HIV prevention education programme
- Nature and quality of class plan to contribute to supporting HIV affected children & their families in the class, in the community
- Nature and quality of an HIV prevention programme available for the class teachers

Evaluating outputs, outcomes, behaviour

Conflict Management

- Related incidents of successful conflict management in the school (and of school children managing conflict outside school), of conflict de-escalation, of prevention – reported by the children, by non-school observers
- Mastery of several discrete categories of peace building skills by learners and teachers
- Degree and nature of empowerment of previous victims of violence in the school
- Reported perceptions and feelings of security/insecurity
- Perceptions of and level of trust by the children in local authorities/institutions
- Type of projects proposed by the children and taken up by the school/class; quality of the negotiation process

Democratic/civic

- Nature and quality of teachers' & children's (& possibly parents') participation in school/class council to promote democracy in the school/class
- Nature and quality of school/class human rights committee processes (teachers & children); committee goals & tasks set; regular M&E carried out
- Type of civic and political activity encouraged of individual children in the community by the programme
- Quality and degree of experience gained
- Degree of confidence gained by children in the value of civic activity
- Nature and quality of democracy promoting projects/activities chosen and implemented by the class during school year
- Behaviour change of the class and of individual learners resulting from programme
- Learning outcomes and civic outcomes of the above

HIV/AIDS

- Degree of knowledge about HIV & prevention, by gender, by age
- Knowledge of prevention skills
- Attitudes regarding adolescent sexual activity, by gender, by age
- Willingness to engage in safe sex
- Perceptions of: risk avoidance behaviour; HIV infection; pregnancy; marriage
- Confidence in negotiating for one's interests
- Confidence in specific behavioural strategies
- Change in social behaviour
- Degree of knowledge about HIV & prevention, by gender, by social profile

ANNEX 5: SUGGESTIONS FOR WORKSHOPS TO PLAN MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF LTLT/ LIFE SKILLS EDUCATION

1. POSSIBLE WORKSHOP OUTLINE TO PLAN EVALUATION OF LTLT/LIFE SKILLS ELEMENTS IN TRADITIONAL SCHOOL PROGRAMME

Context and objectives of workshop

Context

- (a) crisis or tensions in society; or
- (b) plans for a new curriculum/new generation of textbooks; or
- (c) both (a) and (b)

Objectives

To consider:

- How can schooling can equip students better for the goals of 'living together'/ 'life skills'?
- What expertise and resources are available nationally and how can these be extended?
- What are the priority areas for M&E?
- Plan of action for M&E

Participants: persons with interest, expertise or responsibilities in this area:

Concerned staff from the Ministry of Education and associated specialist centres (eg curriculum centre, examination board), teacher training institutions and education faculty from universities, civil society and parents, educators, headteachers and teachers- including those who have relevant experience - some community representatives, student/youth representatives.

Programme

- 1) What do children and adolescents need to learn at different ages regarding learning to live together/life skills?
- 2) Presentation and review of a framework of basic competencies, subject-matter themes for this dimension of curriculum, and needed pedagogy (perhaps similar to Box 4.5)?
- 3) How can we plan to evaluate curriculum and textbooks for LTLT/life skills coverage against this framework?
- 4) How can we evaluate what happens in schools against this framework? -Preparing for small evaluation studies in selected schools and teacher training institutions
- 5) What would be a good plan of action to build M&E capacity and collect data with a view to building national strategy for LTLT/ life skills education?
- 6) Feedback on workshop

Methodologies

It is a good idea to model the sorts of participation styles that would be part of a LTLT/life skills curriculum, - practical activities using group work, card sorting and ranking exercises, visual displays, democratic voting, etc. Real examples of (problems in) textbooks can be presented for analysis. It is important that equitable contributions are made and all voices heard, and that group work does not just consist of discussion, which can become dominated by the powerful.

Outputs

- Description of existing LTLT/life skills elements; list of gaps in current school curriculum
- Draft framework for LTLT/life skills curriculum, including the 'hidden' curriculum
- Draft criteria for evaluating curriculum and textbooks, and school practices
- Draft plan for preliminary field evaluation work
- Draft M&E plan

2. POSSIBLE WORKSHOP OUTLINE FOR MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF LTLT/ LIFE SKILLS INITIATIVE IN PILOT SCHOOLS OR TEACHER TRAINING INSTITUTIONS

Context and objectives of workshop

Context

- (a) crisis or tensions; or
- (b) in response to plans for a new curriculum/new generation of textbooks; or
- (c) both (a) and (b)

Objectives

To consider:

- What are the current national goals and policies regarding education for LTLT/life skills? How can schooling contribute more?
- Has the LTLT/life skills programme been implemented as intended?
- In this regard, what are the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats regarding the ongoing pilot initiative?
- Are any changes needed for the ongoing programme? What are the priorities among possible next steps?
- Plan of action

Participants: persons with interest, expertise or responsibilities in this area:

Concerned staff from the Ministry of Education and associated specialist centres (eg curriculum centre, examination board), teacher training institutions and education faculty from universities, civil society and parents, educators, head-teachers and teachers- notably those with leadership roles in the pilot project, some community representatives, student/youth representatives.

Programme

1. What are the ongoing initiatives? What are the objectives (eg piloting for later widespread adoption or ...?) What are the achievements, and any M&E results so far?
2. Presentation for discussion of a holistic framework of basic competencies, subject-matter themes for this dimension of curriculum, needed pedagogy (perhaps similar to Box 4.5)
3. Can we adapt this framework to reflect the situation of different components of the pilot initiative? (eg to cover more extra-curricular events)
4. How can we evaluate teaching materials for the LTLT/life skills initiative (and in general?) against this framework?
5. How can we evaluate what happens in pilot schools and/or teacher training institutions against this framework: preparing for small evaluation studies in selected schools and/or teacher training institutions (participating and non-participating institutions)

6. What are the strategic options for further development based on the pilot schools/teacher institutions, and how can the M&E plan help us choose between them?
7. Can we prioritise areas of M&E, identify needed M&E capacity-building, and link this to Education Ministry and other structures, as elements for a draft national M&E plan?
8. Feedback on workshop

Outputs

- Draft framework for LTLT/life skills curriculum, including 'hidden' curriculum
- Draft criteria for evaluating curriculum and textbooks, and school practices
- Draft plan for preliminary field evaluation work
- Elements for national plan of action including development of M&E.

3. POSSIBLE WORKSHOP OUTLINE TO PLAN MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF AN EXISTING SYSTEM-WIDE LTLT/ LIFE SKILLS INITIATIVE

Context and objectives of workshop

Context

- (a) crisis or tensions; or
- (b) in response to plans for a new curriculum/new generation of textbooks; or
- (c) both (a) and (b)

Objectives

To consider:

- What are current national goals and policies regarding education for LTLT/life skills? How can schooling contribute more?
- Has the LTLT/life skills initiative been implemented as intended?
- In this regard, what are the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats regarding the ongoing initiative?
- Are any changes needed in the ongoing programme? What are the priorities among possible next steps?
- Plan of action

Participants: persons with interest, expertise or responsibilities in this area:

Concerned staff from the Ministry of Education and associated specialist centres (eg curriculum centre, examination board), teacher training institutions and education faculty from universities, civil society and parents, educators, head-teachers and teachers- including those with leadership roles in the current initiative, some community representatives, student/youth representatives.

Programme

1. What are the ongoing initiatives?
2. Presentation of a holistic framework of basic competencies, subject-matter themes for this dimension of curriculum, needed pedagogy (perhaps similar to Box 4.5)
3. Can we adapt this framework to reflect the situation of different components of the current initiative? (e g. to cover more extra-curricular events)
4. How can we evaluate curriculum, textbooks, other teaching materials for the LTLT/life skills initiative (and in general?) against this framework?
5. How can we evaluate what happens in schools and teacher training institutions against this framework: preparing for small evaluation studies in selected schools and teacher training institutions
6. Can we prioritise areas of M&E, identify needed M&E capacity-building, and link this to Education Ministry and other structures, as elements for a draft national M&E plan?
7. Feedback on workshop

Outputs

- Draft revised framework for LTLT/life skills curriculum, including 'hidden' curriculum
- Draft criteria for evaluating curriculum and textbooks, school practices and the education sector response to the introduction of the LTLT/life skills initiative
- Draft plan for preliminary field evaluation work
- Elements for national M&E plan of action.



List of abbreviations

CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
EDC	Education for democratic citizenship
EMIS	Education management information system
HIV/AIDS	Human immunodeficiency virus/ acquired immune deficiency syndrome
GTZ	German Agency for Technical Cooperation
HREA	Human Rights Education Associates
INEE	Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies
ISBN	International Standard Book Number
LTLT	Learning to live together
M & E	Monitoring and evaluation
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
RRR	Rights respecting school
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNHCHR	United Nations High Commissioner on Human Rights
UNHCR	United Nations Refugee Agency
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WHO	World Health Organisation

References

(Note. Many of these references can be accessed from www.google.com by typing authors' names and the title of the publication into the 'Search' box.)

- Aber, J.L.; Brown, J.I.; Jones, S.M. 2003. 'Developmental trajectories toward violence in middle childhood: course, demographic differences, and response to school-based intervention.' *Developmental Psychology*, 39 (2), 324-348.
- Abs, H.J.; Veldhuis, R. 2006. *Indicators on active citizenship for democracy – the social, cultural and economic domain*. Ispra: CRELL (Centre for Research on Lifelong Learning).
- Acosta, C.V. 2005. *Education for citizenship in the Caribbean: a study on curricular policy and teacher training in Cuba, Haiti and the Dominican Republic*. Geneva: UNESCO International Bureau of Education.
- AFT (American Federation of Teachers); NCME (National Council on Measurement in Education); NEA (National Education Association). 1990. 'Standards for teacher competences in educational assessment of students.' In: *Educational Measurement: Issues and Practices*, 9(4), pp. 30-32.
- Anderson, M.; Olson, L. 2003. *Confronting war: critical lessons for peace practitioners*. Cambridge MA: The Collaborative for Development Action.
- Apple, M.W.; Bean, J.A. 1999. *Democratic schools: lessons from the chalk face*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- ARRC [Asia-Pacific Regional Resource Center for Human Rights Education] (2003). "What is Human Rights Education." *Human Rights Education Pack*. Bangkok: ARRC.
- Ashton, C. 2000. *Global education project, Albania: second evaluation report*. Tirana: UNICEF. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from www.unicef.org/albania/global_ed_eval.pdf)
- Ashton, C. 2007a. 'Using theory of change to enhance peace education evaluation.' *Conflict Resolution Quarterly*, 25 (1), 39-53.
- Ashton, C. 2007b. *Identifying theories of change in the design and implementation of three UNICEF peace education programs*. (Ph.D. thesis). Fairfax VA: George Mason University.
- Audigier, F. 2000. *Basic concepts and core competencies for education for democratic citizenship*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe.
- Backman, E.; Trafford, B. 2007. *Democratic governance of schools*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe.
- Banks, James A.. 2005. *Democracy and diversity: principles and concepts for education citizens in a global age*. Seattle WA: Center for Multicultural Education, University of Washington.
- Baxter, P. & Ikobwa, V. 2005. Peace education programmes: why and how? *Forced Migration Review*, 22, 28-29. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.fmreview.org/FMRpdfs/FMR22/fmr2213.pdf>)
- Birzea, C.; Cecchini, M; Harrison, C.; Krek, J; Spajic-Vrkas, V. 2005. *Tool for quality assurance of education for democratic citizenship in schools*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe; Paris: UNESCO; Ljubljana: Centre for Educational Policy Studies.
- Bush, K.D.; Salterelli, D. 2002. *The two faces of ethnic conflict: towards a peace-building education for children*. Florence: Innocenti Research Centre.
- Cambridge, J.; Carthew, C. 2007. 'Schools self-evaluating their international values: a case study'. In: Hayden, Mary; Levy, Jack; Thompson, Jeff (eds.) *The SAGE Handbook of research into international education*, 283-298. London: SAGE Publications.
- Cambridge, J. 2007. 'Realism and antirealism in international education research'. In: Hayden, M.; Levy, J.; Thompson, J. (eds.) *The SAGE Handbook of research into international education*, 412-425. London: SAGE Publications.



REFERENCES

- Cane, P.M. 2005. *CAPACITAR emergency response kit*. Santa Cruz CA: Capacitar International.
- Castelli, L.; Locatelli, E.; Canavera, M. 2005. *Psychosocial support for war-affected children in northern Uganda: lessons learned*. Kampala: Associazione Volontari per il Servizio Internazionale.
- CDC. nd. The handbook for evaluating HIV/AIDS education. Atlanta: Centers for Disease Control. (retrieved on 12 December 2007 from www.cdc.gov/HealthyYouth/publications/hiv_handbook/index.htm)
- Clayton, C.J.; Ballif-Spanvill, B.; Hunsaker, M.D. 2001. 'Preventing violence and teaching peace: a review of promising and effective anti-violence, conflict-resolution, and peace education programs for elementary school children', *Applied and Preventive Psychology*, 10, 1-35.
- Clewell, B.C.; Campbell, P.B. 2008. *Building Evaluation Capacity: Designing a Cross-Project Evaluation, Guide 1*. Washington, DC: The Urban Institute, 2008.
- Compton, R. 2000. *Conflict resolution education and social emotional learning programs: a critical comparison of school-based efforts*. (Retrieved on 6 January 2008 from www.disputeresolution.ohio.gov/pdfs/compton.pdf)
- Covell, K.; Howe, R.B. 2007. *Rights, respect and responsibility: report on the Hampshire initiative*. Nova Scotia: Cape Breton University.
- COE. 2006. *Education for democratic citizenship (tools)*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe. (Retrieved on 8 January 2007 from http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/education/edc/Source/Pdf/Documents/2004_44_Tool4TeacherTraining.PDF)
- Cox, C. 2005. 'The experience of Chile'. In: Espinola, V. (ed.) *Education for citizenship and democracy in a globalised world: a comparative perspective*, 81-84. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank.
- Davies, L. 2004. *Education and conflict: complexity and chaos*. London: Routledge.
- Davies, L. 2005. 'Evaluating the link between conflict and education', *Journal of peacebuilding and development*, 2 (2), 42-59.
- Davies, L. 2008 *Educating Against Extremism*. Stoke on Trent: Trentham.
- Davies; L., Harber, C.; Schweisfurth, M. 2002. *Democracy through Teacher Education. A guidebook for use with student teachers*. Birmingham: Centre for International Education and Research.
- Davies, L.; Harber, C.; Schweisfurth, M. 2003. *Global Review of 50 Years of UNESCO Associated Schools Project Network*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Davies, L.; Harber, C.; Schweisfurth, M. 2005. *Democratic Professional Development: A guidebook for supervisors and inspectors of teachers*. Birmingham: Centre for International Education and Research
- Davies, L.; Yamashita, H.; Williams, C. 2007. *Inspiring Schools: Impact and Outcomes: Taking up the challenge of Pupil Participation*. London: Carnegie Young People Initiative.
- Davies, L.; Yamashita, H. 2007. *School Councils: School Improvement* London: School Councils UK.
- De Finger, S.A.; Di Cecco, S.D.; Kasman, R.M. 2007. 'Conflict resolution education: a key tool for the construction of citizenship in Argentina'. *Conflict Resolution Quarterly*, 25 (1), 87-91.
- Elias, M.J. 2003. *Academic and social-emotional learning*. Geneva: UNESCO International Bureau of Education.
- Espinola, V. 2005. 'Citizenship education for youth in the global village'. In: Espinola, V. (ed.) *Education for citizenship and democracy in a globalised world: a comparative perspective*, 1-18. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank.
- Flowers, N. (ed.) 1998. *Human rights here and now: celebrating the Universal Declaration of Human Rights*. Minneapolis: Amnesty International USA and University of Minnesota Human Rights Resource Center.

- Fountain, S. 1997. *Education for conflict resolution: a training of trainers manual*. New York: UNICEF.
- Fountain, S. 1999. *Peace education in UNICEF*. New York: UNICEF. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.unicef.org/girlseducation/files/PeaceEducation.pdf>)
- Fountain, S. 2002. *Evaluating UNICEF peace education projects (second draft)*. New York: UNICEF.
- Fountain, S.; Gillespie, A. 2003. *Assessment strategies for skills-based health education with a focus on HIV prevention and related issues (draft)*. New York: UNICEF.
- Gachuhi, D. 1999. *The impact of HIV/AIDS on education systems in the Eastern and Southern Africa region and the response of education systems to HIV/AIDS life skill programmes*. New York: UNICEF. (Retrieved on 10 January from <http://www.unicef.org/lifeskills/files.gachuhi.pdf>)
- Galtung, J. 1969. Violence, peace and peace research. *Journal of Peace Studies*, vol. 6, pp.167-191.
- Garrard, W.M.; Lipsey, M.W. 2007. 'Conflict resolution and antisocial behavior in US schools: a meta-analysis.' *Conflict Resolution Quarterly*, 25 (1), 9-38.
- Gollob, R.; Huddleston, E.; Krapf, P.; Salema, M; Spajic-Vrkas, V. 2007. *Tool on teacher training for education for democratic citizenship and human rights education*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe.
- Gomez-Morin, L. 2005. 'The experience of Mexico'. In: Espinola, V. (ed.) *Education for citizenship and democracy in a globalised world: a comparative perspective*, 91-95. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank.
- Greaney, V. 2005. *Textbooks, respect for diversity and social cohesion*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Hamburg, D. (1994) Education for conflict resolution: can we learn to live together? Annual Report. New York: Carnegie Corporation. (Retrieved on 7 January 2007 from <http://www.carnegie.org/sub/about/pessay/pessay94.html>)
- Hamburg, D. & Hamburg, B.A. (2004). *Learning to live together: preventing hatred and violence in child and adolescent development*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Harris, I.; Morrison, M. 2003. *Peace education*. Jefferson NC: McFarland & Co.
- Hayden, M.; Levy, J.; Thompson, J. (eds.) 2007. *The SAGE Handbook of research into international education*, pp. 25-37. London: SAGE Publications.
- Haywood, T. 2007. 'A simple typology of international-mindedness and its implications for education'. In Hayden, M.; Levy, J.; Thompson, J. (eds.) *The SAGE Handbook of research into international education*, 77-89. London: SAGE Publications.
- Hey, H. 2006. *Strengthening the human rights-based approach in German development cooperation with Guatemala*. Eschborn: GTZ.
- Hill, I. 2007. 'International education as developed by the International Baccalaureate Organisation.' In Hayden, M.; Levy, J.; Thompson, J. (eds.) *The SAGE Handbook of research into international education*, 25-37. London: SAGE Publications.
- ICRC. 2001. *Exploring humanitarian law: education modules for young people*. Geneva: International Committee of the Red Cross and Red Crescent. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from http://www.icrc.org/index.php?option=com_content&task=blogcategory&id=49&Itemid=468)
- INEE. 2004. *Minimum standards for education in emergencies, chronic crises and early reconstruction*. Paris: Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies.
- INEE. 2005. *Inter-Agency Peace Education Programme: skills for constructive living*. Paris: UNESCO.
- IRC. 2007. *Teaching well? Educational reconstruction efforts and support to teachers in postwar Liberia*. New York: International Rescue Committee.



REFERENCES

- Jaramillo, R. 2005. 'The experience of Colombia'. In: Espinola, V. (ed.) *Education for citizenship and democracy in a globalised world: a comparative perspective*. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank, 87-90.
- Jones, T.S. 2002. *School conflict management: evaluating your conflict resolution education program – a guide for educators and evaluators*. Cleveland: Ohio Department of Education and Ohio Commission on Dispute Management and Conflict Resolution.
- Jones, T.S. 2004a. 'Conflict resolution education: the field, the findings, and the future.' *Conflict Resolution Quarterly*, 22 (1-2), 233-267.
- Jones, T.S. 2004b. *Does CRE/SEL/PE make a difference? – annotated bibliography*. Presentation for Western European Conference on the Role of NGOs and Civil Society in the Prevention of Armed Conflict, Dublin, March 31-April 2, 2004.
- Kellaghan, T.; Greaney, V. 2001. *Using assessment to improve the quality of education*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute of Educational Planning.
- Kirby, D., Laris, B.A. & Roller, L. (2006). *The impact of sex and HIV education programmes in schools and communities on sexual behaviour among young adults*. Research Triangle Park, NC: Family Health International. (Retrieved on 13 December 2006 from <http://www.etr.org/recapp/programs/SexHIVedProgs.pdf>)
- Lederach, J.P. 1994. *Preparing for peace: conflict transformation across cultures*. Syracuse NY: Syracuse University Press.
- Lederach, J.P.; Neufeldt, R.; Culbertson, H. 2007. *Reflective peacebuilding: a planning, monitoring, and learning toolkit*. Notre Dame IN: Joan Croc Institute.
- Leach, F.E.; Mitchell, C. 2006. *Combating Gender Violence In and Around Schools*. Stoke on Trent: Trentham.
- Living Values (2005). *Living values education: overview*. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://livingvalues.net/pdf/lvoverview.pdf>)
- Lowry, B., Harder, A. & Miller, V. (eds.) 2005. *And the children shall lead them: an NGO journey into peace education. Monrovia, CA: World Vision International*. (Retrieved 8 December 2006 from <http://www.developmentstudies.org/PolicyAdvocacy/pahome2.5.nsf/allresources/B9F432D281F0880F882>.)
- Miller, V. 2005. 'Where's the peace? What's the education? A closer look at existing curricula; questions asked of peace education curricula.' In: Lowry, B.; Harder, A.; Miller, V. (eds). *And the children shall lead them: an NGO journey into peace education*, 81-130. Monrovia CA: World Vision International.
- MOE Liberia, 2007. Citizenship manual (draft). Monrovia: Ministry of Education.
- Mosley, J. 1998. *Quality circle time in the primary school: your essential guide to enhancing self-esteem, self-discipline and personal relationships*. Cambridge: Findel Education Ltd.
- Nelson, J.; Kerr, D. 2005. *International review of curriculum and assessment frameworks – Active citizenship: definitions, goals and practices*. Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research.
- Obura, A. 2002. *UNHCR Peace Education Programme: evaluation report*. Geneva: UNHCR. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.unhcr.org/research/RESEARCH/3e1a9f0b.pdf>)
- Obura, A. 2007. Facing the gathering storm. Geneva: UNESCO International Bureau of Education.
- ODI. 2007. *Governance assessment: overview of governance assessment frameworks and results from the 2006 World Governance Assessment – report from ODI Learning Workshop*, 15 February 2007. London: Overseas Development Institute.
- OECD. 2003. *Key competencies for a successful life and a well-functioning society*. Berne: Hogrefe and Huber.

- Olweus, D. 1996. 'Bully/victim problems in school'. *UNESCO Prospects*, 36, 331-360.
- Osler, A.; Starkey, H. 1996. *Teacher education and human rights*. London: David Fulton.
- Osler, A.; Starkey, H. 1999. 'Rights, identities and inclusion: European action programmes as political education'. *Oxford Review of Education*, 25, 199-215.
- Osler, A.; Starkey, H. 2005. 'Study on the advances in civic education in education systems: good practices in industrialised societies.' In: Espinola, V. (ed). *Education for citizenship and democracy in a globalised world: a comparative perspective*, 19-60 Washington DC: Inter-American Development Bank.
- Osler, A.; Starkey, H. 2006. 'Education for democratic citizenship: a review of research, policy and practice 1995-2005'. *Research Papers in Education*, 21 (4), 433-466.
- Paffenholz, T.; Reyhler, L. 2007. *Aid for peace: a guide to planning and evaluation for conflict zones*. Baden-Baden: Nomos.
- Patti, J.; Espinosa, A.C. 2007. 'Citizenship competencies in Colombia: learning from policy and practice'. *Conflict Resolution Quarterly*, 25 (1), 109-125.
- Plummer, Mary L., Daniel Wight, David A. Ross, Rebecca Balira, Alessandra Anemona, Jim Todd, Zachayo Salamba, Angela I. N. Obasi, Heiner Grosskurth, John Chagalunga, Richard J. Hayes. 2004. 'Asking semi-literate adolescents about sexual behaviour: the validity of assisted self-completion questionnaire (ASCQ) data in rural Tanzania'. *Tropical Medicine & International Health* 9 (6), 737-754. Retrieved from <http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/links/doi/10.1111/j.1365-3156.2004.01254.x/enhancedabs/?cookieSet=1>
- Plummer, Mary L., Daniel Wight, Joyce Wamoyi, Gerry Mshana, Richard J. Hayes, David A. Ross. 2006a. 'Farming with Your Hoe in a Sack: Condom Attitudes, Access, and Use in Rural Tanzania'. *Studies in Family Planning* Vol. 37 Issue 1 (March) <http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1728-4465.2006.00081.x>
- Plummer, Mary L., D. Wight, J. Wamoyi, K. Nyalali, T. Ingall, G. Mshana, Z. S. Shigongo, A. I. N. Obasi and D. A. Ross. 2006b. 'Are schools a good setting for adolescent sexual health promotion in rural Africa? A qualitative assessment from Tanzania'. *Health Education Research Advance Access*, 1-17.
- Postlethwaite, T.N. 2004. *Monitoring educational achievement*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning.
- Power, F.C.; Hart, S.N. 2005. 'The way forward to constructive child discipline'. In: Hart, S.N. (ed) *Eliminating corporal punishment: the way forward to constructive child discipline*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Reardon, B. & Cabezudo, A. 2002. *Learning to abolish war: teaching toward a culture of peace*. New York: Hague Appeal for Peace.
- Reimers, F.; Villegas-Reimers, E. 2005. 'Education for citizenship and democracy: policies and programmes in Latin American and Caribbean secondary schools'. In: Espinola, V. (ed.) *Education for citizenship and democracy in a globalised world: a comparative perspective*, 61-80. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank.
- Rogers, E.; Shoemaker, F. 1971. *Communication of innovations: a cross-cultural approach*. New York: The Free Press.
- Rychen, D.S.; Salganik, L.H. (eds.) 2001. *Defining and selecting key competencies*. Berne: Hogrefe and Huber.
- Rychen, D.S.; Tiana, A. 2004. *Developing key competencies in education: some lessons from international and national experience*. Geneva: UNESCO International Bureau of Education.
- Sabir, A. 2006 *Review of Moroccan school textbooks for gender equality and human rights: project results*. Cambridge MA: Human Rights Education Associates.

REFERENCES

- Salomon, G.; Nevo, B. (eds.) 2002. *Peace education around the world: the concept, the practice, the research*. Mahwah NJ: Lawrence Earlbaum Associates.
- Sinclair, M. 2001. 'Education in emergencies'. In: Crisp, Talbot and Cipollone. *Learning for a future: refugee education in developing countries*, 1-83. Geneva: UNHCR.
- Sinclair, M. 2004. *Learning to live together: building skills, values and attitudes for the twenty-first century*. Geneva: UNESCO International Bureau of Education. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from http://www.ineesite.org/uploads/documents/store/doc_1_48_Learning_to_Live_Together.pdf)
- Smith, A.; Robinson, A. 1996. *Education for Mutual Understanding: the initial statutory years*. Coleraine: Centre for the Study of Conflict, University of Ulster.
- Smith, A.; Karela, M.; Fountain, S.; Marojevic, S.; McLean, H. 2002. *A framework for the evaluation of civic education and religious instruction within the school system in Serbia*. Paris: UNESCO; New York: UNICEF; Budapest: Open Society Institute.
- Smith, A.; Vaux, T. 2002. *Education, conflict and international development*. London: Department for International Development.
- Tawil, S. 2000. International humanitarian law and basic education. *International Review of the Red Cross*, vol. 82, p. 581-600. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.icrc.org/Web/eng/siteeng0.nsf/html/57JQQ4>)
- Tawil, S.; Harley, A. 2004. 'Education and identity-based conflict: assessing curriculum policy for social and civic reconstruction' In Tawil, S.; Harley, A. (eds) *Education, conflict and social cohesion*, pp1-35.. Geneva: UNESCO International Bureau of Education.
- Tibbitts, F. 1997a. *A primer for selecting democratic and human rights education teaching materials*. New York: Open Society Institute; Cambridge, MA.: Human Rights Education Associates. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.hrea.org/pubs/Primer/introduction.html>)
- Tibbitts, F. 1997b. *Evaluation in the human rights education field: getting started*. The Hague: Netherlands Helsinki Committee.
- Tibbitts, F. 2001. 'Prospects for civics education in transitional democracies: results of an impact study in Romanian classrooms', *Intercultural Education*, 12, (1).
- Tibbitts, F. 2004. *Literature review on outcomes of school-based programs related to 'learning to live together'*. Geneva: UNESCO International Bureau of Education.
- Tibbitts, F. 2006. 'Learning from the past: supporting teaching through the Facing the Past history project in South Africa'. UNESCO Prospects, 36 (3), 295-317.
- Tibbitts, F.; Fernekes, W. (forthcoming). 'Human rights education'. In Totten, S. and Pederson, J.E. (eds.) *Teaching about social issues in the 20th and 21st centuries: innovative approaches, programs, strategies*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.
- Torney-Purta, J.; Lehmann, R.; Oswald, H.; Schulz, W. 2001. *Citizenship and education in twenty-eight countries: civic knowledge and engagement at age fourteen*. Amsterdam: International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement.
- UNESCO. 1996. *Learning – the treasure within: report to UNESCO of the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century*. Paris: UNESCO. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.unesco.org/education/pdf/15-62.pdf>)
- UNESCO. 2001. *Forty-sixth session of the International Conference on Education: education for all for learning to live together – contents and learning strategies, problems and solutions*. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.ibe.org/International/ICE/46english/46doce.htm>)
- UNESCO. 2002a. *Learning to be: a holistic and integrated approach to values education for human development*. Bangkok: UNESCO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www2.unescobkk.org/elib/publications/LearningToBe/LearningToBe.pdf>)

UNESCO, 2002b. *Framework for action on values education in early childhood*. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO. 2005. *A comprehensive strategy for textbooks and learning materials*. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO. 2006a. *UNESCO guidelines on intercultural education*. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO. 2006b. *Fostering peaceful co-existence through analysis and revision of history curricula and textbooks in southeast Europe: preliminary stocktaking report*. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO; CEPS. 2004. *Education for democratic citizenship: from policy to effective practice through quality assurance - stocktaking study country reports*. Paris: UNESCO; University of Ljubljana: Centre for Educational Policy Studies.

UNESCO; UNHCHR. 2006. *Plan of action for the first phase (2005-2007) of the World Programme for Human Rights Education*. Paris: UNESCO; Geneva: Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. (Retrieved on 8 December 2006 from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001478/147853e.pdf>.)

UNESCO. 2006. *Guidebook for planning education in emergencies and reconstruction*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute of Educational Planning. (Retrieved on 11 January 2007 from <http://www.unesco.org/iiep/eng/focus/emergency/guidebook/section5.pdf>)

UNESCO (2007). *HIV and AIDS curriculum manual (draft under revision)*. Geneva: International Bureau of Education. (Retrieved on 9 January 2007 from www.ibe.org/AIDS/Manual/Manual_home.htm)

UNESCO; UNICEF. 2007. *A human rights-based approach to Education for All*. Paris: UNESCO; New York: UNICEF.

UNHCHR. 1997. *International plan of action for the Decade of Human Rights Education*. Geneva: Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.

UNICEF. 2000. *Domestic violence against women and girls*. Florence: UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre.

UNICEF. 2002a. *Lessons learned about life skills-based education for preventing HIV/AIDS related risk and related discrimination*. (Retrieved on 9 January 2007 from <http://www.unicef.org/lifeskills/files/LessonsLearnedLSBE.doc>)

UNICEF. 2002b. *Programme evaluation: life skills-based education measures and indicators*. New York: UNICEF.

UNICEF. 2004. *Skills-based education for HIV/AIDS prevention: planing for monitoring and evaluation (draft)*. New York: UNICEF.

UNICEF. 2005a. *Life-Skills-Based Education in South Asia*. Katmandu: UNICEF Regional Office.

UNICEF. 2005b. *Report of the South Asia Regional Forum on Life-Skills-Based Education*. Katmandu: UNICEF Regional Office.

UNIFEM. 2003. *Not a minute more: ending violence against women*. New York: UNIFEM.

USAID. 2006. *Education and fragility: an assessment tool*. Washington DC: USAID.

Villegas-Reimers, E. 2002. 'Education for democracy'. *Revista – Harvard Review of Latin America*. (Retrieved on 4 January 2008 from www.drclas.harvard.edu/revista/articles/view/173)

WCRWC. 2005. *Youth speak out: new voices on the protection and participation of young people affected by armed conflict*. New York: Women's Commission on Refugee Women and Children.

WHO. 2003. *Skills for health – skills-based health education including life-skills: an important component of a child-friendly/health-promoting school*. Geneva: World Health Organisation. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.unicef.org/lifeskills/SkillsForHealth230503.pdf>)



REFERENCES

- WHO; UNESCO. 1994. *School health education to prevent AIDS and STD: a resource package for curriculum planners*. Geneva: World Health Organization and UNESCO; re-issued by UNAIDS, Geneva. (Retrieved on 10 January 2007 from <http://www.unesco.org/educprog/pead/GB/AIDSGB/AIDSGBtx/GuideGB/Planif/Intro.pdf>)
- WHO/UNESCO/Education International. 1998. *Violence Prevention: An Important Element of a Health Promoting School. WHO Information Series on School Health – Document 3*. Geneva: World Health Organisation.
- Winthrop, R.; Kirk, J. 2005. 'Teacher development and student well-being'. *Forced Migration Review*, 22, 18-21.
- World Bank. 2005. *Reshaping the future: education and post-conflict reconstruction*. Washington DC: World Bank.
- World Education Forum. 2000. *The Dakar framework for action – Education for All: meeting our collective commitments*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Zins, J.E.; Bloodworth, M.R.; Weissberg, R.P.; Walberg, H.J. 2004. 'The scientific base linking social and emotional learning to school success'. In: Zins, J.E.; Weissberg, R.P.; Wang, M.C.; Walberg, H.J. (eds) *Building academic success on social and emotional learning: what does the research say?* New York: Teachers College Press.

ENDNOTES

- ¹ The other themes were learning to learn, learning to be and learning to do (UNESCO, 1996). These themes overlap and to learn to live together, we must also learn to be, to learn and to do. For follow up on the theme of 'learning to live together', see for example UNESCO (2001), Hamburg and Hamburg (2004), Tawil and Harley (2004), Sinclair (2004), Tibbitts (2004).
- ² World Education Forum (2000: 8), emphasis added.
- ³ World Education Forum (2000). See also the definitions on UNICEF's website (http://www.unicef.org/lifeskills/index_whichskills.html).
- ⁴ Charter of the United Nations, Preamble and Articles 1, 55.
- ⁵ Article 26(2). The 1966 International Covenant for Economic and Social Rights, Article 13(1), requires states who have ratified the covenant to observe these commitments.
- ⁶ Draft report on UNICEF Consultation on Life Skills Based Education, August 2007. See also UNICEF 2005a, b). South Africa uses the term 'Life Orientation', for a new subject which covers life skills and learning to give together themes.
- ⁷ See UNHCHR (1997); UNESCO and UNHCHR (2006).
- ⁸ See the website (www.ineesite.org) of the Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE) for a comprehensive overview of the literature on education in crisis situations and reconstruction. The INEE Minimum Standards for Education in Emergencies, Chronic Crises and Early Reconstruction recommend education for life skills, appreciation of diversity, education for peace, human rights and humanitarian norms (INEE, 2004: 56-59). An INEE-endorsed 'Peace Education Programme' is available on this website (overview and teaching-learning materials). See also UNESCO (2006).
- ⁹ Davies (2004, 2005) stresses the many ways in which schooling falls short of these ideals and can actually lay the foundations for conflict. Bush and Salterelli (2002), Smith and Vaux (2002) and others have shown that unequal access to quality education in divided societies, together with curricular bias favouring particular groups, can act as triggers for conflict. The stress now is on developing and working with 'conflict sensitive' approaches that can mitigate the outbreak or recurrence of conflict in fragile states (World Bank, 2005; USAID, 2006;). The Reflecting on Peace Practice project (Anderson and Olson, 2003) identified the need to reach key people as well as many people, and the school student may seem to be far from key people, - but it should be remembered that teachers are often opinion leaders in communities as well as influencing students, and possibly their families.
- ¹⁰ Due to this focus, the book does not give much coverage to peace education activities based on 'contact', 'encounter' and similar approaches. For an overview, see Salomon and Nevo (2002).
- ¹¹ Source: Adapted from Obura (2007).
- ¹² Competencies have been defined as '*the ability to meet complex demands on a behavioural level*' (Abs and Veldhuis, 2006: 48). The term 'life skills' as used in the Dakar Framework and in this Guide technically refers to 'life competencies' in this sense, since knowledge, values, attitudes etc are involved as well as skills. However, for practical reasons, we have retained the term 'life skills' which is in common usage.
- ¹³ OECD conducted a major project to identify key competencies required for modern life and work. The term 'using tools interactively' means 'ability to use language, symbols and text interactively, to use knowledge and information interactively, and to use technology interactively' (OECD, 2003; Rychen and Salganik, 2001; Rychen and Tiana, 2004).
- ¹⁴ The process as currently conducted entails sub-groups of participants working to identify learning outcomes for each strand, for lower and upper primary, and lower and upper secondary schooling,

so that there is sequence and coherence for each theme. An outline curriculum is then developed, which is cross-checked against the profile of outcomes identified by the national educators (Brian Dobson, personal communication).

¹⁵ See the CASEL website (<http://www.casel.org/basics/skills.php>). CASEL works mainly in the USA and is based in Chicago, Illinois.

¹⁶ The Illinois State Board of Education website (http://www.isbe.net/ils/social_emotional/standards.htm) gives social and emotional learning goals, objectives and attainment descriptors for kindergarten to grade 12, reflecting the CASEL approach.

¹⁷ These categories have been used in various programmes such as peace education, education for HIV/AIDS prevention etc. See, for example, WHO, 2003; INEE, 2005; Lowry et al., 2005).

¹⁸ See Davies (2008).

¹⁹ See, for example, UNESCO (2002a,b), Living Values (2005).

²⁰ As stressed by Olweus (1996) and others, many students struggle with the challenge of living together in school, -becoming bullies and/or bullied during their school lives (and otherwise), - and/or missing opportunities to help others by being passive bystanders. This cannot be ignored by peace and human rights education, which has to connect with students' lives.

²¹ See, for example, websites for the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) (www.iea.nl), Education Commission of the States (USA) database of questions for civic competencies and school climate (http://www.ecs.org/ecsmain.asp?page=Qna/splash_new.asp); also (for a pilot study on general problem-solving) OECD Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) (www.oecd.pisa.org). The IEA conducted an international study of civic education in 1999, and will conduct a study of 'civic and citizenship education' in 2008/2009. In its 1999 survey, questionnaires on civic competencies were administered to nearly 93,000 students aged 14 in 28 countries from Western and Eastern Europe, the Russian Federation, Australia, Chile, Colombia, Hongkong, USA. In 2000, IEA questionnaires were administered to over 50,000 upper secondary students from 16 countries. For the structure of the test and survey instruments, see Torney-Purta et al. (2001). See also Postlethwaite (2004); Kellaghan and Greaney (2001).

²² Gachuhi (1999) and others (see for example UNICEF, 2002a) showed that many HIV/AIDS education programmes were poorly implemented, and focused more on information transfer than behaviour. The classroom manual for HIV/AIDS education produced by WHO and UNESCO (1994) has three volumes, one each for curriculum designers, teachers and students. It provides many useful examples of assertiveness and negotiation applied to situations of pressure for unwanted or unprotected sex. UNESCO's International Bureau of Education has a global database of HIV/AIDS education programmes and has developed a guidebook for educators (UNESCO, 2007).

²³ For guides to evaluation of HIV/AIDS education, see for example Fountain and Gillespie (2003), UNICEF (2002a,b, 2004), CDC (nd).

²⁴ From FRESH tools for effective health (2004). Downloaded on 9 June 2008 from http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/files/37126/11018377463ppe_P_violence_Setting_Goals_and_Objectives.doc/ppe%2BP%2Bviolence%2BSetting%2BGoals%2Band%2BObjectives.doc (Adapted by UNESCO from WHO/UNESCO/Education International, 1998.)

²⁵ See, for example, Garrard and Lipsey (2007), De Finger, Di Cecco, Kasman (2007), Hamburg (1994). Compton (nd) shows how the fields of education for conflict resolution and for social and emotional learning have historically been linked with different movements but now have increasing areas of commonality. Ohio State has comprehensive manuals on conflict resolution education in schools, and a manual for evaluation of these programmes (see Jones, 2002). For a review of approaches to conflict resolution education especially in the USA and the evidence showing their effectiveness, see Jones (2004a,b).

- ²⁶ See Fountain (1997), Baxter and Ikobwa (2005), INEE (2005).
- ²⁷ Since each person's identity is complex and changing, it is sometimes said that we all have – and should acknowledge - 'hybrid' identities which are unique combinations (Davies, 2004).
- ²⁸ See Banks (2005). For a discussion of contrasting narratives in the Middle East, as well as papers on the design and evaluation of peace education, see Salomon and Nevo (2002).
- ²⁹ See, for example, the guide by Felisa Tibbitts (1997a), Director and co-founder of the NGO Human Rights Education Associates, which has an excellent website (www.hrea.org) and listserv on human rights education. Also examples such as Hey (2006). Also UNESCO and UNICEF (2007).
- ³⁰ Flowers (1998), cited in Tibbitts and Fernekes (2007) gives a matrix of goals, key concepts, specific human rights problems and legal and social norms, for each level of education from pre-school to upper secondary, aligned essentially to schools in the USA. Different themes would be important in many other settings.
- ³¹ From Davies (2008); see also Covell and Howe (2007). See the UNICEF Rights Respecting Schools Award website <http://rrsa.unicef.org.uk/>
- ³² See the Exploring International Law website (<http://www.ehl.icrc.org/>); also ICRC (2001), Tawil (2000).
- ³³ Davies, L and Yamashita, H (2007).
- ³⁴ For examples of civic education evaluation design for Eastern Europe, see Smith et al. (2002), Tibbitts (2001).
- ³⁵ See studies reviewed in Davies, Yamashita and Williams (2007) *Inspiring Schools: Impact and Outcomes: Taking up the challenge of Pupil Participation* Review for Carnegie Young People Initiative www.carnegie-youth.org.uk
- ³⁶ Student responsibilities in the classroom, and through representatives on student councils and school management committees, can help give students the voice demanded by the Convention on the Rights of the Child as well as improving education quality and access. Save the Children, for example, has supported children's fora in Nepal, Pakistan, Eastern Sri Lanka, South Sudan and elsewhere to provide adolescents with a voice on how to solve their problems, including access to education. The Girls' Education Movement in Africa has enabled girls and boys to seek solutions to problems such as sexual violence in schools, including in conflict-affected areas of northern Uganda.
- ³⁷ Davies et al. (2007).
- ³⁸ Scholars distinguish between 'bonding' social capital, referring to civil society groups comprising people who have a natural close relationship (eg an association of workers from a particular ethnic group, or of churches with a similar creed), and 'bridging social capital', referring to civil society groups which cross social divides and strengthen social cohesion (eg a football club with members from multiple ethnicities). Educators can perhaps use these concepts in a locally appropriate/ balanced way when deciding on involvement with civil society actors.
- ³⁹ Statement from the webpage for the UN Decade for Education for Sustainable Development (2005-2014) downloaded on 2 March 2008 from http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=23279&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html
- ⁴⁰ For a discussion of the objective of 'international-mindedness', especially but not exclusively in the context of international schools and the International Baccalaureate, see Hayden, Levy and Thompson (2007), Haywood (2007), Hill (2007), Cambridge and Carthew (2007).
- ⁴¹ Davies, Harber and Schweisfurth (2003).
- ⁴² Personal communication, Brian Dobson.
- ⁴³ Sinclair (2004). This framework was based a discussion between Margaret Sinclair and Pamela Baxter and draws on the INEE peace education framework developed by Pamela Baxter. The INEE



ENDNOTES

materials were devised initially for East Africa through consultation with refugee educators and community members, and placed less emphasis on enhancing individual self-esteem and more on acceptance of diversity than other programmes; -this can be easily adjusted according to need. Pamela Baxter pointed out the difficulty of covering both concept and skill development and their application in a school year of effectively 28 teaching weeks with one period a week. This could be overcome if a two-yearly cycle was used for covering the range of skills and topics, instead of the original one year cycle.

⁴⁴ See, for example, Winthrop and Kirk (2005); Castelli, Locatelli and Canavera (2005), Cane (2005), Sinclair (2001).

⁴⁵ In the UK, activities of this kind have been developed under the heading of 'Circle Time', when teachers address values and interpersonal issues with children seated in a circle and often using stimulus activities and tools such as a 'pretend' microphone, so that children speak in turn. The teacher and students participate in the circle activities as 'persons', with the teacher assuming the role of a facilitator guiding discussion, even with very young children (Mosley, 1998). This approach has been used for the officially required Personal, Social and Health Education, and when opportunities arise, -eg. due to conflict among pupils.

⁴⁶ Even in Northern Ireland, where teachers have received good training in active learning and facilitating discussion, and have reasonably adequate resources, the political sensitivity of 'education for mutual understanding' between the two sides of the conflict was keenly felt (Smith & Robinson, 1996). Regarding constructive child discipline, see Power and Hart (2005).

⁴⁷ As was found during the 'Education for Mutual Understanding' initiative in Northern Ireland (Smith and Robinson, 1996).

⁴⁸ Sinclair (2004).

⁴⁹ Winthrop & Kirk (2005), IRC (2007). In some locations, female classroom assistants have been hired to make it harder for teachers to sexually exploit older girls; this helps to ensure that human rights are respected in the classroom, but is too costly for many schools in regions where such harassment is common. It also facilitates group work.

⁵⁰ See UNICEF's *A Framework for Rights-Based, Child-Friendly Schools*, downloaded on 10 July 2005 from www.unicef.org/programme/lifeskills/support/.

⁵¹ Tom Tilson, Victor Vasquez, Abdechafi Boubkir (personal communication).

⁵² See, for example, UNESCO (2005, 2006a), Greaney (2005).

⁵³ Davies (2004).

⁵⁴ Details of the Georg Eckert Institute library and other resources can be found on www.gei.de. See also UNESCO (2006b).

⁵⁵ *Downloaded on 11 June 2008* from http://www.fasttrackinitiative.org/library/FS_progressive-frameworkmay07.pdf

⁵⁶ Banks (2005).

⁵⁷ From Human Rights Education Associates database. The Project for Promoting Human Rights in Primary and Secondary School Textbooks was carried out under the auspices of the Turkish Academy of Sciences, by the History Foundation in cooperation with the Human Rights Foundation of Turkey, with financial support from the European Union and the Open Society Institute.

⁵⁸ Often, the teaching of knowledge and skills is infused with attitudes and values, so that there is less point in enumerating them separately. However, in some cases, there may be a reason for focusing on particular aspects. Regarding the use of 'ticks' in Box 4.5, there could instead be brief comments instead (or codes).

⁵⁹ Adapted from Sinclair (2004).

⁶⁰ Brian Dobson, personal communication. This approach has been used by several countries, with UNICEF technical support.

⁶¹ Davies, Harber and Schweisfurth (2005).

⁶² Davies, Harber and Schweisfurth (2002).

⁶³ Fountain (2002: 7-10) cites also the standards developed by the American Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation, covering utility, feasibility, propriety and accuracy (including validity and reliability).

⁶⁴ For example, over 150 adolescent researchers in Kosovo, Northern Uganda and Sierra Leone interviewed over 2300 of their peers and adults, as part of a research programme led by the Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children, from 1999 to 2002 (WCRWC, 2005).

⁶⁵ See, for example, Paffenholz and Reychler (2007).

⁶⁶ See Clewell and Campbell (2008).

⁶⁷ Adapted from Fountain (2002: 40-43).

⁶⁸ Fountain and Gillespie (2003: 16).

⁶⁹ For examples, see Aber, Brown and Jones (2003), Clayton, Ballif-Spanvill and Hunsaker (2001), Zins et al., (2004).

⁷⁰ Plummer et al. (2004) report on responses to written questionnaires (which were also read aloud) about sexual behaviour of school pupils in rural Tanzania; responses from some students were inconsistent (self-contradictory) over time. Plummer et al. (2006a,b) report the unreliability of data from written questionnaires filled in by girls, on frequency of sexual behaviour, and of data from face to face interviews with boys regarding condom use.

⁷¹ This is part of a broader problem encountered in cross-cultural studies, of whether concepts from one culture fit well in another culture. Terms used within the culture ('emic' or internal) may have different overtones when transposed (as 'etic' or external concepts) elsewhere. A simple example is the conceptualization of the person in charge of a school, which can vary from head-teacher in some cultures to 'director', 'school manager' etc elsewhere (Cambridge, 2007: 415). A questionnaire designed in a 'western' country may assume ideas of self-hood that are different from those found in more 'collective' or traditional cultures, for example. It is important for national professionals to critically review educational materials, questionnaires and interview schedules from elsewhere, to ensure that the goals appropriate to their culture are properly represented and prioritized.

⁷² Lederach (1994), Lederach et al. (2007) have spelled out the advantages of the elicitive approach.

⁷³ Kellaghan & Greaney (2001: 19), citing AFT, NCME, NEA (1990: 1).

⁷⁴ Adapted from Birzea et al. (2005: 58). In this document, what we have called the 'key questions' are termed 'quality indicators', -illustrating the flexible use of terminology in this field (especially the wide range of interpretations of 'indicators').

⁷⁵ Adapted from Ashton, 2007b: 114.

⁷⁶ This model for adoption of innovations was suggested by Rogers and Shoemaker (1971).

The adoption curve shows that when behavioural change interventions are introduced there is a small group of innovators who adopt quickly, while others adopt more slowly. Besides individual behaviour, the model can also illuminate the response of schools, some of which (usually led by innovative headteachers) become innovators and early adopters, while others take longer to fully accept a particular innovation.

⁷⁷ Osler and Starkey (2006: 446) note that education for democratic citizenship draws on the work of Dewey, Freire, Freinet and other educational philosophers and innovators. They cite Apple and Bean's (1999) research study, which suggests that education should promote the 'foundations of the democratic way of life', notably: critical reflection and analysis for the evaluation of ideas, problems and policies; open flow of ideas; faith in the capacity of people to solve problems;

concern for the common good; concern for the dignity and rights of individuals and minorities; an idealised set of values for guiding democratic life as a people; social institutions that support a democratic way of life'. Osler and Starkey (1999) also reviewed transnational education projects and programmes within 18 European states, illustrating best practice in education for active citizenship. They concluded that 'learning for citizenship is best achieved if it is based on acquiring knowledge, reflecting on identity, living in a community and developing skills for participation.'

⁷⁸ As in recent initiatives for 'education for peace, human rights and citizenship' in Liberia, and 'education for peace, human rights and civic education in Nepal'.

⁷⁹ Reflection on the renewed interest in education for citizenship has become something of a 'growth industry'. Key factors influencing this trend were identified by Osler and Starkey (2006) as: global injustice and inequality; globalisation and migration; concerns about civic and political engagement; 'youth deficit' (deficit in prosocial behaviour or interest in voting in elections); end of the Cold War and post-conflict reconstruction; and (the need to counter) anti-democratic and racist movements.

⁸⁰ Osler & Starkey (2006:441) cite the similar 'maximalist' conclusions of Audigier (2000), who identified four dimensions of education for democratic citizenship: political and legal, social, economic and cultural.

⁸¹ Adapted from Osler and Starkey (1999: 200-203)), Ostler and Starkey (2005) citing Ostler and Starkey (1996).

⁸² Similar trends are reported in Acosta (2005).

⁸³ Cox, 2005: 83.

⁸⁴ See Birzea et al., 2005; COE, 2006; Gollob et al, 2007; Backman & Trafford, 2007. In Europe, 2005 was designated as a Year of Education for Democratic Citizenship.

⁸⁵ M)E Liberia (2007).

⁸⁶ See, for example, Galtung, 1969; Fountain, 1999; Harris and Morrison, 2003; Miller, 2005.

A framework for peace education developed to build upon the 1999 Hague Agenda for Peace and Justice for the Twenty-first Century deals more with the knowledge base appropriate to upper secondary and tertiary education, and includes elements not necessarily covered in citizenship courses:

- Roots of war/culture of peace
- International humanitarian and human rights law and institutions
- Prevention, resolution and transformation of violent conflict
- Disarmament and human security. (Reardon and Cabezudo, 2002)

⁸⁷ From Carolyne Ashton's evaluation of Global Education in Albania (Ashton, 2000).



Deutsche Gesellschaft für
Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5
65760 Eschborn, Germany
T +49 6196 79-0
F +49 6196 79-1115
I www.gtz.de

